

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES CORPORATION and
EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES LLC,
Petitioners,

v.

COLIBRI HEART VALVE LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-01649

Patent 9,125,739

Before the Honorable ERICA A. FRANKLIN, JAMES A. TARTAL,
and ERIC C. JESCHKE,
Administrative Patent Judges.

PETITIONERS' REPLY

IN SUPPORT OF *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF

U.S. PATENT NO. 9,125,739

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. GROUND 2-5 OF THE PETITION EACH RENDER CLAIMS 1-5 OF THE '739 UNPATENTABLE	1
A. Grounds 2-5: Bessler Teaches Nearly All Claimed Limitations of the '739 and Would Be Relied Upon by a POSITA as a Base Reference in an Obviousness Analysis	1
B. Grounds 2-5: It Would Have Been Obvious to Modify Bessler to Include a Trumpet-Like Configuration in View of the Teachings of Leonhardt and Teitelbaum	4
C. Grounds 2-5: Under Any Interpretation of "Onto the Pusher Member," It Would Have Been Obvious to Modify the Delivery System of Bessler to Include a Pusher Member as Claimed	8
D. Grounds 4-5: Claim 5's "Controlled Release Mechanism" Limitation is Obvious.....	15
II. GROUND 1: PANIAGUA IS PRIOR ART AND ANTICIPATES CLAIMS 1-5	17
A. In the '739, "the leaflet portion of the valve itself" must be "formed from a single piece of biocompatible material" in order to attain "the novel and improved qualities of the present invention"	17
III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	19
A. "wherein the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed <i>onto</i> the pusher member"	19
B. "flares at both ends in a trumpet-like configuration" & "valve means"	23
IV. IN JANUARY 2002, PETITIONERS' EXPERT, DR. GOLDBERG, WAS A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART; PO'S EXPERT, DR. DASI, WAS NOT	24

V. A DECISION BY THE BOARD IS CONSTITUTIONALLY VALID27

VI. CONCLUSION.....27

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**Cases**

<i>Apogee Lighting Holdings, LLC v. Autronic Plastics, Inc.</i> , IPR2020-01024, Paper 11 (PTAB Dec. 1, 2020)	25
<i>Chung v. Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.</i> , No. EP-09-330-FM, 2011 WL 6967991 (W.D. Tex. Dec. 20, 2011)	21, 22
<i>ClassCo, Inc. v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 838 F.3d 1214 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	16
<i>Edwards Lifesciences Corp. v. Boston Scientific SciMed, Inc.</i> , IPR2017-00060, Paper 64 (PTAB Mar. 23, 2018)	24
<i>In re Antor Media Corp.</i> , 689 F.3d 1282 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	7
<i>In re Etter</i> , 756 F.2d 852 (Fed. Cir. 1985)	15
<i>In re Mouttet</i> , 686 F.3d 1322 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	2
<i>In re Nordt Dev. Co.</i> , 881 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	23
<i>Infineum USA L.P. v. Chevron Oronite Co.</i> , 844 F. App'x 297 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	2
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Parallel Networks Licensing, LLC</i> , 715 F. App'x 1013 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	7
<i>Neutrino Dev. Corp. v. Sonosite, Inc.</i> , 410 F. Supp. 2d 529 (S.D. Tex. 2006)	25, 26
<i>Norgren Inc. v. ITC</i> , 699 F.3d 1317 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	25
<i>Rivera v. ITC</i> , 857 F.3d 1315 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	19

Schott Gemtron Corp. v. SSW Holding Company, Inc.,
IPR2013-00358, Paper No. 106 (PTAB Aug. 20, 2014).....26

Wellman, Inc. v. Eastman Chem. Co.,
642 F.3d 1355 (Fed. Cir. 2011)23

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.