

CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION, SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

**UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
Washington, D.C.**

**Before the Honorable Cameron R. Elliot
Administrative Law Judge**

In the Matter of

**CERTAIN WEARABLE ELECTRONIC
DEVICES WITH ECG FUNCTIONALITY
AND COMPONENTS THEREOF**

Inv. No. 337-TA-1266

EXPERT REPORT OF COLLIN STULTZ, M.D., PH.D. REGARDING INVALIDITY

OF U.S. PATENT NOS. 9,572,499, 10,595,731, AND 10,638,941

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	QUALIFICATIONS	2
III.	MATERIALS CONSIDERED	4
IV.	SUMMARY OF OPINIONS	5
V.	LEGAL STANDARDS	6
	A. Claim Construction	6
	B. Invalidity	7
	1. Ineligible Subject Matter.....	8
	2. Anticipation.....	9
	3. Obviousness	11
	C. Terminal Disclaimer	16
VI.	PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART.....	16
VII.	TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND	17
	A. The Cardiovascular System and the Cardiac Cycle.....	17
	B. Tools Used to Measure Heart Parameters and Other Physiological Information. 21	
	1. Using an ECG to Measure Cardiac Activity.....	22
	2. Using a PPG to Measure Cardiac Activity	27
VIII.	THE '499 AND '731 PATENTS.....	28
	A. Overview of the '499 and '731 Patents.....	28
	B. State of the Art for the '499 and '731 Patents	30
	1. AMON	36
	2. Kotzin.....	37
	3. Almen.....	39
	4. Tran.....	41
	5. Thomsen.....	43
	6. Libbus	44
	C. Prosecution History of the '499 and '731 Patents	46
	1. Prosecution History of the '499 Patent	46
	2. Prosecution History of the '731 Patent	49
	D. Asserted Claims of the '499 and '731 Patents.....	51
	E. Claim Constructions for the '499 and '731 Patents.....	53
IX.	THE '941 PATENT	54
	A. Overview of the '941 Patent	54

B.	State of the Art for the '941 Patent	56
1.	Specific '941 Patent State-of-the-Art Disclosures.....	56
C.	Prosecution History of the '941 Patent	62
D.	Asserted Claims of the '941 Patent.....	65
E.	Claim Constructions for the '941 Patent.....	66
X.	INVALIDITY OF THE '499 PATENT.....	67
A.	Summary of Invalidity Opinions for the '499 Patent.....	67
B.	Ineligible Subject Matter of the '499 Patent.....	67
1.	Independent Claims 1 and 11.....	68
2.	Dependent Claims 6-7, 9-10, 16-17, and 20.....	74
C.	Invalidity in View of AMON, Kotzin, and Almen	77
1.	Reasons to Combine the References.....	77
2.	Claim 1.....	79
3.	Claim 6: The method of claim 1, wherein said mobile computing device comprises a smartwatch.	95
4.	Claim 7: The method of claim 1, further comprising determining a presence of said arrhythmia using a machine learning algorithm.....	96
5.	Claim 9: The method of claim 7, wherein said machine learning algorithm stores heart rate and heart rate variability data associated with arrhythmias in a second user and determines said presence of said arrhythmia in said first user based on said stored heart and heart rate variability data associated with arrhythmias in said second user.....	98
6.	Claim 10: The method of claim 1, wherein an irregularity comprises an increase in said heart rate variability of said first user without a corresponding increase in said activity level of said first user.	101
7.	Claim 11.....	103
8.	Claim 16: The system of claim 11, wherein said mobile computing device comprises a smartwatch.	109
9.	Claim 17: The system of claim 11, wherein said computer program further causes said processor to determine a presence of said arrhythmia using a machine learning algorithm.	109
10.	Claim 20: The system of claim 11, wherein an irregularity comprises an increase in said heart rate variability of said first user without a corresponding increase in said activity level of said first user.	109
D.	Invalidity in View of Tran, Thomsen, and Libbus.....	110
1.	Reasons to Combine the References.....	110
2.	Claim 1.....	111

