

Filed: June 11, 2021

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES CORPORATION AND
EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES LLC,

PETITIONERS,

V.

COLIBRI HEART VALVE LLC,

PATENT OWNER.

Case No. IPR2020-01649

U.S. Patent No. 9,125,739

**PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.120**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL	2
III.	OVERVIEW OF THE '739 INVENTION.....	4
IV.	CHALLENGED CLAIMS	7
V.	PROSECUTION HISTORY	9
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	12
A.	“flares at both ends in a trumpet-like configuration” (claim 1)	12
B.	“wherein the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed <i>onto</i> the pusher member” (claim 1).....	12
C.	“valve means” (claim 1)	19
VII.	GROUND 1: PANIAGUA IS NOT PRIOR ART TO THE '739 PATENT AND SO DOES NOT ANTICIPATE THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	19
VIII.	FOUNDATIONS 2-5: THE '739 PATENT WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN OBVIOUS TO A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART IN VIEW OF BESSLER, KLINT, AND TEITELBAUM OR LEONHARDT	24
A.	Foundations 2-5: A POSA Would Not Have Started with Bessler.....	24
B.	Foundations 2-3: Bessler in View of Leonhardt or Teitelbaum Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	30
1.	Bessler Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	32
2.	Bessler in View of Leonhardt Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	34

3.	Bessler in View of Teitelbaum Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	39
C.	Grounds 4-5: Bessler in View of Klint and Teitelbaum or Leonhardt Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	40
1.	Klint Does Not Disclose that “the prosthetic heart valve is collapsed onto the pusher member”	40
2.	A POSA Would Not Have Combined Bessler’s Heart Valve Device with Klint’s Pusher Member	45
D.	Grounds 2-5: A POSA Would Not Have Combined Bessler with Teitelbaum or Leonhardt to Achieve a “stent...that flares at both ends in a trumpet-like configuration”	51
1.	A POSA Would Not Have Combined Bessler with Teitelbaum	53
2.	A POSA Would Not Have Combined Bessler with Leonhardt	59
3.	A POSA Would Not Have Combined Bessler and Klint with Teitelbaum or Leonhardt	64
E.	Grounds 4-5: Bessler in View of Klint and Teitelbaum and/or Leonhardt Does Not Disclose Claim 5’s “pusher member [that] includes a controlled release mechanism that can be activated”	65
IX.	ADJUDICATION OF THE CHALLENGED PATENTS MAY VIOLATE THE U.S. CONSTITUTION.....	66
X.	CONCLUSION.....	67

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Abbott Labs. v. Dey, L.P.</i> , 287 F.3d 1097, 62 USPQ2d 1545 (Fed. Cir. 2002)	18
<i>Apple Inc. v. Uniloc Luxembourg S.A.</i> , IPR2017-02041 (PTAB Mar. 8, 2018) (Paper 10).....	31, 51
<i>Aro Mfg. Co., Inc. v. Convertible Top Replacement Co.</i> , 365 U.S. 336 (1961).....	23
<i>e.Digital Corp. v. Futurewei Techs., Inc.</i> , 772 F.3d 723 (Fed. Cir. 2014).....	17, 18
<i>Envtl. Designs, Ltd. v. Union Oil Co. of California</i> , 713 F.2d 693 (Fed. Cir. 1983).....	3, 4
<i>G.B.T. Inc. v. Wallelex Microelectronics Ltd.</i> , IPR2018-00326 (PTAB June 25, 2019) (Paper 60)	27
<i>Gillette Co. v. Energizer Holdings, Inc.</i> , 405 F.3d 1367 (Fed. Cir. 2005).....	23
<i>Goldenberg v. Cytogen, Inc.</i> , 373 F.3d 1158 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	15, 18
<i>Housey Pharms., Inc. v. Astrazeneca UK Ltd.</i> , 366 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	23
<i>In re Nordt Dev. Co., LLC</i> , 881 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	22
<i>Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs</i> , 512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008).....	53
<i>Liebel-Flarsheim Co. v. Medrad, Inc.</i> , 358 F.3d 898 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	21, 23
<i>Neutrino Dev. Corp. v. Sonosite, Inc.</i> , 410 F. Supp. 2d 529 (S.D. Tex. 2006)	4

<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Ranbaxy Labs. Ltd.</i> , 457 F.3d 1284 (Fed. Cir. 2006).....	18
<i>Praxair, Inc. v. ATMI, Inc.</i> , 543 F.3d 1306 (Fed. Cir. 2008).....	22
<i>Texas Digital Sys., Inc. v. Telegenix, Inc.</i> , 308 F.3d 1193 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....	17
<i>Texas Instruments, Inc. v. U.S. Int’l Trade Comm’n</i> , 805 F.2d 1558 (Fed. Cir.1986).....	21
<i>U.S. v. Arthrex, Inc., et al.</i> , No. 19-1434, <i>cert. granted</i> , (Oct. 13, 2020)	67
<i>Vanguard Prods. Corp. v. Parker Hannifin Corp.</i> , 234 F.3d 1370 (Fed. Cir. 2000).....	22
<i>Vas-Cath Inc. v. Mahurkar</i> , 935 F.2d 1555 (Fed. Cir. 1991).....	23
<i>Winner Int’l Royalty Corp. v. Wang</i> , 202 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2000).....	31, 51

Rules

Manual of Patent Examining Procedure § 2113	22
---	----

Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b)	12
37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a).....	27

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.