

**DECLARATION OF ROBERT M. KIMMEL**  
**UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 REGARDING U.S. PATENT NOS. 7,798,319;**  
**8,458,996; AND 8,556,070**

Declaration

I declare that all statements made herein on my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true, and further, that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code.

Date: January 28, 2021

By: 

Robert M. Kimmel

## Table of Contents

<b>I.</b>	<b>Professional Background.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>Relevant Legal Standards .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>Person Of Ordinary Skill In The Art.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Technology Background.....</b>	<b>11</b>
	A. The '319 Patent.....	11
	B. The '996 Patent.....	13
	C. The '070 Patent.....	13
<b>V.</b>	<b>Overview Of The Prosecution Histories .....</b>	<b>13</b>
	A. The '319 Patent.....	13
	B. The '996 Patent.....	14
	C. The '070 Patent.....	15
<b>VI.</b>	<b>Claim Construction.....</b>	<b>17</b>
	A. Tobacco Product .....	17
	B. Connection Rim .....	18
	C. Non-Hermetic Seal.....	18
	D. Bead .....	19
	E. Continuous Bead.....	19
<b>VII.</b>	<b>Overview Of The Prior Art.....</b>	<b>19</b>
	A. Overview Of Brucker.....	19
	B. Overview Of Welk.....	23
	C. Overview Of Rosson.....	27
	D. Overview Of Boyd.....	31
	E. Overview Of Bried 928.....	33
	F. Overview Of Budd.....	35
	G. Overview Of Szalay.....	36
	H. Overview Of Winterson.....	37
<b>VIII.</b>	<b>The Claims Of The '319 Patent Are Unpatentable.....</b>	<b>38</b>
	A. Ground 1: Claims 17-20, 23 And 25-26 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Welk.....	38
	1. Independent Claim 17 .....	38
	2. Dependent Claim 18 .....	49

3.	Dependent Claim 19 .....	51
4.	Dependent Claim 20 .....	52
5.	Dependent Claim 23 .....	55
6.	Dependent Claim 25 .....	56
7.	Dependent Claim 26 .....	58
B.	Ground 2a: Claims 17-20 And 25-26 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson.....	59
1.	Independent Claim 17 .....	59
2.	Dependent Claim 18 .....	70
3.	Dependent Claim 19 .....	72
4.	Dependent Claim 20 .....	73
5.	Dependent Claim 25 .....	75
6.	Dependent Claim 26 .....	77
C.	Ground 2b: Claim 23 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson And Further In View Of Boyd.....	78
1.	Dependent Claim 23 .....	78
<b>IX.</b>	<b>The Claims Of The '996 Patent Are Unpatentable.....</b>	<b>79</b>
A.	Ground 1a: Claims 1 and 4 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Welk .....	79
1.	Independent Claim 1 .....	79
2.	Dependent Claim 4 .....	93
B.	Ground 1b: Claim 5 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Welk And Further In View Of Szalay .....	95
1.	Dependent Claim 5 .....	95
C.	Ground 2a: Claims 1 and 4 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson.....	97
1.	Independent Claim 1 .....	97
2.	Dependent Claim 4 .....	112
D.	Ground 2b: Claim 5 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson And Further In View Of Szalay .....	114
1.	Dependent Claim 5 .....	114
<b>X.</b>	<b>The Claims Of The '070 Patent Are Unpatentable.....</b>	<b>116</b>
A.	Ground 1a: Claims 1-6, 8, 11-22 And 25-28 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Welk.....	116

1.	Independent Claim 1 .....	116
2.	Dependent Claim 2 .....	129
3.	Dependent Claim 3 .....	129
4.	Independent Claim 4 .....	131
5.	Dependent Claim 5 .....	144
6.	Dependent Claim 6 .....	147
7.	Dependent Claim 8 .....	148
8.	Dependent Claim 11 .....	149
9.	Dependent Claim 12 .....	150
10.	Dependent Claim 13 .....	151
11.	Dependent Claim 14 .....	155
12.	Dependent Claim 15 .....	156
13.	Dependent Claim 16 .....	157
14.	Dependent Claim 17 .....	158
15.	Dependent Claim 18 .....	160
16.	Independent Claim 19 .....	161
17.	Dependent Claim 20 .....	172
18.	Dependent Claim 21 .....	174
19.	Dependent Claim 22 .....	175
20.	Dependent Claim 25 .....	178
21.	Dependent Claim 26 .....	178
22.	Dependent Claim 27 .....	183
23.	Dependent Claim 28 .....	184
B.	Ground 1b: Claim 10 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Welk And Further In View Of Winterson.....	186
1.	Dependent Claim 10 .....	186
C.	Ground 2a: Claims 1-6, 8, 11-13, 15-22, 25 And 27-28 Are Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson.....	187
1.	Independent Claim 1 .....	187
2.	Dependent Claim 2 .....	200

3.	Dependent Claim 3 .....	200
4.	Independent Claim 4 .....	202
5.	Dependent Claim 5 .....	215
6.	Dependent Claim 6 .....	217
7.	Dependent Claim 8 .....	219
8.	Dependent Claim 11 .....	219
9.	Dependent Claim 12 .....	220
10.	Dependent Claim 13 .....	222
11.	Dependent Claim 15 .....	224
12.	Dependent Claim 16 .....	226
13.	Dependent Claim 17 .....	226
14.	Dependent Claim 18 .....	228
15.	Independent Claim 19 .....	229
16.	Dependent Claim 20 .....	241
17.	Dependent Claim 21 .....	243
18.	Dependent Claim 22 .....	244
19.	Dependent Claim 25 .....	246
20.	Dependent Claim 27 .....	247
21.	Dependent Claim 28 .....	248
D.	Ground 2b: Claim 10 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson And Further In View Of Winterson.....	249
1.	Dependent Claim 10 .....	249
E.	Ground 2c: Claim 14 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson And Further In View Of Boyd.....	251
1.	Dependent Claim 14 .....	251
F.	Ground 2d: Claim 26 Is Obvious Over Brucker In View Of Rosson And Further In View Of Budd.....	252
1.	Dependent Claim 26 .....	252

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.