

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ECOBEE TECHNOLOGIES, ULC,
Petitioner

v.

ECOFACITOR, INC.,
Patent Owner

IPR2022-00983
Patent No. 8,596,550

**DECLARATION OF JOHN A. PALMER, Ph.D.
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 1.68**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	BACKGROUND	2
II.	QUALIFICATIONS	2
III.	BACKGROUND OF THE ‘550 PATENT.....	7
IV.	LEGAL PRINCIPLES	9
V.	LEVEL OF A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART (POSITA)	14
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION PRINCIPLES	17
VII.	GENERAL COMMENTS ON THE AUSLANDER REPORT .	18
VIII.	REBUTTAL TO ALLEGATIONS REGARDING OBVIOUSNESS.....	27
	A. Introduction to Ehlers ‘330	27
	B. Introduction to Wruck.....	28
	C. Introduction to Harter.....	29
IX.	GROUND 1:	30
	A. The Combination of Ehlers ‘330 and Wruck Does Not Render Claims 1-16 Unpatentable.....	30
	1. No Motivation to Combine Ehlers ‘330 and Wruck.....	30
	2. Claim Element [1c] – “using the stored data to predict a rate of change of temperatures inside the structure in response to at least changes in outside temperatures;”	31

3.	Claim element [1d] “calculating with one or more computer processors, scheduled programming of the thermostatic controller for one or more times based on the predicted rate of change, the scheduled programming comprising at least a first automated setpoint at a first time;”	41
4.	Claim element [1e] - “generating with one or more computer processors, a difference value based on comparing an actual setpoint at the first time for said thermostatic controller to the first automated setpoint for said thermostatic controller; detecting a manual change to the first automated setpoint by determining whether said actual setpoint and said first automated setpoint are the same or different based on said difference value; and”	45
5.	Dependent Claims 2-8.....	52
6.	Independent Claim 9	52
7.	Claim element [9c].....	52
8.	Claim element [9d].....	53
9.	Claim element [9e].....	53
10.	Dependent Claims 10-16.....	54
X.	GROUND 2:	54
A.	The Combination of Ehlers ‘330, Wruck, and Harter Does Not Render Claims 9-16 Unpatentable	54
1.	Independent Claim 9	54
2.	Claim element [9c].....	55
3.	Claim element [9d].....	55

Case Nos. IPR2021-00983
U.S. Patent No. 8,596,550

4.	Claim element [9e].....	56
5.	Dependent Claims 10-16.....	57
XI.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS	57
XII.	DECLARATION	59

Exhibits

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	<i>Ecobee, Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 1-21-cv-00323 (D. Del. March 2, 2012), Dkt. 20 (Ecobee’s Motion to Dismiss)
2002	<i>Ecobee, Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 1-21-cv-00323 (D. Del. March 2, 2012), Dkt. 1 (Complaint)
2003	<i>Ecobee, Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 1-21-cv-00323 (D. Del. March 2, 2012), Dkt. 18 (ecobee Opposition to Motion to Stay)
2004	Ecobee’s Disclosure of Initial Invalidity Contentions, March 17, 2022 in <i>Ecobee, Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 1-21-cv-00323
2005	<i>Ecobee, Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 1-21-cv-00323 (D. Del. March 2, 2012), Dkt. 26 (Order Denying EcoFactor’s Motion to Stay)
2006	Expert Declaration of John A. Palmer
2007	Curriculum Vitae of John A. Palmer
2008	February 2, 2023, Deposition Transcripts of Dr. David Auslander, IPR2022-00983.
2009	<i>Smart Thermostat Systems, Smart HVAC Systems, Smart HVAC Control Systems, and Components Thereof</i> , U.S. Int’l Trade Comm’n, 337-TA-1258 1258 Investigation, Order No. 18 - Construing the Terms of the Asserted Claims, at 1
2010	U.S. Pat. No. 7,130,719 (“Ehlers ’719”)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.