## UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

\_\_\_\_

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

CHANEL, INC., Petitioner,

v.

MOLO DESIGN, LTD., Patent Owner

IPR2022-00543 (Patent 7,866,366 B2)

IPR2022-00544 (Patent 8,561,666 B2)

IPR2022-00545 (Patent 9,689,161 B2)

IPR2022-00546 (Patent 9,797,134 B2)

Record of Oral Hearing Held: June 8, 2023

Before KEN B. BARRETT, CARL M. DeFRANCO, and RICHARD H. MARSCHALL, *Administrative Patent Judges*.



#### **APPEARANCES:**

## ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

JEFF GODFREY, ESQUIRE SHANNON BJORKLUND, ESQUIRE GINA CORNELIO, ESQUIRE Dorsey & Whitney LLP

## ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

MIKE CHIBIB, ESQUIRE Bracewell LLP

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on June 8, 2023, commencing at 9:41 a.m., via video teleconference.



1	PROCEEDINGS
2	
3	JUDGE MARSCHALL: Good afternoon, everyone. This is the
4	hearing in IPR 2022-00543, -00544, -00545, and -00546, between Petitioner
5	Chanel, Inc., and Patent Owner Molo Design, Ltd. We're reviewing four of
6	Molo Design's patents in these proceedings. I'm Judge Marschall. With me
7	via video are Judges Barrett and DeFranco. Let's start with the parties'
8	appearances, please, and let's start with Petitioner.
9	MR. GODFREY: Good afternoon, Your Honors. Jeff Godfrey
10	with Dorsey & Whitney, representing Petitioner Chanel, Inc. With me today
11	are my colleagues Shannon Bjorklund and Gina Cornelio.
12	JUDGE MARSCHALL: Thank you. And for Patent Owner?
13	MR. CHIBIB: Good afternoon, Your Honors. Mike Chibib of
14	Bracewell on behalf of Patent Owner Molo Design.
15	JUDGE MARSCHALL: And is anybody else with you today?
16	MR. CHIBIB: Not that I'm aware of. I think the client is on the
17	public line. But other than that, I'm not aware of anyone.
18	JUDGE MARSCHALL: All right. Thank you and welcome. As
19	you know from our hearing order, each party will have a total of 60 minutes
20	of total time to present arguments, and a portion of that time may be
21	reserved for rebuttal. This hearing is taking place via videoconference. And
22	during your presentation, please refer to exhibit or slide numbers to aid us in
23	following along and to make the transcript clearer. Please do not interrupt



- 1 the other party's presentation. You may object only during your argument
- 2 time or following the rebuttal. Please be aware that we have provided a
- 3 public access line for the public to watch this hearing. Petitioner, you will
- 4 start. And before you get going, would you like to reserve any time for
- 5 rebuttal?
- 6 MR. GODFREY: Yes, Your Honor. We'd like to reserve 20
- 7 minutes for rebuttal.
- 8 JUDGE MARSCHALL: Okay. I will endeavor to give you a
- 9 warning at, you know, the 5-to-10-minute mark, but I encourage you to keep
- 10 time on your end so that people in the room can give you a warning as well.
- With that, you can begin when ready. And Patent Owner, just so you know,
- 12 you can step down as you're about to do and mute your mic. That would be
- 13 great. Thank you.
- MR. CHIBIB: Thank you, Your Honor.
- MR. GODFREY: Thank you, Your Honor. For the argument
- today, I'm going to start by addressing the '366 patent. My colleague, Ms.
- Bjorklund, will then address the other three patents. And then, I will address
- 18 objective indicia of non-obviousness for all of the patents.
- 19 I'm turning to Slide 2 now, starting with the '366 patent. There are
- 20 three grounds of unpatentability, all obviousness. And I will focus on
- 21 Ground 1, our strongest ground. Time permitting, I will then address
- 22 Ground 2, and we will rely on our briefing for Ground 3.
- Turning to Slide 3. In this IPR, the key issues concern the prior art
- 24 disclosure of Elements B and C of Independent Claim 1, supports that are



- self-supporting and foldable into a tubular configuration, and fasteners.
- 2 Neither party proposed a construction for any claim term, and there are no
- 3 disputes unique to the dependent claims in this patent.
- 4 Turning to Slide 4. For Ground 1, the primary reference is
- 5 SoftHousing I, a webpage describing MacAllen and Forsythe's submission to
- 6 the 2003 Design Beyond East and West competition, or DBEW. The web
- 7 page includes a written description of SoftHousing plus the images
- 8 MacAllen and Forsythe submitted to the competition. Molo admits the web
- 9 page is 102(b) prior art, but disputes whether one could view large images of
- 10 SoftHousing on the web page. There is extensive evidence showing the
- large images of SoftHousing were accessible by clicking on the thumbnail
- images on the top of the web page, as depicted in this example on Slide 4.
- And the most direct evidence is from Internet Archive. When you
- 14 go to the archived copy of the prior art web page, you can click on the first
- 15 thumbnail image, and it opens a pop-out window with a larger version of the
- image. The URL for the pop out window even includes the text big\_img,
- short for big image. After opening the big image, you can right click, save
- image as, and download a .jpg copy of the image file. And that's how we
- obtained the large image shown here on the right of Slide 4.
- These same thumbnails and corresponding large images were also
- 21 published on the Korean and Chinese language versions of the DBEW
- website, and those large images are shown in Slides 5 through 8. Internet
- 23 Archive did not capture these other large images on the English version of
- the site, but the filenames are the same and Ms. Forsythe confirmed that



# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

# **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

# **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

# **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

