

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS
AMERICA, INC., and APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMART MOBILE TECHNOLOGIES LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2022-01249
Patent 9,019,946 B1

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	MODIFICATION OF YEGOSHIN BASED ON BILLSTRÖM’S IP ADDRESS FOR IP-BASED CELLULAR COMMUNICATION WOULD HAVE BEEN OBVIOUS (CLAIMS 14-16).....	1
	A. Modification of Yegoshin Based on Billström’s General Teachings of IP-Based Cellular Communication Would Have Been Within a POSITA’s Capabilities	3
III.	YEGOSHIN-BASED COMBINATIONS RENDER OBVIOUS SIMULTANEOUS USE OF MULTIPLE NETWORK PATHS (CLAIMS 14-21 AND 26).....	5
	A. The Claims Require Simultaneous Use, Not Simultaneous Data Transfer	5
	B. Patent Owner’s Distinction Between “Network” Versus “Communication” Path is Arbitrary and Unsupported.....	7
	C. When a Device Has Multiple, Independent Network Paths, it is Obvious to Use Them Simultaneously	9
IV.	YEGOSHIN-JOHNSTON-BILLSTRÖM-BERNARD-PREISS RENDERS OBVIOUS TWO “NETWORK PATHS” TO THE SAME “REMOTE SERVER” “IN RESPONSE TO A CHANGE IN THE SIGNAL STRENGTH AND/OR CONNECTIVITY” (CLAIMS 27-30).....	10
	A. Yegoshin Discloses or Renders Obvious a “Remote Server”	10
	B. Patent Owner’s Understanding of Petitioner’s Proposed Combination is Wrong	12
	C. Yegoshin and Bernard Render Obvious “In Response To A Change In The Signal Strength And/Or Connectivity”	13
V.	THE YEGOSHIN-BERNARD COMBINATION RENDERS OBVIOUS “COMBIN[ING] THE DATA PATHS INTO A SINGLE TRANSMISSION INTERFACE TO ONE OR MORE APPLICATIONS” (CLAIMS 6-10, 17-21, AND 26)	14
VI.	YEGOSHIN-BASED COMBINATIONS RENDER OBVIOUS THE “MULTIPLEXED” LIMITATIONS (CLAIMS 1-13).....	18
	A. The ’946 Patent Requires No More Than A Known Use of The Term “Multiplexed/Multiplexes”	18
	1. The Petition Clarified The Term “Multiplex”	18

2.	Parties’ District Court Constructions Are Met.....	19
3.	The Intrinsic Record Supports Petitioner’s Understanding of “Multiplex”	20
B.	Yegoshin, Alone or As Modified, Renders The “Multiplex” Limitations Obvious	21
1.	Yegoshin Teaches Both Simultaneous and Selective Cellular and WLAN Connections	21
2.	The Yegoshin-Bernard Combination Renders Obvious “Multiplexed Signals”	22
3.	Patent Owner’s Arguments Do Not Impact Petitioner’s Prior Art Analysis	25
4.	Sufficient Motivations Existed To Modify Yegoshin-Johnston- Billström Based on Bernard To Satisfy The “Multiplex” Limitations.....	27
VII.	GROUND 1B RENDERS OBVIOUS CLAIMS 2, 5, AND 10	30
A.	Claims 2 and 5	30
B.	Claim 10.....	30
VIII.	CONCLUSION.....	31

EXHIBIT LIST

- EX-1001 U.S. Patent No. 9,019,946 to Raman K Rao, et al. (“the ’946 patent”)
- EX-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’946 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- EX-1003 Declaration of Dr. Michael Allen Jensen
- EX-1004 U.S. Patent No. 6,711,146 to Leonid A. Yegoshin (“Yegoshin”)
- EX-1005 U.S. Patent No. 5,784,032 to Ronald H. Johnston, et al. (“Johnston”)
- EX-1006 U.S. Patent No. 5,590,133 to Lars Billström, et al. (“Billström”)
- EX-1007 U.S. Patent No. 5,497,339 to Marc A. Bernard (“Bernard”)
- EX-1008 International Patent Publication No. WO 98/27748 (“WO748”)
- EX-1009 U.S. Patent No. 5,854,985 to Joseph B. Sainton, et al. (“Sainton”)
- EX-1010 U.S. Patent No. 6,031,503 to Joseph A. Preiss, II, et al. (“Preiss”)
- EX-1011 Larry L. Peterson and Bruce S. Davie, Computer Networks: A Systems Approach, Morgan Kaufmann Publishers, Inc., San Francisco, CA, 1996
- EX-1012 Andrew S. Tanenbaum, Computer Networks, Third Edition, Prentice Hall PTR, Upper Saddle River, NJ, 1996
- EX-1013 Merilee Ford, H. Kim Lew, Steve Spanier, and Tim Stevenson, Internetworking Technologies Handbook, New Riders Publishing, Indianapolis, IN, 1997
- EX-1014 William Stallings, Data and Computer Communications, 5th Edition, Prentice Hall, Upper Saddle River, NJ, 1996

- EX-1015 Dictionary Definition of “time division multiplex” (Newton’s Telecom Dictionary, 1998)
- EX-1016 U.S. Patent No. 6,115,615 to Takeshi Ota, et al.
- EX-1017 U.S. Patent No. 6,366,622 Stephen Joseph Brown
- EX-1018 U.S. Patent No. 6,560,443 to Ari Vaisanen, et al.
- EX-1019 U.S. Patent No. 5,680,633 to Steven E. Koenck, et al.
- EX-1020 U.S. Patent No. 6,047,322 to Aseem Vaid, et al.
- EX-1021 Excerpts from Theodore S. Rappaport, Wireless Communications Principles & Practice, Prentice Hall, 1996
- EX-1022 R. G. Vaughan, et al., Antenna diversity in mobile communications, in IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology, vol. 36, no. 4, pp. 149-172, Nov. 1987
- EX-1023 S. M. Alamouti, A simple transmit diversity technique for wireless communications, in IEEE Journal on Selected Areas in Communications, vol. 16, no. 8, pp. 1451-1458, Oct. 1998
- EX-1024 Excerpts from Douglas E. Comer, Internetworking with TCP/IP Volume One, Third Edition, 1995
- EX-1025 U.S. Patent No. 5,768,691 to Jorma Matero, et al.
- EX-1026 U.S. Patent No. 5,960,344 to Ronald L. Mahany
- EX-1027 European Patent Application 0 660 626 A2 to John Daniel Byrne
- EX-1028 Excerpts from William C. Jakes, Microwave Mobile Communications, IEEE Press, 1974
- EX-1029 [RESERVED]
- EX-1030 Yi-Bing Lin, Cellular digital packet data, in IEEE Potentials, vol. 16, no. 3, pp. 11-13, Aug.-Sept. 1997

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.