

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

APPLE INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

KOSS CORPORATION,  
Patent Owner.

---

IPR2021-00255  
U.S. Patent No. 10,298,451

---

**PATENT OWNER SUR-REPLY**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION .....1

II. THE LIMITED NETWORK ACCESS PROVIDED IN PETITIONER’S  
EXAMPLE SCENARIOS IS INCONSISTENT WITH PETITIONER’S  
BROWN-SCHERZER COMBINATION .....3

    A. Petitioner’s Brown-Scherzer Combination .....4

    B. Petitioner’s Attempt to Deflect the Problems with the Brown-  
Scherzer Combination is Unpersuasive.....6

III. PETITIONER’S ATTEMPTS TO DISPEL EVIDENCE OF HINDSIGHT  
ARE FACTUALLY AND LEGALLY INSUFFICIENT .....10

    A. Cooperstock’s Direct Testimony Reiterates A Hindsight-Driven  
Approach .....10

    B. Petitioner’s New “Predictability” Observations Fail to Address the  
(Alleged) Predictability of the Brown-Scherzer Combination.....12

        1. First Example Scenario .....14

        2. Second Example Scenario.....15

IV. A POSITA WOULD NOT IMPLEMENT PETITIONER’S BROWN-  
SCHERZER COMBINATION .....17

    A. Scherzer’s User Contribution Account Functionality is Not  
Optional .....17

    B. Exclusion of Scherzer’s User Contribution Account Functionality  
Is Not Fair and Equitable.....19

V. COOPERSTOCK’S TESTIMONY IS INCONSISTENT AND SHOULD NOT  
BE AFFORDED ANY WEIGHT .....20

VI. PETITIONER’S MISCHARACTERIZATIONS OF PATENT OWNER’S  
ARGUMENTS AND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE ON SCHERZER SHOULD  
BE IGNORED .....22

VII. COMMERCIAL SUCCESS OF HOMEPOD PRODUCTS CONFIRMS  
NON-OBVIOUSNESS OF THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS .....24

A. Petitioner Provided No Evidence Refuting the HomePod Products  
Possessing All Elements of the Challenged Claims.....24

B. Challenged Claims Are Coextensive With HomePod Products .....24

C. Patent Owner Showed That Commercial Success of the HomePod  
Products Is a Direct Result of Practicing the Challenged Claims .....26

VIII. CONCLUSION .....28

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>Chemours Co. v. Daikan Indus., Ltd.</i> , 4 F.4th 1370 (Fed. Cir. 2021) .....	26
<i>Facebook, Inc. v. Sound View Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2017-01003, Paper 14, 11 (PTAB Sep. 1, 2017).....	22
<i>FOX Factory, Inc. v. SRAM LLC</i> , 944 F.3d 1366 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	24, 25, 26
<i>Goodyear Tire &amp; Rubber Co. v. Ray-O-Vac Co.</i> , 321 U.S. 275 (1944).....	28
<i>KCJ Corp. v. Kinetic Concepts, Inc.</i> , 223 F.3d 1351 (Fed. Cir. 2000) .....	25
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 US 398 (2006).....	13
<i>In re NTP, Inc.</i> , 654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011) .....	11
<i>In re Nuvasive, Inc.</i> , 842 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2016) .....	24
<i>W.L. Gore &amp; Assoc., Inc. v. Garlock, Inc.</i> , 721 F.2d 1540, 220 USPQ 303 (Fed. Cir. 1983).....	17

**EXHIBIT LISTING**

<b>EXHIBIT NO.</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION</b>
KOSS-2001	Sample Order Governing Proceedings - Patent Case, November 5, 2020, Judge Albright, United States District Court for the Western District of Texas, Waco Division
KOSS-2002	<i>Markman</i> Hearing, <i>MV3 Partners, LLC v. Roku, Inc.</i> , Case No. W-18-cv-308, Dkt. No. 83 (W. D. Tex. July 19, 2019)
KOSS-2003	E. Cunningham et al., “Fauci predicts vaccine ‘open season’ by April,” <i>Washington Post</i> , Feb. 11, 2021 ( <a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/nation/2021/02/11/coronavirus-covid-live-updates-us/">www.washingtonpost.com/nation/2021/02/11/coronavirus-covid-live-updates-us/</a> ) (last accessed February 25, 2021)
KOSS-2004	Docket Report, <i>Koss Corp. v. Apple Inc.</i> , Case No. 6:20-cv-00665-ADA (W.D. Tex.) (as of March 2, 2021)
KOSS-2005	Complaint, <i>Apple Inc. v. Koss Corporation</i> , Case No. 5:20-cv-05504, Dkt. No. 1 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 7, 2020)
KOSS-2006	Notice of Trial Procedures, <i>VLSI Tech. LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , Case No. 6:21-cv-00057-ADA, Dkt. No. 421 (W.D. Tex. February 10, 2021)
KOSS-2007	R. Thebault, “Fauci says U.S. vaccinations to increase in spring as Biden administration nears dose goal,” <i>Washington Post</i> , Feb. 7, 2021 ( <a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/health/2021/02/07/fauci-vaccination-increase/">www.washingtonpost.com/health/2021/02/07/fauci-vaccination-increase/</a> ) (last accessed February 25, 2021)
KOSS-2008	K. Buehler, “WDTX Judge Albright Touts Revamped Courtroom Tech,” IPLAW360, February 26, 2021.
KOSS-2009	Email dated March 8, 2021 from Michael Pieja to Darlene Ghavimi, including attachment that is letter dated March 6, 2021 Michael Pieja to Darlene Ghavimi

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.