

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MICRON TECHNOLOGY, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

VERVAIN, LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case No.: IPR2021-01550
U.S. Patent No. 10,950,300
Original Issue Date: March 16, 2021

Title: LIFETIME MIXED LEVEL NON-VOLATILE MEMORY SYSTEM

PETITIONER'S REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------|--|----|
| I. | Introduction..... | 1 |
| II. | Claim Construction..... | 3 |
| III. | Ground 1: Vervain Has Not Rebutted Micron’s Showing That Dusija in View of the Knowledge of a POSA Renders Claims 1-9 and 11-12 Obvious..... | 3 |
| A. | Limitation [1.E]..... | 3 |
| 1. | PO’s Objections to the Specificity of the Petition Lack Merit..... | 3 |
| 2. | Contrary to PO’s Characterization, Petitioner’s Obviousness Theory Does Not Rely on Two Distinct “Mapping[s]” | 4 |
| 3. | The POR’s Teaching-Away Argument Lacks Merit..... | 6 |
| (a) | The POR Is Deficient as a Matter of Law | 6 |
| (1) | In the Institution Decision, the Board Found That a POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Use a RAM Cache with Dusija | 6 |
| (2) | The POR Does Not Dispute the Factual Basis for the Institution Decision’s Motivation-to-Combine Finding | 8 |
| (3) | The POR’s Factual Contentions, Even If Accepted, Do Not Disturb the Board’s Obviousness Conclusion | 9 |
| (4) | The “Random Access Volatile Memory” Cannot Render the Challenged Claims Patentable | 12 |
| (b) | The Record Evidence Establishes a Motivation to Combine Dusija’s Controller with a RAM Cache..... | 13 |
| (1) | The Proposed Combination Is Not Contrary to Dusija’s Teachings | 14 |
| (2) | A POSA Would Have Known That a Flash Memory Cache Has Many <i>Disadvantages</i> When Compared to a Cache in Controller RAM..... | 20 |

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| B. | Limitation [1.G.2]..... | 23 |
| C. | Limitation [1.H]..... | 24 |
| IV. | Ground 2: Vervain Does Not Challenge Micron’s Showing That Dusija in View of Sutardja and the Knowledge of a POSA Render Claim 10 Obvious | 25 |
| V. | Conclusion | 25 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|--|----------------|
| Cases | |
| <i>In re Fulton</i> , 391 F.3d 1195 (Fed. Cir. 2004) | 12, 22 |
| <i>In re Ratti</i> , 270 F.2d 810, 813 (CCPA 1959) | 10 |
| <i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007) | 13 |

LISTING OF EXHIBITS

| Exhibit | Description |
|-----------|--|
| 1001-1006 | <i>Intentionally omitted</i> |
| 1007 | U.S. Patent No. 10,950,300 (“300 patent”) |
| 1008 | File History of U.S. Patent No. 10,950,300 |
| 1009 | Declaration of Dr. David Liu (“Liu Decl.”) – IPR2021-01550 |
| 1010 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2011/0099460 (“Dusija”) |
| 1011 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2008/0140918 (“Sutardja”) |
| 1012 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2009/0327591 (“Moshayedi”) |
| 1013 | <i>Intentionally omitted</i> |
| 1014 | Betty Prince, Semiconductor Memories – A Handbook of Design, Manufacture, and Application (2d ed. 1991) (“Prince”) |
| 1015 | U.S. Patent No. 8,120,960 (“Varkony”) |
| 1016 | U.S. Patent No. 7,000,063 (“Friedman”) |
| 1017 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2005/0251617 (“Sinclair”) |
| 1018 | Jan Axelson, USB Mass Storage: Designing and Programming Devices and Embedded Hosts (2006) (“Axelson”) |
| 1019 | Rino Micheloni et al., Inside NAND Flash Memories (1 st ed. 2010) (“Micheloni”) |
| 1020 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2011/0115192 (“Y. Lee”) |
| 1021 | U.S. Patent No. 7,453,712 (“Kim”) |
| 1022 | U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2011/0096601 (“Gavens”) |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.