

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LIQUIDIA TECHNOLOGIES, Inc.,
Petitioner,

v.

UNITED THERAPEUTICS CORPORATION,
Patent Owner.

IPR2021-00406
U.S. Patent No. 10,716,793

PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION.....1

II. BACKGROUND.....2

 A. Pulmonary Hypertension.....2

 B. The Inventors Developed a Novel Method of Treating PAH That Overcame Limitations of Existing Treatments.....4

III. Claim Construction and Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....7

IV. PETITIONER HAS NOT MET ITS BURDEN TO ESTABLISH THAT CLAIMS 1-8 OF THE '793 PATENT ARE ANTICIPATED OR OBVIOUS8

 A. Ground 1: the '212 Patent, Voswinckel JESC, and Voswinckel JAHA Fail to Render Claims 1-8 Obvious10

 1. Petitioner Has Not Established That Voswinckel JAHA And Voswinckel JESC Were Publicly Accessible Prior Art Before The Priority Date.....11

 2. None of the identified references teaches a single event dose of 15 micrograms to 90 micrograms in 1 to 3 breaths18

 3. A POSA would not have a reasonable expectation of success in combining the '212 patent, Voswinckel JESC and JAHA or have been motivated to combine them.....23

 B. Ground 2: the '212 Patent and Voswinckel JESC Fail to Render Claims 1-8 Obvious38

 C. Grounds 3-6 Fail Because Each Ground Relies On Publications That Petitioner Has Failed to Establish Are Prior Art.....44

 1. Ghofrani46

 2. Voswinckel 2006.....51

V. OBJECTIVE INDICIA OF NONOBVIOUSNESS.....55

 A. Unexpected Results55

 B. Copying57

 C. Long-Felt Unmet Need.....61

VI. CONCLUSION63

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>Acceleration Bay, LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc.</i> , 908 F.3d 765 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	12, 13, 14, 15, 18
<i>In re Aller</i> , 220 F.2d 240 (CCPA 1955)	55
<i>Allergan, Inc. v. Apotex Inc.</i> , 754 F.3d 952 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	45, 50, 54
<i>Blue Calypso, LLC v. Groupon, Inc.</i> , 815 F.3d 1331 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	11, 12, 18, 27
<i>Cellco Partnership v. Bridge and Post, Inc.</i> , IPR2018-00054, paper 40, 20 (PTAB Apr. 15, 2019).....	45, 50
<i>In re Cronyn</i> , 890 F.2d 1158 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	27
<i>CSL Behring LLC v. Bioverative Therapeutics Inc.</i> , IPR2018-01313, paper 10, 11 (PTAB Jan. 9, 2019).....	52
<i>E.I. DuPont de Nemours & Company v. Synvina C.V.</i> , 904 F.3d 996 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	55
<i>In re Geisler</i> , 116 F.3d 1465 (Fed. Cir. 1997)	55
<i>In re Katz</i> , 687 F.2d 450 (CCPA 1982)	45, 48, 49, 52
<i>In re Klopfenstein</i> , 380 F.3d 1345 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	12
<i>Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. Int’l Trade Comm’n</i> , 545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	12
<i>Lacks Industries, Inc. v. McKechnie Vehicle Components USA, Inc.</i> 322 F.3d 1335 (Fed. Cir. 2003)	44

Liqwd, Inc. v. L’Oreal USA, Inc.,
941 F.3d 1133 (Fed. Cir. 2019)57, 58

In re Lister,
583 F.3d 1307 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 15

Ormco Corp. v. Align Technology, Inc.,
463 F.3d 1299 (Fed. Cir. 2006)55

Proctor & Gamble Co. v. Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.,
566 F.3d 989 (Fed. Cir. 2009)61

Trans Ova Genetics, LC v. XY, LLC,
IPR2018-00250, paper 35 (PTAB Jun. 26, 2019)45, 50

Federal Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 102(a)10, 44, 45, 50

35 U.S.C. § 316I.....8

Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 42.1088

Other Authorities

IPR2017-01621 and -0162247, 48

IPR2017-01622, Paper 949, 50

MPEP § 2132.0145

PubMed, *available at* <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/> (last visited Nov. 1,
2021) 16

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit	Description
EX2001	Declaration of Dr. Aaron Waxman
EX2002	Dr. Waxman's <i>curriculum vitae</i>
EX2003	Declaration of Dr. Werner Seeger
EX2004	Declaration of Dr. Hossein A. Ghofrani
EX2005	Declaration of Dr. Frank Reichenberger
EX2006	Declaration of Dr. Friedrich Grimminger
EX2007	Tyvaso Orange Book listing
EX2008	Hill, N., 2005, <i>Therapeutic Options for the Treatment of Pulmonary Hypertension</i> , Medscape Pulmonary Medicine 9(2).
EX2009	Substantive Submission filed in 12/591,200 (Mar. 9, 2015)
EX2010	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-1 (public docket).
EX2011	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-11 (public docket).
EX2012	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-16 (public docket).
EX2013	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), unnumbered docket entry dated 7/30/2020
EX2014	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-20 (public docket)(excerpted).
EX2015	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-29 (public docket).
EX2016	<i>United Therapeutics Corporation v. Liquidia Technologies, Inc.</i> , Case No. 1:20-cv-00755-RGA-JLH (D. Del.), ECF-45 (public docket).

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.