

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

GOOGLE LLC,  
Petitioner

v.

ECOFACITOR, INC.,  
Patent Owner

---

IPR2021-00054  
Patent No. 10,534,382

---

DECLARATION OF JOHN A. PALMER, Ph.D.  
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 1.68

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	BACKGROUND .....	2
II.	QUALIFICATIONS .....	2
III.	BACKGROUND OF THE ‘382 PATENT.....	5
IV.	LEGAL PRINCIPLES .....	11
V.	LEVEL OF A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART (POSITA) .....	16
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION PRINCIPLES .....	18
VII.	REBUTTAL TO ALLEGATIONS REGARDING OBVIOUSNESS.....	23
A.	Introduction to Geadelmann Prior Art Reference .....	26
B.	Introduction to Ehlers ‘330 Prior Art Reference.....	28
VIII.	GROUND 1: .....	29
A.	The Combination of Geadelmann and Ehlers ‘330 Does Not Render Claims 1-20 Unpatentable .....	29
1.	No Processor in Geadelmann Performs All of the Functions Recited in Claims 1 and 17 .....	31
2.	The Memory is Not Located Remotely From the First Processor .....	33
3.	Petitioner Does Not Demonstrate that Claim Elements [1e] and [1m] Is Met.....	39
B.	Claims 2-16 and 18-20 Are Also Not Unpatentable .....	43

Case Nos. IPR2021-00054  
U.S. Patent No. 10,534,382

C.	The Combination of Geadelmann and Ehlers ‘330 Does Not Render Claim 12 Unpatentable .....	43
IX.	DECLARATION .....	47

**Exhibits**

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	Scheduling Order in <i>EcoFactor, Inc. v. Google LLC</i> , W.D. Tex. Case No. 20-cv-00075-ADA (July 16, 2020).
2002	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. A-27
2003	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-25
2004	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-26
2005	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-27
2006	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-29
2007	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-30
2008	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-32
2009	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-33
2010	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-34
2011	Google's W.D. Tex. Invalidation Contentions Ex. B-36
2012	Order Denying Google's Motion to Transfer in <i>EcoFactor, Inc. v. Google LLC</i> , Case No. 6:20-cv-00075-ADA (W.D. Tex. 2020).
2013	Expert Declaration of John A. Palmer
2014	Curriculum Vitae of John A. Palmer
2015	Rough Transcript of the Deposition of Rajendra Shah (August 11, 2021)

## I. BACKGROUND

1. I have been retained as an expert in this case by EcoFactor, Inc. (“EcoFactor”). I have been asked to consider and opine on issues of validity regarding U.S. Patent No. 10,534,382 (“‘382 Patent”). More specifically, my opinions focus on the Petition for *Inter Partes* Review (“IPR”) on the ‘382 Patent, along with the expert declaration of Rajendra Shah and all other materials referenced or cited in the IPR or Mr. Shah’s declaration.

2. In forming my opinions, I have reviewed, considered, and had access to the patent specifications and claims, their prosecution histories, the proposed claim constructions, the Petition, the Shah declaration, and documents cited in the Petition and the Shah declaration. I have also relied on my professional and academic experience. I reserve the right to consider additional materials as I become aware of them and to revise my opinions accordingly.

## II. QUALIFICATIONS

3. My qualifications for forming the opinions set forth in this Declaration are summarized here and explained in more detail in my curriculum vitae, which is attached as Exhibit 2014.

4. As indicated therein, I have a Bachelor of Science degree in Electrical Engineering with a power option from Brigham Young University (1991), and Masters (1992) and Doctoral (1996) degrees in Electric Power Engineering from Rensselaer

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.