

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.
Petitioner

v.

TELEFONAKTIEBOLAGET LM ERICSSON
Patent Owner

Case IPR2022-00457
U.S. Patent No. 9,509,440

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction.....1

II. The '440 Patent.....5

III. Prosecution History of the '440 Patent.....10

 A. The Patent Office Considered the Primary Reference Cited by Apple During Prosecution11

 B. The Prior Art Cited by Apple is Cumulative to the Art Considered by the Patent Office During Prosecution12

 C. The Examiner Allowed the Challenged Claims in View of Marinier.....16

 D. Lahetkangas Lacks the Very Same Disclosure that Resulted in the Allowance of the Issued Claims.....22

IV. Applied References.....24

 A. Lahetkangas—the primary reference applied in Ground 1—is cumulative to Marinier and does not disclose the claimed invention.25

 B. LTE TS 36.213 version 10.3 Release 10—a secondary reference—likewise fails to disclose the claimed invention.....28

 C. Wang—a secondary reference—fails to remedy the deficiencies of Lahetkangas and LTE TS 36.213.29

V. The Board Should Exercise Its Discretion and Deny Institution Under 35 U.S.C. §325(d).....29

 A. The *Becton, Dickinson* factors weigh heavily in favor of denying institution.....32

 1. Factors (a), (b), and (d) strongly weigh in favor of denying institution.....32

 a) Factor (a) – Lahetkangas was previously presented to and Considered by the Patent Office During Prosecution.33

 b) Factor (b) – Lahetkangas is Cumulative to Marinier.36

 c) Factor (d) – Arguments Made During Prosecution to Distinguish Marinier are Equally Applicable to Lahetkangas.50

2.	Factors (c), (e), and (f) strongly weigh in favor of denying institution.....	50
B.	<i>Advanced Bionics</i> confirms that the Board should deny institution because Lahetkangas was previously presented to the Office and Apple fails to show that the Office erred in its evaluation of that reference.	53
VI.	Claim Construction is Not Needed to Dispose of the Petition	54
VII.	Apple Does Not Establish a Reasonable Likelihood That Lahetkangas, LTE TS 36.213, or Wang—Alone or in the Alleged Obviousness Combinations—Render Challenged Claims 1-32 Unpatentable	54
A.	Ground 1: Apple does not establish a reasonable likelihood that Lahetkangas renders claims 1-7, 9, 11-17, 19, 21, 23, 25, and 27 unpatentable.....	55
1.	Lahetkangas fails to disclose at least Claim Elements [1.7], [11.5], [21.7], [23.7], [25.6], and [27.8].	55
a)	Lahetkangas does not disclose or suggest that “ <i>the first entry for the lowest modulation order in the first MCS table is maintained in the second MCS table as the fallback</i> ”	56
b)	Lahetkangas does not disclose or suggest that “ <i>an entry for the lowest coding rate of the lowest modulation order in the first CQI table is maintained in the second CQI table as the fallback</i> ”	59
2.	Lahetkangas fails to disclose claim elements [11.5], [21.7], [23.6], [25.6], and [27.8] for the same reasons listed above.	62
B.	Ground 2: Apple does not establish a reasonable likelihood that the combination of Lahetkangas LTE TS 36.213 render claims 1-7, 9, 11-17, 19, 21, 23, 25, and 27 unpatentable.....	63
C.	Grounds 3 and 4: Apple does not establish a reasonable likelihood that the combinations of Lahetkangas and Wang or, in the alternative, Lahetkangas, LTE TS 36.213 , and Wang render claims 8 and 18 unpatentable.	63

VIII. Conclusion64

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Advanced Bionics, LLC v. MED-EL Elektromedizinische Geräte GmbH</i> , IPR2019-01469, Paper 6, 7 (PTAB Feb. 13, 2020).....	passim
<i>Becton, Dickinson and Company v. B. Braun Melsungen AG</i> , IPR2017-01586, Paper 8 (PTAB Dec. 15, 2017) (§ III.C.5 designated precedential on August 2, 2019).....	passim
<i>Brooke Grp. Ltd. v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.</i> , 509 U.S. 209 (1993).....	52
<i>Donghee America, Inc. et al. v. Plastic Omnium Advanced Innovation and Research</i> , IPR2017-01605, Paper 4, 50 (P.T.A.B. December 11, 2018).....	52
<i>K/S Himpp v. Hear-Wear Techs., LLC</i> , 751 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	52, 59
<i>Upjohn Co. v. Mova Pharm. Corp.</i> , 225 F.3d 1306 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	52
<i>Vivid Techs., Inc. v. Am. Sci. & Eng'g, Inc.</i> , 200 F.3d 795 (Fed. Cir. 1999)	54
STATUTES	
35 U.S.C. §102(a)(2).....	11
35 U.S.C. § 325(d)	passim
OTHER AUTHORITIES	
M.P.E.P. § 609.05(b).....	36

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.