

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
MARSHALL DIVISION

Bright Data Ltd.,

Plaintiff,

v.

Teso LT, UAB, Oxysales, UAB, and
Metacluster LT, UAB,

Defendants.

Civil Action No.
2:19-cv-00395-JRG

**DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY AND
PERMANENT INJUNCTION AGAINST INFRINGEMENT**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
INTRODUCTION	1
ARGUMENT	1
I. Bright Data’s Motion Is Premature.....	1
II. This Court Should Deny Bright Data’s Request for a Preliminary Injunction	2
III. This Court Should Deny Bright Data’s Request for a Permanent Injunction.....	3
A. Bright Data Has Failed to Prove That It Has Suffered an Irreparable Harm.....	4
1. Bright Data’s Two-Year Delay in Moving for Injunctive Relief Defeats Any Claim That It Has Suffered Irreparable Harm	4
2. Bright Data Cannot Establish a Causal Nexus Between Oxylabs’ Alleged Infringement and Any Alleged Irreparable Harm.....	5
3. Bright Data’s Willingness to License Its Patents Refutes Irreparable Harm.....	9
4. Bright Data’s Other Arguments on Irreparable Harm Fail	10
B. Monetary Damages Can Adequately Compensate for Any Alleged Injury.....	11
C. The Balance of Hardships/Equities Between the Parties Must Be Weighed Against the Weakness of the Jury’s Verdict.....	14
IV. Objections to Bright Data’s Proposed Order	14
CONCLUSION.....	15
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	17

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES	PAGE(S)
<i>ActiveVideo Networks, Inc. v. Verizon Communc'ns, Inc.</i> , 694 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	4, 9, 12
<i>Ameritox, Ltd. v. Millennium Health, LLC</i> , 2015 WL 3825499 (W.D. Wisc. June 19, 2015)	5
<i>Apple, Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.</i> , 678 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	3, 4
<i>Apple Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.</i> , 809 F.3d 633 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	5, 14
<i>Belden Techs., Inc. v. Superior Essex Commc'ns, LP</i> , 802 F. Supp. 2d 555 (D. Del. 2011)	14
<i>BuzzBallz, LLC v. JEM Beverage Co.</i> , 2015 WL 3948757 (N.D. Tex. June 26, 2015)	3
<i>Cave Consulting Group, LLC v. OptumInsight, Inc.</i> , 2016 WL 4658979 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 7, 2016)	10, 12
<i>Douglas Dynamics, LLC v. Buyers Prods. Co.</i> , 2011 WL 13196006 (W.D. Wisc. Feb. 28, 2011).....	13
<i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange, L.L.C.</i> , 547 U.S. 388 (2006).....	1
<i>Exxon Chem. Patents, Inc. v. Lubrizol Corp.</i> , 64 F.3d 1553 (Fed. Cir. 1995).....	2
<i>Genband US LLC v. Metaswitch Networks Ltd.</i> , 211 F. Supp. 3d 858 (E.D. Tex. 2016), <i>vacated on other grounds</i> , 861 F.3d 1378 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	4, 5
<i>Genband US LLC v. Metaswitch Networks Corp.</i> , 861 F.3d 1378 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	5, 6
<i>Genband US LLC v. Metaswitch Networks Corp.</i> , 2018 WL 11357619 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 22, 2018)	6, 9
<i>Golden Hour Data Sys., Inc. v. emsCharts, Inc.</i> , 2014 WL 8708239 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 31, 2014)	15

Gonannies, Inc. v. Goupair.com, Inc.,
464 F. Supp. 2d 603 (N.D. Tex. 2006)3

H.D. Vest, Inc. v. H.D. Vest Mgmt. & Servs., LLC,
2009 WL 1766095 (N.D. Tex. June 23, 2009)3

High Tech Med. Instrumentation, Inc. v. New Image Indus., Inc.,
49 F.3d 1551 (Fed. Cir. 1995).....3

Humanscale Corp. v. CompX Int’l Inc.,
2010 WL 1779963 (E.D. Va. Apr. 29, 2010)13

IMX, Inc. v. Lendingtree, LLC,
2007 WL 1232184 (D. Del. Apr. 25, 2007).....13

Innovation Ventures, LLC v. Ultimate Lifestyles, LLC,
2009 WL 1490588 (E.D. Tex. May 27, 2009)3

Int’l Rectifier Corp. v. IXYS Corp.,
383 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2004)15

Johnson & Johnson Vision Care, Inc. v. CIBA Vision Corp.,
712 F. Supp. 2d 1285 (M.D. Fla. 2010).....10

Joseph Paul Corp. v. Trademark Custom Homes, Inc.,
2016 WL 4944370 (N.D. Tex. Sept. 16, 2016).....3

MercExchange, L.L.C. v. eBay, Inc.,
500 F. Supp. 2d 573 (E.D. Va. 2007)5

Millennium Rests. Grp., Inc. v. City of Dallas,
181 F. 211 F, Supp. 2d 659 (N.D. Tex. 2001)13

Monsanto Co. v. Geertson Seed Farms,
561 U.S. 13 (2010).....1

Nichia Corp. v. Everlight Am., Inc.,
855 F.3d 1328 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....3, 4, 9

Novartis Pharms. Corp. v. Teva Pharms. USA, Inc.,
2007 WL 2669338 (D.N.J. Sept. 6, 2007), *aff’d*, 280 Fed. Appx. 996
(Fed. Cir. 2008) (per curiam)12

Nutrition 21 v. United States,
930 F.2d 867 (Fed. Cir. 1991).....12

SAS Inst., Inc. v. World Programming Ltd.,
2016 WL 3475281 (E.D.N.C. June 17, 2016)10

SCA Hygiene Prods. Aktiebolag v. First Quality Baby Prods., LLC,
807 F.3d 1311 (Fed. Cir. 2015) (en banc), vacated in part on other
grounds, 137 S. Ct. 954 (2017).....5

Scott v. Schedler,
826 F.3d 207 (5th Cir. 2016)15

Server Tech., Inc. v. Am. Power Conversion Corp.,
2015 WL 1505654 (D. Nev. Mar. 31, 2015), rev'd on other grounds,
657 Fed. Appx. 1030 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....5, 13

Smith & Nephew, Inc. v. Interlace Med., Inc.,
955 F. Supp. 2d 69 (D. Mass. 2013).....14

Sorkin's Rx Ltd v. Express Scripts Inc.,
2015 WL 249488 (E.D. Mo. Jan. 20, 2015)12

Sun Water Sys., Inc. v. Vitasalus, Inc.,
2007 WL 820280 (N.D. Tex. Mar. 8, 2007).....13

Tex. Advanced Optoelectronic Sols., Inc. v. Renesas Elecs. Am. Inc.,
2019 WL 4805916 (E.D. Tex. Oct. 1, 2019)6

Wireless Agents, L.L.C. v. T Mobile USA, Inc.,
2006 WL 1540587 (N.D. Tex. June 6, 2006)3

RULES

FED. R. CIV. P. 62(d)15

FED. R. CIV. P. 65(d)(1)14

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.