

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

REGENERON PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

NOVARTIS PHARMA AG,
NOVARTIS TECHNOLOGY LLC,
NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,
Patent Owners.

Case IPR2021-00816
Patent Number: 9,220,631

REPLY DECLARATION OF HORST KOLLER

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ADDITIONAL LEGAL STANDARDS	1
A. Motion to Amend	1
B. Enablement.....	1
C. Indefiniteness.....	2
III. DEFINITION OF POSITA	2
IV. RESPONSES TO ASSERTIONS BY NOVARTIS’S EXPERTS CONCERNING THE ORIGINAL CLAIMS OF THE ’631 PATENT	5
A. FREE V. TOTAL SILICONE OIL	5
B. A POSITA Would Have Had A Reasonable Expectation Of Success In Combining Boulange With Sigg Or Lam To Arrive At The Claimed Invention.....	6
1. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated To Use Boulange’s Stopper B1	6
a. A POSITA Would Not Be Deterred from Using Parylene C.....	6
b. Parylene C Would Not Come in Contact with the VEGF-Antagonist.....	10
2. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Use Boulange’s Stopper C	12
3. A POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Make a VEGF- Antagonist Solution Having No More Than 2 Particles Greater Than 50 µm in Diameter per Milliliter	18
C. A POSITA Would Have Had A Reasonable Expectation Of Success In Combining Boulange With Sigg Or Lam To Arrive At The Claimed Invention.....	19
1. Boulange Discloses Components that Ensure A Sufficiently Tight Seal	20
2. The Prior Art Taught How to Prevent Stopper Movement During Sterilization.....	23

3.	Sigg Discloses Terminal Sterilization with Minimal Pressure Change, Eliminating Any Problems Created by Pressure Changes during Terminal Sterilization	26
4.	Macugen PFS Demonstrates that a POSITA Would Have Expected to Succeed in Terminally Sterilizing a PFS	28
5.	Eylea PFS Demonstrates a POSITA Would Have Reasonably Expected to Succeed with Terminal Sterilization	28
D.	Sigg And Lam Enable a Terminally Sterilized PFS In View of the Prior Art.....	29
1.	Sigg Is Enabled	29
2.	Lam Is Enabled	32
E.	The Potency Data in Lam Would Not Have Deterred a POSITA from Using Its Method	33
F.	The Additional Limitations In Claims 17 and 21 Are Obvious Over Sigg In View Of Boulange	34
1.	Claim 17	34
2.	Claim 21	35
G.	The Additional Limitations In Claims 17 and 21 Are Obvious Over Lam In View Of Boulange	36
H.	The Additional Limitations In Claims 24-26 Are Obvious Over Sigg Or Lam In View Of Boulange	38
1.	Claim 24	39
2.	Claim 25	39
3.	Claim 26	40
V.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS	41
A.	Commercial Success.....	41
1.	Ophthalmologists Do Not Use Lucentis PFS Because Of The Features Claimed In The '631 Patent	41
2.	There Is No Nexus Between Lucentis PFS And The '631 Patent.....	42
B.	Long Felt, Unmet Need.....	46

C.	Skepticism	50
D.	Failure Of Others.....	52
E.	Licensing	53
VI.	EACH SUBSTITUTE CLAIMS PROPOSED BY NOVARTIS IS UNPATENTABLE.....	59
A.	Novartis’s Proposed Substitute Claims.....	59
B.	Overview of Additional Prior Art References to Proposed Substitute Claims.....	61
1.	BD – The Hypak 1 mL LLA EZGTC syringe offered for sale by Becton Dickinson (“BD 1 mL Hypak”)	61
2.	Macugen Pre-Filled Syringe	66
3.	“Nema” – Sandeep Nema & John D. Ludwig, Pharmaceutical Dosage Forms: Parenteral Medication, Volume 1-2 (3rd ed. 2010).....	76
C.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak and Nema Renders Obvious the Substitute Claims 27-29, 31-35, 40-48, and 50	77
1.	Motivation to Combine Sigg, Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak, and Nema.....	78
a.	Silicone Oil and Break Loose / Slide Forces.....	78
b.	Particulate Content	78
c.	Terminal Sterilization	79
d.	Twelve-Month Shelf-life	79
2.	Reasonable Expectation of Success	80
a.	Silicone Oil Level Below about 25 µg	81
b.	Twelve-Month Shelf Life	85
3.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak and Nema Discloses Each Limitation of Substitute Claim 27	97
a.	[27.a] A pre-filled, terminally sterilized syringe for intravitreal injection.....	97
b.	[27.b] the syringe comprising a glass body forming a barrel, a stopper and a plunger.....	97

c.	[27.c] and containing an ophthalmic solution which comprises a VEGF-antagonist, wherein:	99
d.	[27.d] the syringe has a nominal maximum fill volume of between about 0.5 ml and about 1 ml	100
e.	[27.e] the syringe barrel comprises from about 1 µg to about 25 µg silicone oil	100
f.	[27.f] the VEGF antagonist solution comprises no more than 2 particles >50 µm in diameter per ml	102
g.	[27.g] and wherein the syringe has a stopper break loose force of less than about 11N	102
h.	[27.h] and has a shelf life of at least twelve months after terminal sterilization.....	106
4.	Substitute Claim 28.....	106
5.	Substitute Claims 29 and 48	107
6.	Substitute Claims 31-35.....	108
7.	Substitute Claim 40.....	108
8.	Substitute Claim 41	111
9.	Substitute Claim 42.....	112
10.	Substitute Claims 43-47	115
11.	Substitute Claim 50.....	115
D.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak, Nema, and Further in View of Fries, Renders Obvious Substitute Claims 30, 36, and 49	116
E.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak, Nema, and Further in View of Furfine, Renders Obvious Substitute Claims 37-39.....	117
F.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak, Nema, and Further in View of Macugen PFS 2008 Label, Renders Obvious Substitute Claim 51	118
G.	Sigg in View of Boulange or BD 1 mL Hypak, Nema, and Further in View of Dixon, Renders Obvious Substitute Claim 52	119

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.