UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTEL CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

UNM RAINFOREST INNOVATIONS,

Patent Owner

INTER PARTES REVIEW OF
U.S. PATENT NO. 8,265,096 B2

PTAB Case No. IPR2020-01576

DECLARATION OF DR. ROBERT AKL, D.Sc.
Ex. 1002

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS 3

III. MATERIALS RELIED UPON 8

IV. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS 10

V. LEGAL STANDARDS 11

A. Legal Standards for Prior Art 11

B. Legal Standard for Priority Date 13

C. Legal Standard for Anticipation 13

D. Legal Standard of Obviousness 15

VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 20

VII. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART 22

VIII. BACKGROUND ON THE STATE OF THE ART 23

A. Overview of Cellular Communication Systems 23

B. Overview of Broadband Wireless Communication Systems 26

1. First-Generation Broadband Systems 27

2. Second-Generation Broadband Systems and OFDM 28

C. Overview of 802.16/WiMAX 29

1. History of 802.16 30

2. Frame Structure of 802.16 33

3. OFDM in 802.16 37

4. OFDMA in 802.16 40

D. 802.16/WiMAX and Mobility 41

IX. THE CHALLENGED ’096 PATENT 45

A. Background and ’096 Patent Specification 45

B. Overview of the ’096 Patent Prosecution History 46

X. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART REFERENCES 48

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

A. Overview of "Talukdar" (Ex. 1012).....48
B. Overview of "Li" (Ex. 1016).....51
C. Overview of Nystrom (Ex. 1017).....53
XI. SPECIFIC GROUNDS OF CHALLENGE.....55
A. Ground 1: Claims 1-4 and 6-7 were rendered obvious by Talukdar in View of Li.....56
1. Claim 1.....56
a) 1[pre]: "A method of constructing a frame structure for data transmission, the method comprising".....56
b) 1[a]: "generating a first section comprising data configured in a first format compatible with a first communication system using symbols" 59
c) 1[b]: "generating a second section following the first section, the second section comprising data configured in a second format compatible with a second communication system using symbols, wherein the first communication system's symbols and the second communication system's symbols co-exist in one transmission scheme".....66
d) 1[c]: "and wherein: the second format is compatible with the second communication system configured to support higher mobility than the first communication system, wherein each symbol in the second communication system has a shorter symbol period than that in the first communication system" 73

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

e) 1[d]: “generating at least one non-data section containing information describing an aspect of data in at least one of the first section and the second section” 88
f) 1[e]: “combining the first section, the second section and the at least one non-data section to form the frame structure” 93
2. Claim 2 94
3. Claim 3 96
4. Claim 4 98
5. Claim 6 100
6. Claim 7 101
B. Ground 2: Talukdar and Nystrom Rendered Claim 8 Obvious 103
1. 8[c]: “and wherein the second communication system has pilot symbols that are denser than those in the first communication system” 103
XII. SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS 112
XIII. CONCLUSION 112

APPENDIX A (Curriculum Vitae)

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Robert Akl, and I have been retained by counsel for Petitioner Intel Corporation ("Intel" or "Petitioner") as an expert witness to provide assistance regarding U.S. Patent No. 8,265,096 ("the '096 Patent"). Specifically, I have been asked to consider the validity of claims 1-4 and 6-8 of the '096 Patent (the "Challenged Claims") in view of prior art, anticipation and obviousness considerations, and understanding of a person of ordinary skill in the art ("POSITA") as it relates to the '096 Patent. I have personal knowledge of the facts and opinions set forth in this declaration, and believe them to be true. If called upon to do so, I would testify competently thereto.

2. I am being compensated for my time at my standard consulting rate of $695 per hour. I am also being reimbursed for expenses that I incur during the course of this work. My compensation is not contingent upon the results of my study, the substance of my opinions, or the outcome of any proceeding involving the challenged claims. I have no financial interest in the outcome of this matter or on the pending litigation between Petitioner and Patent Owner.

3. My opinions are based on my years of education, research and experience, as well as my investigation and study of relevant materials, including those cited herein.

4. I may rely upon these materials, my knowledge and experience, and/or

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.