

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., and APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMART MOBILE TECHNOLOGIES, LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2022-01248 (Patent 8,842,653 B1)
IPR2022-01249 (Patent 9,019,946 B1)

Record of Oral Hearing
Held: October 24, 2023

Before HYUN J. JUNG, GARTH D. BAER, and AARON W. MOORE,
Administrative Patent Judges.

IPR2022-01248 (Patent 8,842,653 B1)
IPR2022-01249 (Patent 9,019,946 B1)

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

W. KARL RENNER, ESQ.
JEREMY J. MONALDO, ESQ.
SANGI PARK, ESQ.
Fish & Richardson P.C.
1000 Maine Avenue SW
Washington, D.C. 20024
(202) 626-6447

ANDREW S. EHMKE, ESQ.
Haynes and Boone, LLP
2801 N. Harwood Street
Suite 2300
Dallas, TX 75201
(214) 651-5116

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

KENNETH WEATHERWAX, ESQ.
NATHAN LOWENSTEIN, ESQ.
PARHAM HENDIFAR, ESQ.
COLETTE WOO., ESQ.
Lowenstein & Weatherwax LLP
1016 Pico Boulevard
Santa Monica, California 90405
(310) 307-4503

IPR2022-01248 (Patent 8,842,653 B1)
IPR2022-01249 (Patent 9,019,946 B1)

PHILIP J. GRAVES, ESQ.
GREER N. SHAW, ESQ.
Graves & Shaw LLP
365 S. Grand Avenue, Suite 2450
Los Angeles, CA 90071
(213) 204-5101

REX HWANG, ESQ.
Skiermont Derby LLP
633 West Fifth Street, Suite 5800
Los Angeles, California 90071
(213) 788-4500

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, October 24, 2023, commencing at 1:06 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

IPR2022-01248 (Patent 8,842,653 B1)
IPR2022-01249 (Patent 9,019,946 B1)

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - - - -

JUDGE JUNG: This is the oral arguments for IPR2022-01248 IPR2022-01249. In the 1248 proceeding, Petitioner Apple and Samsung challenge claims 1 through 21, and 23 through 30 of U.S. Patent number 8,842,653 or the '653 patent. In the 1249 proceeding, Petitioner challenges claims 1 through 21 and 26 through 30 of U.S. Patent Number 9,019,946 or the '946 patent. Both the '653 and the '946 Patents are owned by Smart Mobile Technologies, LLC. Beginning with the Petitioner's counsel, followed by Patent Owner's counsel, please state your names for the record.

MR. MONALDO: Thank you, Your Honor, this is Jeremy Monaldo. I'm arguing on behalf of Petitioner Samsung. I'm joined by Lead Counsel Karl Renner, in the conference room here, as well as my colleague Sangi Park, attending remotely. Also joining the hearing is Andy Ehmke, on behalf of Apple. And we have Phillip Lee from Samsung attending on the public line.

JUDGE JUNG: Thank you, Mr. Monaldo.

MR. HENDIFAR: Yes, Good Your Honor. Parham Hendifar. With me, my colleague Collette Woo. And we'll be arguing portions of the 1248 argument for Patent Owner would be my I will be arguing a portion of the IPR 1248. With me in the room is counsel Nathan Lowenstein, and we have also on the line Lead Counsel Kenneth Weatherwax.

JUDGE JUNG: Thank you, Mr. Hendifar. And counsel for 1249?

MR. GRAVES: Good morning, or good afternoon, Your Honor. Phillip Graves for the Patent Owner. And with me are my colleagues Greer Shaw and Rex Hwang. As well.

IPR2022-01248 (Patent 8,842,653 B1)

IPR2022-01249 (Patent 9,019,946 B1)

1 JUDGE JUNG: Thank you Mr. Graves. Same reminders as before, if
2 you encounter any technical difficulties, please let us know immediately,
3 even if you have to interrupt. If you're not speaking, please mute yourself.
4 Please identify yourself each time you speak, so we can make the transcript
5 clear. And please refer to demonstrative, papers, and exhibits by slide or
6 page number.

7 Lastly the panel is aware there are objections to the Petitioner's slides
8 80, 86 and 95 in the 1248 proceeding. And to, Patent Owner's slides 19, 22,
9 23, 27, 28, 51, 153 and 155. And in 1249, there are objections to Patent
10 Owner's slides 100 and 101, and Petitioner's slides 80, 86 and 95.

11 Petitioner has 120 minutes of total argument time, and Patent Owner
12 has 2 hours plus 15 minutes for the LEAP practitioner.

13 Both sides may reserve time for rebuttal. I'll track time, and we will
14 likely take a break before rebuttal arguments are heard.

15 All that said, Mr. Monaldo, you may proceed when you're ready.

16 Mr. Monaldo, you're still muted.

17 MR. MONALDO: Apologies, Your Honor. I just have a
18 housekeeping item to start off. I just want to make sure I clearly understand
19 how the hearing's going to progress with the rebuttal argument, given the
20 multiple counsel on the Patent Owner's side. I'm assuming I have to present
21 all of my arguments for both proceedings in the first stanza. The counsel
22 will take their turn, but I'm not sure if there will be alternating rebuttal
23 periods. If I rebut one of their counsel arguments, or how do you envision
24 this going?

25 JUDGE JUNG: No, I imagine that you will present both arguments
26 for 1248, 1249. Patent owner will then present its responsive arguments for

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.