

Case IPR2022-00545  
U.S. Patent No. 9,689,161

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

CHANEL, INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

MOLO DESIGN, LTD.,

Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2022-00545  
U.S. Patent 9,689,161

---

**PATENT OWNER MOLO DESIGN LTD.'S  
SURREPLY**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION .....6

II. GROUNDS III AND IV: SOFTWALL DOES NOT TEACH OR SUGGEST AN “EXTENSIBLE WALL” THAT FORMS “AT LEAST A SUBSTANTIALLY STRAIGHT FREESTANDING WALL CONFIGURATION, WHILST MAINTAINING ITS VERTICAL EXTENT” .....8

III. GROUNDS I and II: THE SOFTHOUSING REFERENCES DO NOT RENDER OBVIOUS AN “EXTENSIBLE WALL” THAT FORMS “AT LEAST A SUBSTANTIALLY STRAIGHT FREESTANDING WALL CONFIGURATION, WHILST MAINTAINING ITS VERTICAL EXTENT” .....10

A. Chanel misrepresents the testimony of Mr. MacAllen and Ms. Forsythe .....10

B. The other images in SoftHousing I-II do not depict “freestanding” structures .....16

C. Folding the “opposite ends” of the SoftHousing structures into a “tubular configuration” is not an obviousness modification.....19

IV. GROUND V: A POSITA WOULD NOT BE MOTIVATED TO COMBINE MACALLEN 2008 WITH STRATTON, FISCHER, AND REISENTHHEL, TOLNA, AND ENDUROFENCE .....22

V. CHANEL FAILS TO REBUT MOLO’S OBJECTIVE EVIDENCE OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....24

A. Industry Praise .....27

B. Commercial Success.....27

C. Copying .....30

VI. CONCLUSION.....32

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>Belden Inc. v. Berk-Tek LLC</i> , 805 F.3d 1064 (Fed. Cir. 2015) .....	31
<i>Fox Factory, Inc. v. SRAM, LLC</i> , 944 F.3d 1161 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	24, 25
<i>Intelligent Bio-Sys., Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Ltd.</i> , 821 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016) .....	21
<i>Ex parte Jellá</i> , 90 U.S.P.Q. 2d 1009 (BPAI 2008) .....	30
<i>Ex Parte Maeda</i> , No. APPEAL 2010-009814, 2012 WL 5294326 (B.P.A.I. Oct. 23, 2012) .....	20
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) .....	10
<i>W.L. Gore &amp; Associates, Inc. v. Garlock, Inc.</i> , 721 F.2d 1540 (Fed. Cir. 1983), <i>cert. denied</i> , 469 U.S. 851 (1984) .....	11
<i>Wasica Fin. GmbH v. Cont'l Auto. Sys., Inc.</i> , 853 F.3d 1272 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	21
<i>WBIP, LLC v. Kohler Co.</i> , 829 F.3d 1317 (Fed. Cir. 2016) .....	24

**EXHIBIT LIST**

Exhibit No.	Description of Exhibit Document
2001	Joint Disputed Claim Terms Chart, filed in <i>Molo Design Ltd. v. Chanel, Inc.</i> , No 21-cv-1578 (S.D.N.Y.), dated September 24, 2021 (Dkt. No. 38)
2002	Defendant Chanel, Inc.'s Claim Construction Brief, filed in <i>Molo Design Ltd. v. Chanel, Inc.</i> , No 21-cv-1578 (S.D.N.Y.), dated November 30, 2021 (Dkt. No. 43)
2003	Plaintiff Molo Design Ltd.'s Notice Regarding Chanel's Supplement Claim Construction Positions, filed in <i>Molo Design Ltd. v. Chanel, Inc.</i> , No 21-cv-1578 (S.D.N.Y.), dated February 18, 2022 (Dkt. No. 51)
2004	Chanel's Response to Molo's Supplemental Claim Construction Statement, filed in <i>Molo Design Ltd. v. Chanel, Inc.</i> , No 21-cv-1578 (S.D.N.Y.), dated February 25, 2022 (Dkt. No. 54)
2005	Pedersen, Martin C, "The Soft House," Metropolis Magazine (Jul. 2004)
2006	Affidavit of Stephanie Forsythe
2007	Affidavit of Todd MacAllen
2008	US Patent No. 7,866,366
2009	Curriculum Vitae of Alan Ball
2010	Declaration of Alan Ball in support of Patent Owner's Response
2011	Transcript of deposition of Lance Rake, taken December 20, 2022
2012	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)
2013	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)
2014	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)
2015	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)

2016	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)
2017	Molo softwall Product Webpage (2005)
2018	Letter from Museum of Modern Art to Stephanie Forsyth (2005)
2019	Moma.org webpage (2005)
2020	The Index Project webpage (2005)
2021	Email from Evelyn Lacson To Stephanie Forsyth (2023)
2022	Years of Emerging Voices - The Architectural Laugue of New York - Princeton Architectural Press (2021)
2023	MoMA PS1 Young Architects Program (YAP) Competition (2005)
2024	Azure Magazine - A-Z Awards (2011)
2025	Best of NeoCon - Gold Award Architectural products for softwall + softblock modular system (2014)
2026	AIT Award - Retail Trend for softwall (2014)
2027	ADEX Awards Certificate - Molo Design-Gold-softwall + softblock modular system (2015)
2028	FRAME Magazine Award at Orgatec Germany (2018)
2029	Affidavit of Leo Lubke (2021)
2030	Molo Clients – See Brands we Worth (Google Cache of <a href="https://molodesign.com/clients/">https://molodesign.com/clients/</a> )
2031	MUSEUMS & ART GALLERIES that have acquired molo products
2032	Complaint filed in <i>Molo Design Ltd. v. Chanel, Inc.</i> , No 21-cv-1578 (S.D.N.Y.), dated February 22, 2021 (Dkt. No. 1 2031)
2033	Declaration of Conor M. Civins
2034	Email from Tran Vinh to molostore.com
2035	Email from Victoria Megans to Tran Vinh
2036	Email from Tran Vihn to Victoria Megans
2037	Email from Victoria Megans to Tran Vinh

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.