

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,

Petitioners,

v.

TRAXCELL TECHNOLOGIES, LLC,

Patent Owner.

IPR2022-00073 (Patent No. 10,820,147)

DECLARATION OF ROBERT VAN ESSEN

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS.....	3
III.	SUMMARY OF OPINIONS.....	3
IV.	UNDERSTANDING OF APPLICABLE LAW	4
A.	Priority Date and Prior Art	4
B.	Claim Interpretation.....	6
V.	THE '147 PATENT	8
VI.	SCOPE AND CONTENT OF THE PRIOR ART	9
A.	Moles (Ex. 1005)	9
B.	Sakarya (Ex. 1006)	10
C.	Zellner (Ex. 1008).....	11
D.	Tanibayashi (Ex. 1009).....	12
E.	Khavakh (Ex. 1010).....	13
VII.	CLAIM INTERPRETATION	13
VIII.	OPINIONS REGARDING ASSERTED GROUNDS	14
A.	Petitioner Fails to Establish in Ground I that Challenged Claims 1-3, 5-7, 11-14, and 16-18 are Obvious Over Moles in View of Sakarya and Khavakh ..	14
1.	Claim 1	14
2.	Claims 2-3, and 5-7	31
3.	Claim 11	32
4.	Claims 12-14, and 16-18	32
B.	Petitioner Fails to Establish in Ground II that Challenged Claims 8-9, 19-20, and 22-24 are Obvious Over Moles in View of Sakarya, Khavakh and Zellner	33
1.	Claims 8 and 9	33
2.	Claims 19-20	34

..

3. Claims 22-24	35
C. Petitioner Fails to Establish in Ground III that Challenged Claims 4 and 15 are Obvious Over Moles in View of Sakarya, Khavakh and Tanibayashi	36
1. Claim 4	36
2. Claim 15	38
VII. CONCLUSION	40

...

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Broadcom Corp. v. Emulex Corp.</i> , 732 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	11,44
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co.</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	10, 26
<i>Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs.</i> , 512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008).....	11
<i>Intelligent Bio-Sys., Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Ltd.</i> , 821 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	11
<i>Los Angeles Biomedical Res. Inst. at Harbor-UCLA Med. Ctr. v. Eli Lilly Co.</i> , 849 F.3d 1049 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	11
<i>Pers. Web Techs., LLC v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 848 F.3d 987 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	10
<i>CFMT, Inc. v. Yieldup Intern. Corp.</i> , 349 F.3d 1333, 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2003).....	26

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 103	10
35 U.S.C. § 282(b)	3

Rules

37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b)	3
37 C.F.R. § 42.107	1

I, Robert van Essen, do hereby declare as follows:

I. INTRODUCTION

1. I have been retained as an expert on behalf of Patent Owner Traxcell Technologies LLC (“Patent Owner” or “Traxcell”) in this *inter partes* review (“IPR”) proceeding of U.S. Patent No. 10,820,147 (“the ‘147 Patent”). I understand this proceeding was initiated by Petitioner Apple LLC (“Petitioner” or “Apple”).

2. I have set forth my professional qualifications and relevant experience in Section II of this Declaration, and a copy of my curriculum vitae is available at Attachment A.

3. I have been asked to provide my expert opinions regarding the validity or invalidity of claims 1-24 of the ‘147 Patent.

4. I understand that Petitioner has asserted invalidity based on the following references:

Reference	Exhibit
U.S. Patent No. 6,505,048 (Moles)	1005
International Pub. No. WO 0128270 (Sakarya)	1006
U.S. Patent No. 6,738,808 (Zellner)	1008
U.S. Patent No. 7,010,306 (Tanibayashi)	1009
U.S. Patent No. 6,192,314 (Khavakh)	1010

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.