

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SONY MOBILE COMMUNICATIONS AB, SONY MOBILE
COMMUNICATIONS, INC., SONY ELECTRONICS INC., and
SONY CORPORATION,
Petitioners

v.

ANCORA TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2021-00663
Patent No. 6,411,941

**DECLARATION OF DR. DAVID MARTIN ON *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 6,411,941**

IPR2021-01338
ANCORA EX2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Exhibits	4
I. Qualifications and Professional Experience	7
II. Background of this Matter	8
III. Summary of Opinions Regarding the Validity of the '941 Patent.....	9
IV. High-Level Description of Materials Studied.....	10
V. Relevant Legal Principles	11
A. Presumption of Validity	11
B. Anticipation	11
C. Obviousness.....	14
D. Prior Art Considered by the Examiner, and Prior Art that Is Cumulative to the Prior Art Considered by the Examiner	19
E. Claim Construction	20
F. Abstract Ideas	31
G. The Manner of Rebuttal	31
H. The Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art and Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	32
I. Avoidance of Impermissible Hindsight.....	33
J. Requirements for Asserting Obviousness.....	34
VI. Technology Background.....	35
VII. The References Addressed in the Wolfe Declaration	42
VIII. General Comments on the Wolfe Declaration	42
A. Frequent Use of Impermissible Hindsight.....	42
B. Inadequacy of Addressing the Expectation of Success	43
IX. Rebuttal to Dr. Wolfe's Opinions Regarding the '941 Patent.....	44
A. Hellman, Chou, and/or Schneck Does Not Invalidate the Asserted Claims of the '941 Patent	45
1. Alleged Memory of the BIOS	51
2. No Motivation to Combine	57
3. Dependent Claims.....	57
a. Claim 2	57
b. Claim 3	57
c. Claim 6	59

d.	Claim 7	59
e.	Claim 9	59
f.	Claim 10	59
g.	Claim 11	60
h.	Claim 12	60
i.	Claim 13	62
j.	Claim 14	62
k.	Claim 16	62

List of Exhibits

Exhibit No.	Description	Date
2001	Scheduling Order, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Sony Mobile Communications AB et al.</i> , Case No. 19-1703-CFC (Dkt. #24)	Sept. 16, 2020
2002	Sony's Invalidation Contentions, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Sony Mobile Communications AB et al.</i> , Case No. 19-1703-CFC	Dec. 18, 2020
2003	Sony's Appendices A-E to Invalidation Contentions, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Sony Mobile Communications AB et al.</i> , Case No. 19-1703-CFC	Dec. 18, 2020
2004	Apple Patent L.R. 3-3 Disclosures, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Apple, Inc.</i> , Case No. 4:11-cv-06357 (Dkt. #171-3)	Aug. 25, 2015
2005	Order Setting Patent Case Schedule, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. HTC America, Inc.</i> , Case No. 2:16-cv-01919 (Dkt. #56)	Mar. 11, 2019
2006	E-mail from Canavera to trials@uspto.gov	Feb. 19, 2021
2007	Complaint, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Sony Mobile Communications AB et al.</i> , Case No. 19-1703-CFC (Dkt. #1)	Sept. 11, 2019
2008	Judge Connolly Docket Navigator Statistic	Apr. 15, 2021
2009	Scheduling Order, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. LG Electronics, Inc. et al.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00034 (WDTX) (Dkt. #129)	Jan. 28, 2021
2010	Expert Report of Suzanne Barber, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. LG Electronics, Inc. et al.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00034 (WDTX)	Jan. 22, 2021
2011	Declaration of Erez Zadok, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. LG Electronics, Inc. et al.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00034 (WDTX) (Dkt. #45-1)	Mar. 20, 2020

Exhibit No.	Description	Date
2012	Joint Claim Construction Chart, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. Sony Mobile Communications AB et al.</i> , Case No. 19-1703-CFC (Dkt. #34, 34-1, 34-2)	April 6, 2021
2013 NEW	Ancora's Preliminary Response to Petition, Case No. IPR2020-01609 (Dkt. 6)	Dec. 17, 2020
2014 NEW	Decision Granting Institution, Case No. IPR2020-01609 (Dkt. 7)	Feb. 16, 2021
2015 NEW	Declaration of Dr. David Martin, Ph.D.	
2016 NEW	<i>Ancora Techs., Inc. v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 744 F.3d 732 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	
2017 NEW	Phil Croucher, "The BIOS Companion," Tri-Tam Enterprises Inc. 1997	
2018 NEW	Telephonic Markman Hearing Tentative Ruling, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. TCT Mobile (US), Inc. et al.</i> , Case No. 8:19-cv-02192 (CDCA) (Dkt. #60)	Oct. 15, 2020
2019	RESERVED	
2020	RESERVED	
2021	RESERVED	
2022 NEW	US Patent 6,189,146 B1 ("Misra")	Feb. 13, 2001
2023 NEW	US Patent 5,479,639 ("Ewertz")	Dec. 26, 1995
2024 NEW	Microsoft Corporation's Request for <i>Ex Parte</i> Reexamination Image File Wrapper, Control No. 90010560	
2025 NEW	Final Rulings on Claim Construction, <i>Ancora Technologies, Inc. v. TCT Mobile (US), Inc. et al.</i> , Case No. 8:19-cv-02192 (CDCA) (Dkt. #66, #69)	Nov. 12, 2020; Nov. 19, 2020

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.