

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner

v.

LOGANTREE LP,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2022-00037
Patent 6,059,576

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	APPLE’S PETITION COMPLIES WITH THE “PARTICULARITY AND SPECIFICITY” REQUIREMENT	2
II.	ONO-HUTCHINGS COMBINATION (GROUND 1).....	3
	A. Ono-Hutchings renders obvious “a movement sensor” as recited in elements [1a] and [1k] and a “movement measuring device” as recited in element [20a]	3
	1. A POSITA would have been motivated to implement Ono’s device with multidimensional accelerometers/velocity sensors and rotational sensors as suggested by Hutchings	3
	2. Apple has shown by the preponderance of the evidence that Ono-Hutchings teaches the claimed “movement sensor” and “movement measuring device”	6
	B. Ono renders elements [1f], [20f], [30], [41], and [42] obvious	8
	1. Ono teaches “storing first event information related to the detected first user-defined event” (elements [1f], [20f]) and “first event information indicating that the predetermined threshold is met” (claim 41).....	8
	2. Ono teaches storing first event information “along with first time stamp information reflecting a time at which the movement data causing the first user-defined event occurred” (elements [1f], [20f]), storing “date information associated with the first time stamp information” (claim 30), and storing “the first time stamp information in association with said first event information” (claim 42).....	16
	C. Ono-Hutchings renders obvious “interpreting... based on... a real-time clock” (element [20c]).....	22
III.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-AMANO COMBINATION (GROUND 2)	23
	A. Ono-Hutchings-Amano renders obvious “a real-time clock” (element [1h]) and “interpreting... based on... a real-time clock” (element [20c]).	23
IV.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-CONLAN COMBINATION (GROUND 3A).....	24
	A. A POSITA would have been motivated to combine Ono-Hutchings and Conlan.....	24
	B. LoganTree’s arguments regarding Conlan’s disclosure of certain claim elements fail.....	25

V.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-CONLAN-HICKMAN COMBINATION (GROUND 3B)	26
	A. A POSITA would have been motivated to combine Ono-Hutchings-Conlan and Hickman	26
	B. LoganTree’s arguments regarding Hickman’s disclosure of claim 51 fail	26
VI.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-KAUFMAN COMBINATION (GROUND 4)	27
	A. A POSITA would have been motivated to combine Ono-Hutchings and Kaufman	27
	B. LoganTree’s arguments regarding Kaufman’s disclosure of various claim elements fail.....	27
VII.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-AMANO-CONLAN-KAUFMAN COMBINATION (GROUND 5A).....	28
	A. A POSITA would have been motivated to combine Ono-Hutchings with Amano, Conlan, and Kaufman	28
	B. LoganTree’s arguments regarding various claim elements fail	28
VIII.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-AMANO-CONLAN-KAUFMAN-HICKMAN COMBINATION (GROUND 5B)	29
IX.	ONO-HUTCHINGS-CONLAN-KAUFMAN-HICKMAN COMBINATION (GROUND 8B).....	29
X.	GROUNDS 6A, 6B, 7, AND 8A.....	30
XI.	CONCLUSION.....	30

EXHIBITS

APPLE-1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,059,576 to Brann. (“the ’576 Patent”)
APPLE-1002	Prosecution History of the ’576 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
APPLE-1003	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1004	Complaint, <i>Logantree LP, v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 6:21-cv-00397, W.D. Tex., Apr. 23, 2021
APPLE-1005	Stipulation by Petitioner
APPLE-1006	<i>Ex Parte</i> Reexamination Certificate of U.S. Patent No. 6,059,576
APPLE-1007	Excerpts from <i>Ex Parte</i> Reexamination No. 90/013,201 Prosecution History
APPLE-1008	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1009	U.S. Patent No. 5,778,882 (“Raymond”)
APPLE-1010	U.S. Patent No. 5,573,013 (“Conlan”)
APPLE-1011	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1012	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1013	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1014	U.S. Patent No. 5,803,740 (“Gesink”)
APPLE-1015-1023	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1024	Scheduling Order, <i>Logantree LP, v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 6:21-cv-00397, W.D. Tex., Aug. 13, 2021

- APPLE-1025 “2021 Discretionary Denials Have Passed 100, But Are Slowing,” Dani Krass, Law360, July 21, 2021
- APPLE-1026-1028 [RESERVED]
- APPLE-1029 “Leahy And Cornyn Introduce Bipartisan Bill To Support American Innovation And Reduce Litigation”, Sep. 29, 2021, available at: <https://www.leahy.senate.gov/press/leahy-and-cornyn-introduce-bipartisan-bill-to-support-american-innovation-and-reduce-litigation>
- APPLE-1030 Restoring the America Invents Act, S. 2891, 117th Cong. (2021).
- APPLE-1031 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Fitbit Inc.*, 2:15-cv-01575, E.D. Tex., Oct. 2, 2015
- APPLE-1032 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Garmin International, Inc.*, 5:17-cv-00098, W.D. Tex., Feb. 10, 2017
- APPLE-1033 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Garmin International, Inc.*, 6:17-cv-01217, D. Kan., Aug. 23, 2017
- APPLE-1034 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Omron Healthcare, Inc.*, 1:18-cv-01617, D. Del., Oct. 18, 2018
- APPLE-1035 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Misfit, Inc.*, 1:21-cv-00385, D. Del., Mar. 16, 2021
- APPLE-1036 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.*, 6:21-cv-00119, E.D. Tex., Mar. 25, 2021
- APPLE-1037 Complaint, *Logantree LP, v. LG Electronics, Inc.*, 4:21-cv-00332, E.D. Tex., Apr. 27, 2021
- APPLE-1038-1099 [RESERVED]
- APPLE-1100 Declaration and Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Thomas Kenny
- APPLE-1101 U.S. Patent No. 4,962,469 (“Ono”)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.