

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PHILIP MORRIS PRODUCTS, S.A.,
Petitioner

v.

RAI STRATEGIC HOLDINGS, INC.,
Patent Owner

Patent No. 9,901,123

Case IPR2020-01602

PATENT OWNER SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iii

LIST OF PATENT OWNER EXHIBITS.....v

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION3

III. HON, BROOKS, AND WHITTEMORE DO NOT RENDER CLAIMS 1, 2, 5, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 18, 21, AND 23-26 OBVIOUS (GROUND 1).....5

A. Claims 1 and 15: “the mixture ... can be wicked into contact with the electrical resistance heater and volatilized”5

1. Hon Does Not Disclose That “the mixture ... can be wicked into contact with the electrical resistance heater and volatilized”5

a) Hon Does Not Disclose That Its Liquid Mixture Comes Into Contact With Its Heating Element5

b) Hon’s Liquid Mixture Is Not Transferred To Hon’s Heating Element By Wicking.....8

2. A POSA Would Not Have Combined Hon With Whittemore.....10

a) The Prior Proceedings Do Not Help Petitioner’s Case Here10

b) The Board Correctly Determined That Petitioner Has Not Established Why A POSA Would Have Attempted To Modify Hon With Whittemore.....12

B. Claims 1 and 15: “a puff-actuated controller within the tubular outer housing and adapted for regulating current flow through the electrical resistance heater during draw”16

1. Hon Does Not Disclose The Claimed Controller16

2. Petitioner Has Not Demonstrated That It Would Have Been Obvious To Modify Hon With Brooks.....18

C. Petitioner Cannot Show That A Number Of Dependent Claims Would Have Been Obvious For Additional Reasons.....19

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
1. Claims 11 and 23: “wherein the cartridge is electrically conductive”	19
2. Claims 14 and 24: “wherein the absorbent fibrous material is in contact with the electrical resistance heater”	21
IV. GROUND 2 (CLAIMS 3, 4, 13, 16, 17) AND GROUND 3 (CLAIMS 6, 19)	21
V. CONCLUSION.....	22

..

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES

Denso Corp. v. Beacon Navigation GmbH,
IPR2013-00027, Paper 16 (PTAB June 24, 2013)7

Dippin’ Dots, Inc. v. Mosey,
476 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2007)4

Gracernote, Inc. v. Iceberg Indus., LLC,
IPR2013-00551, Paper 6 (PTAB Feb. 28, 2014).....7

In re Hughes,
345 F.2d 184 (CCPA 1965)6

In re Robertson,
169 F.3d 743 (Fed. Cir. 1999)7

In re Varma,
816 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2016)4

Intel Corp. v. Qualcomm, Inc.,
IPR2018-01261, Paper 30 (PTAB Jan. 9, 2020)11

MEHL/Biophile Int’l Corp. v Milgraum,
192 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 1999)7

Otsuka Pharm. Co., v. Sandoz, Inc.,
678 F.3d 1280 (Fed. Cir. 2012)13

R.J. Reynolds Vapor Co. v. Fontem Holdings I B.V.,
IPR2016-01268, Paper 63 (PTAB Dec. 19, 2017)10, 11, 12

Raytheon Co. v. Sony Corp.,
727 F. App’x. 662 (Fed. Cir. 2018)4

...

Spectrum Int’l, Inc. v. Sterilite Corp.,
164 F.3d 1372 (Fed. Cir. 1998)4

Ultratec, Inc. v. CaptionCall, LLC,
872 F.3d 1267 (Fed. Cir. 2017) 11

Univ. of Strathclyde v. Clear-Vu Lighting LLC,
No. 2020-2243, 2021 WL 5114660 (Fed. Cir. Nov. 4, 2021)13

VMR Prods. LLC v. Fontem Holdings I B.V.,
IPR2015-00859, Paper 9 (PTAB Sept. 16, 2015).....10

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.