

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

WACO DIVISION

MV3 PARTNERS, LLC

*
*
*
*
*

VS.

CIVIL ACTION NO. W-18-CV-308

ROKU, INC.

July 19, 2019

BEFORE THE HONORABLE ALAN D ALBRIGHT, JUDGE PRESIDING
MARKMAN HEARING

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff:

J. Mark Mann, Esq.
Andy W. Tindel, Esq.
Mann Tindel Thompson
300 W. Main St.
Henderson, TX 75652

Jonathan K. Waldrop, Esq.
Rodney R. Miller, Esq.
Daniel C. Miller, Esq.
Kasowitz Benson Torres LLP
1349 West Peachtree Street N.W.
Suite 1500
Atlanta, GA 30309

Craig D. Cherry, Esq.
Haley & Olson, P.C.
100 N Ritchie Road, Suite 200
Waco, TX 76712

For the Defendant:

Richard D. Milvenan, Esq.
McGinnis Lochridge and Kilgore
600 Congress Avenue, Suite 2100
Austin, TX 78701

Alexander J. Hadjis, Esq.
Lisa M. Mandrusiak, Esq.
Michael D. West, Esq.
Oblon, McClelland, Maier &
Neustadt, LLP
1940 Duke Street, 11th Floor
Alexandria, VA 22314

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Court Reporter: Kristie M. Davis
United States District Court
PO Box 20994
Waco, Texas 76702-0994

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography, transcript
produced by computer-aided transcription.

1 (July 19, 2019, 9:20 a.m.).

2 THE BAILIFF: All rise.

3 THE COURT: Good morning, everyone. Thank you. You may
4 be seated.

5 DEPUTY CLERK: Court calls Waco Case 18-CV-308, MV3
6 Partners, LLC vs. Roku, Inc. for Markman hearing.

7 THE COURT: I apologize for the confusion on the time when
8 we were getting started this morning.

9 Am I on?

10 DEPUTY CLERK: Yeah. It's just not picking up very well.

11 THE COURT: I'm pretty sure that if you need any evidence
12 that the federal government goes with the low bidder on
13 everything when they're building...

14 At any rate, good morning everyone. If counsel for
15 plaintiff would stand up and introduce themselves and then same
16 for the defendant.

17 Mr. Mann?

18 MR. MANN: Thank you, Your Honor. Good morning. Mark
19 Mann for the plaintiffs, Your Honor, and my colleagues with me
20 today are John Waldrop, Andy Tindel, Dan Miller, Rodney Miller,
21 Craig Cherry, and then also in the gallery, Your Honor, we have
22 Wayne Barr who is the general counsel for MV3 here and Dr. Dan
23 Schoenfeld who is our expert for tutorial.

24 THE COURT: Okay. Well, I appreciate your client being
25 here. I think that's always a great thing when that happens.

1 And Mr. Milvenan?

2 MR. MILVENAN: Thank you, Your Honor. Our lineup today
3 includes myself Rick Milvenan from McGinnis Lochridge. I'm
4 joined by Alex Hadjis and Lisa Mandrusiak and Michael West who
5 are all from the Oblon firm in Alexandria, Virginia. Our
6 client is here. That's Joe Hollinger. He's Roku's vice
7 president of litigation and intellectual property and we're
8 also joined by our expert witness Dr. Robert Akl.

9 THE COURT: Very good. Again I appreciate the clients who
10 take the time to be here. I think that's a great thing.

11 Do we -- Mr. Mann, I'll call on you first. Who is
12 primarily going to be speaking just so I have a cheat sheet?

13 MR. MANN: Your Honor, we're going to have -- John Waldrop
14 will direct our tutorial if that's okay. And we planned on
15 doing it question and answer with the expert talking a lot more
16 than the lawyer.

17 THE COURT: Okay.

18 MR. MANN: And then Dan Miller and Rodney Miller will be
19 splitting time doing the terms.

20 THE COURT: I like it when more than one lawyer has the
21 same last name.

22 (Laughter.)

23 THE COURT: My chance of getting it wrong goes down a
24 little bit.

25 MR. MANN: That's why we lined it up this way, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: Wasn't there a movie where they show up and
2 everyone has the same last name?

3 MR. MANN: It was...

4 THE COURT: Men in Black or --

5 MR. MANN: Schwarzenegger and I forgot who was on the
6 other side. Danny DeVito.

7 THE COURT: I think it'd be great if everyone just had the
8 same last name and I could --

9 MR. MANN: I think that's how -- there was a boxer from
10 Marshall who all his kids -- he named them all -- all of them
11 had the same name George Foreman.

12 So, anyway, and then Dr. Schoenfeld will be doing our
13 tutorial.

14 THE COURT: Very good.

15 MR. MILVENAN: Your Honor, in accordance with your
16 suggestions back in February in this case I'm going to
17 introduce Dr. Akl but then we were going to let him just not
18 proceed in Q and A fashion but just go through the slide show
19 to move things along.

20 THE COURT: Well, I'll miss getting to hear your voice,
21 but however you want to do it will be fine with me.

22 MR. MILVENAN: Thank you. And then in terms of the
23 Markman presentation -- and I guess we'll go by their -- so
24 that we can all go by the same name, Alex Milvenan, Lisa
25 Milvenan and myself will all handle different aspects of that.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.