3.	Claim 6: The method of claim 1, wherein said mobile computing device comprises a smartwatch.	125
4.	Claim 7: The method of claim 1, further comprising determining a presence of said arrhythmia using a machine learning algorithm.....	126
5.	Claim 9: The method of claim 7, wherein said machine learning algorithm stores heart rate and heart rate variability data associated with arrhythmias in a second user and determines said presence of said arrhythmia in said first user based on said stored heart and heart rate variability data associated with arrhythmias in said second user.....	127
6.	Claim 10: The method of claim 1, wherein an irregularity comprises an increase in said heart rate variability of said first user without a corresponding increase in said activity level of said first user.	129
7.	Claim 11.....	130
8.	Claim 16: The system of claim 11, wherein said mobile computing device comprises a smartwatch.	136
9.	Claim 17: The system of claim 11, wherein said computer program further causes said processor to determine a presence of said arrhythmia using a machine learning algorithm.	136
10.	Claim 20: The system of claim 11, wherein an irregularity comprises an increase in said heart rate variability of said first user without a corresponding increase in said activity level of said first user.	136
XI.	INVALIDITY OF THE '731 PATENT.....	136
A.	Summary of Invalidity Opinions for the '731 Patent.....	136
B.	Ineligible Subject Matter of the '731 Patent.....	137
1.	Independent Claims 1 and 17.....	137
2.	Dependent Claims 3, 5, 7-10, 12, 15-16, 19, 21, and 23-24.....	143
C.	Invalidity in View of AMON, Kotzin, and Almen.....	148
1.	Claim 1.....	148
2.	Claim 2: The smart watch of claim 1, further comprising a motion sensor operatively coupled to the processing device, wherein to detect the presence of the arrhythmia, the processing device is configured to: receive motion sensor data from the motion sensor; and determine, from motion sensor data, that the user is at rest.....	164
3.	Claim 3: The smart watch of claim 2, wherein to detect the presence of the arrhythmia, the processing device is configured to input the PPG data into a machine learning algorithm trained to detect arrhythmias.....	165
4.	Claim 4: The smart watch of claim 2, wherein to detect the presence of the arrhythmia, the processing device is configured to: determine heartrate variability ("HRV") data from the PPG data; and detect, based on the HRV data, the presence of the arrhythmia.....	168

5.	Claim 5: The smart watch of claim 4, wherein to detect the presence of the arrhythmia, the processing device is configured to input the HRV data into a machine learning algorithm trained to detect arrhythmias.....	173
6.	Claim 7: The smart watch of claim 1, wherein the processing device is further configured to: extract one or more features from the PPG data; and detect, based on the one or more features, the presence of the arrhythmia.	176
7.	Claim 8: The smart watch of claim 7, wherein the one or more features correspond to an HRV signal analyzed in a time domain.....	180
8.	Claim 9: The smart watch of claim 7, wherein the one or more features comprise a nonlinear transform of R-R ratio or R-R ratio statistics with an adaptive weighting factor.....	181
9.	Claim 10: The smart watch of claim 7, wherein the one or more features are features of an HRV signal analyzed geometrically.....	182
10.	Claim 12: The smart watch of claim 1, wherein the processing device is further configured to generate a notification of the detected arrhythmia.	184
11.	Claim 15: The smart watch of claim 1, the processing device further configured to display an ECG rhythm strip from the ECG data.....	185
12.	Claim 16: The smart watch of claim 1, the processing device further to receive the ECG data from the ECG sensor in response to receiving an indication of a user action.	186
13.	Claim 17.....	188
14.	Claim 18: The method of claim 17, wherein detecting the presence of the arrhythmia comprises: receiving motion sensor data from a motion sensor of the smartwatch; and determine, from motion sensor data, that the user is at rest.	189
15.	Claim 19: The method of claim 18, wherein detecting the presence of the arrhythmia comprises inputting the PPG data into a machine learning algorithm trained to detect arrhythmias.	189
16.	Claim 20: The method of claim 18, wherein detecting the presence of the arrhythmia comprises: determining heartrate variability (“HRV”) data from the PPG data; and detecting, based on the HRV data, the presence of the arrhythmia.	190
17.	Claim 21: The method of claim 20, wherein detecting the presence of the arrhythmia comprises inputting the HRV data into a machine learning algorithm trained to detect arrhythmias.	190
18.	Claim 23: The method of claim 17, further comprising generating a notification of the detected arrhythmia.	190

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.