

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner

v.

TELEFONAKTIEBOLAGET LM ERICSSON
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2022-00464
Patent No. 10,193,600

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Summary of Argument.....	1
B. Summary of the '600 Patent's Disclosure of "Rank-Agnostic" Signaling.....	6
C. Summary of the Prosecution History of the '600 Patent	8
1. The Examiner Rejects the Claims over Jing and Novlan	9
2. Patent Applicants Amend the Claims on July 11, 2018	10
D. Overview of the Cited Prior Art.....	11
1. Novlan (Ex. 1005) Teaches Rank-Specific Codebook Subset Restriction (CSR) Signaling.....	11
2. TS 36.213 v12.3.0 (Ex. 1006) Also Teaches Rank- Specific CSR Signaling.....	15
II. TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND.....	16
A. Systems with multiple antennas	16
B. Precoding.....	23
C. Rank.....	25
D. Codebooks, Codebook Subset Restriction (CSR), and Bitmaps.....	27
III. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	29
IV. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	29
V. THE PETITION DOES NOT ESTABLISH BY A PREPONDERANCE OF THE EVIDENCE THAT ANY OF THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE	30

A. The Petition Fails to Establish that Novlan Discloses “codebook subset restriction signaling that, for each of one or more groups of precoders, jointly restricts the precoders in the group by restricting a certain component that the precoders have in common.”30

1. Novlan’s “General Subset Restriction” Methods Do Not Teach Jointly Restrict the Precoders in the Group by Restricting a Certain Component that the Precoders Have in Common.....31

2. Novlan’s “Sampling Based Subset Restriction” Methods Do Not Teach to Jointly Restrict Using *vm*.....34

B. The Petition Fails to Establish that Novlan Discloses “wherein the codebook subset restriction signaling is rank-agnostic signaling that jointly restricts the precoders in a group without regard to the precoders’ transmission rank.”41

1. Novlan’s Elevation-Based Restriction in [0054] does Not Disclose How to Signal a Codebook Subset Restriction.41

2. Novlan Does Not Teach Rank-Agnostic Signaling in Any Embodiment.50

3. The Petition’s Arguments Regarding Novlan are Flawed.52

C. Petitioner’s Theory That *vm* is the Certain Component That the Precoders Have in Common And that Restricts Regardless of Rank Is Severely Flawed.....64

VI. CONCLUSION.....70

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Federal Cases

Abiomed, Inc. v. Maquet Cardiovascular, LLC,
IPR2017-01204, -01205.....65

In re Enhanced Security Research, LLC,
739 F.3d 1347 (Fed. Cir. 2014)4, 5, 35

In re Fine,
837 F.2d 1071, 5 U.S.P.Q.2d 1596 (Fed. Cir. 1988).....5

Intelligent Bio-Sys., Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Ltd.,
821 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016)69, 70

KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.,
127 S. Ct. 1727 (2007).....5, 30, 65, 70

Nidec Motor Corp. v. Zhongshan Broad Ocean Motor Co.,
868 F.3d 1013, 1017 (Fed. Cir. 2017)29

Vivid Techs., Inc. v. Am. Sci. & Eng’g, Inc.,
200 F.3d 795 (Fed. Cir. 1999)29

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600 (“the ’600 Patent”)
1002	Certified File History of U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600
1003	Declaration of Dr. Apostolos K. Kakaes for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600
1004	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. Apostolos K. Kakaes
1005	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2014/0016549 (“Novlan”)
1006	3GPP TS 36.213, v12.3.0 (“36.213”)
1007	3GPP TS 36.213, v10.1.0
1008	U.S. Patent No. 8,891,676
1009	Declaration of Friedhelm Rodermund in Support of Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600
1010	U.S. Provisional Patent Application No. 62/103,101 (“the ’600 Patent Provisional”)
1011	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2013/0163687 (“Jing”)
1012	U.S. Provisional Patent Application No. 61/670,936 (the “Novlan Provisional”)
1013	Dahlman <i>et al.</i> , 4G – LTE / LTE-Advanced for Mobile Broadband (Academic Press 2011) (“Dahlman”)
1014	Declaration of James L. Mullins in Support of Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600
1015	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0051091
1016	Sesia, <i>et al.</i> , LTE - The UMTS Long Term Evolution From Theory to Practice (Wiley 2d. ed. 2011) (“Sesia”)
1017	Declaration of Jacob Robert Munford in Support of Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 10,193,600
2001	Declaration Of Dr. Muriel Médard, Sc.D In Support Of Patent Owner’s Preliminary Response (May 22, 2022)
2002	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. Muriel Médard
2003	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Apostolos K. Kakaes (Nov. 11, 2022)
2004	Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Muriel Médard, Sc.D In Support Of Patent Owner’s Response (November 30, 2022)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.