

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

REGENERON PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

NOVARTIS PHARMA AG,
NOVARTIS TECHNOLOGY LLC,
NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,
Patent Owner.

IPR2020-00816
U.S. Patent No. 9,220,631

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL 1

II. SIGG AND BOULANGE 1

 A. Motivation to Combine 1

 1. A POSITA Would Have Used Either Stopper B1 or Siliconized Stopper C 2

 2. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Meet the USP789 Particle Limitation 7

 B. Reasonable Expectation of Success 8

 C. The Prior Art Enables the Challenged Claims 11

 1. Novartis’s Position and Dr. Sigg’s Testimony Are Not Credible 11

 2. Novartis’s Other Enablement Arguments Are Meritless 13

 D. The Dependent Claims Are Obvious 14

 1. Claim 14 14

 2. Claim 17 15

 3. Claim 21 15

 4. Claims 24-26 17

III. LAM AND BOULANGE 18

 A. Lam’s Potency Data Would Not Have Deterred a POSITA 18

 B. The Prior Art Enables the Challenged Claims 19

 C. Claim 21 Would Have Been Obvious Based on Lam 20

IV. Secondary Considerations Do Not Demonstrate Non-Obviousness 21

 A. Commercial Success 21

 1. Any Success Is Due to Unclaimed or Known Features 21

 2. Lucentis PFS Is Not Coextensive with the Broad Claims 23

 3. Novartis Has Not Demonstrated that Increased Sales of Lucentis Were Due to Claimed Features of the PFS 24

 B. Long-Felt Need 24

 C. Failure of Others 26



D. Skepticism27

E. Licensing27

V. CONCLUSION.....27

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Ex. 1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,220,631 (“the ’631 Patent”)
Ex. 1002	Prosecution File History of U.S. Patent No. 9,220,631
Ex. 1003	Declaration of Horst Koller under 37 C.F.R. § 1.68.
Ex. 1004	Curriculum Vitae of Horst Koller
Ex. 1005	ITC Investigation No. 337-TA-1207, Staff’s Pre-Hearing Brief (public version)
Ex. 1006	ITC Investigation No. 337-TA-1207, Complainant’s Unopposed Motion to Terminate
Ex. 1007	PCT Patent Publication No. WO 2011/006877 to Sigg <i>et al.</i> (“Sigg”)
Ex. 1008	PCT Patent Publication No. WO 2009/030976 to Boulange <i>et al.</i> (“Boulange”)
Ex. 1009	Internet Archive WayBack Machine, March 7, 2011 Record of Drugs.com, <i>Macugen Prescribing Information</i> , available at https://web.archive.org/web/20110307065238/http://www.drugs.com:80/pro/macugen.html (“2008 Macugen Label”)
Ex. 1010	ITC Investigation No. 337-TA-1207, Initial Determination Terminating the Investigation
Ex. 1011	Bhavnes D. Shah & Bhupendra G. Prajapati, <i>Pre-Filled Syringes: A New Concept</i> , PHARMA BIO WORLD 51 (2009) (“Shah”)
Ex. 1012	Arno Fries, <i>Drug Delivery of Sensitive Biopharmaceuticals With Prefilled Syringes</i> , 9(5) DRUG DELIVERY TECH. 22 (2009) (“Fries”)
Ex. 1013	Thomas Schoenknecht, <i>Prefilled Syringes: Why New Developments Are Important In Injectable Delivery Today</i> , in PREFILLED SYRINGES INNOVATIONS THAT MEET THE GROWING DEMAND (OnDrugDelivery 2005) (“Schoenknecht”)

Ex. 1014	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2012/0091026 to Chacornac <i>et al.</i> (“Chacornac”)
Ex. 1015	Sandeep Nema & John D. Ludwig, <i>Pharmaceutical Dosage Forms: Parenteral Medications, Volume 1: Formulation and Packaging</i> (3rd ed. 2010) (“Nema Vol. 1”)
Ex. 1016	Sandeep Nema & John D. Ludwig, <i>Pharmaceutical Dosage Forms: Parenteral Medications, Volume 2: Facility Design, Sterilization and Processing</i> (3rd ed. 2010) (“Nema Vol. 2”)
Ex. 1017	PCT Patent Publication No. WO 2007/035621 to Scypinski <i>et al.</i> (“Scypinski”)
Ex. 1018	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2003/0003014 to Metzner <i>et al.</i> (“Metzner”)
Ex. 1019	U.S. Pharmacopeia, <i>USP 789, Particulate Matter in Ophthalmic Solutions, USP 34 NF 29</i> (2011)
Ex. 1020	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/276005 to Hioki <i>et al.</i> (“Hioki”)
Ex. 1021	PCT Patent Publication No. WO 2007/149334 to Furfine <i>et al.</i> (“Furfine”)
Ex. 1022	Michael W. Stewart <i>et al.</i> , <i>Fresh From the Pipeline Aflibercept</i> , 11 NAT. REV. DRUG DISCOV. 269 (2012) (“Stewart”)
Ex. 1023	U.S. Patent No. 7,060,269 to Baca <i>et al.</i> (“Baca”)
Ex. 1024	Gerald McDonnell and Denver Russell, <i>Antiseptics and Disinfectants: Activities, Action, and Resistance</i> , Clinical Microbiology Review, (Jan. 1999) (“McDonnell”).
Ex. 1025	Lu Liu <i>et al.</i> , <i>Silicone Oil Microdroplets and Protein Aggregates in Repackaged Bevacizumab and Ranibizumab: Effects of Long-term Storage and Product Mishandling</i> , 52(2) INVESTIGATIVE OPHTHALMOLOGY & VISUAL SCIENCE 1023 (2011) (“Liu”)
Ex. 1026	U.S. Patent No. 7,404,278 to Wittland <i>et al.</i> (“Wittland”)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.