

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES CORPORATION AND EDWARDS
LIFESCIENCES LLC,
Petitioners

v.

COLIBRI HEART VALVE LLC,
Patent Owner

Patent No. 9,125,739

MOTION FOR JOINDER TO *INTER PARTES* REVIEW IPR2020-01454

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. STATEMENT OF THE PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED	1
II. STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS.....	2
III. STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR RELIEF REQUESTED.....	3
A. Legal Standard	3
B. Each of the Relevant Factors Weighs in Favor of the Board Granting the Motion for Joinder	4
1. Joinder with the Medtronic IPR Is Appropriate	4
2. Petitioners Do Not Propose New Grounds.....	5
3. Joinder Will Not Negatively Impact the Medtronic IPR Trial Schedule.....	6
4. Procedures to Simplify Briefing and Discovery.....	7
IV. The <i>General Plastic</i> Factors Do Not Favor Denial.....	8
1. “ <i>whether the same petitioner previously filed a petition directed to the same claims of the same patent</i> ”	10
2. “ <i>whether at the time of filing of the first petition the petitioner knew of the prior art asserted in the second petition or should have known of it</i> ”	12
3. “ <i>whether at the time of filing the second petition the petitioner already received the patent owner’s preliminary response to the first petition or received the Board’s decision on whether to institute review in the first petition</i> ”	12
4. “ <i>the length of time that elapsed between the time the petitioner learned of the prior art asserted in the second petition and the filing of the second petition</i> ”	

and “whether the petitioner provides adequate explanation for the time elapsed between the filings of multiple petitions directed to the same claims of the same patent”13

5. *“the finite resources of the Board”*14

6. *“the requirement under 35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(11) to issue a final determination not later than 1 year after the date on which the Director notices institution of review”*15

V. CONCLUSION15

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Apple Inc. v. INVT SPE LLC</i> , IPR2019-00958, Paper No. 9 (PTAB May 30, 2019)	10, 11
<i>Apple Inc. v. Uniloc 2017 LLC</i> , IPR2020-00854, Paper No. 9 (PTAB Oct. 28, 2020)	10
<i>Celltrion, Inc. v. Genentech, Inc.</i> , IPR2018-01019, Paper No. 11 (PTAB Oct. 30, 2018)	10
<i>Dell, Inc. v. Network-1 Security Solutions, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00385, Paper No. 17 (PTAB July 29, 2013)	4
<i>General Plastic Industrial Co., Ltd. v. Canon Kabushiki Kaisha</i> , IPR2016-01357, Paper No. 19 (PTAB Sept. 6, 2017)	<i>passim</i>
<i>HTC v. Parthenon Unified Memory Architecture LLC</i> , IPR2017-00512, Paper No. 12 (PTAB June 1, 2017)	1
<i>LG v. Memory Integrity, LLC</i> , IPR2015-01353, Paper No. 11 (PTAB Oct. 5, 2015)	4, 5, 6, 8
<i>Noven Pharmaceuticals, Inc. v. Novartis AG</i> , IPR2014-00550, Paper No. 38 (PTAB Apr. 10, 2015)	7
<i>Par Pharmaceutical, Inc. v. Novartis AG</i> , IPR2016-01023, Paper No. 20 (PTAB Oct. 27, 2016)	5
<i>Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd. v. Raytheon Co.</i> , IPR2016-00962, Paper No. 12 (PTAB Aug. 24, 2016)	4
Rules, Statutes and Regulations	
35 U.S.C. § 315(b)	2, 14
35 U.S.C. § 315(c)	1, 3

Edwards' Motion for
Joinder with Case IPR2020-01454

35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(11)..... 15

37 C.F.R. § 42.1(b) 1, 5

37 C.F.R. §§ 42.22 1

37 C.F.R. § 42.122(b) 1, 9, 14

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.