

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.

Petitioner,

v.

MASIMO CORPORATION,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-01538
U.S. Patent 10,588,554

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	GROUND 1 ESTABLISHES OBVIOUSNESS	1
A.	Ohsaki does not describe, much less require, its convex translucent board 8 to be “rectangular” in shape.....	7
B.	A POSITA would have recognized the benefits of Ohsaki’s teachings when applied to Mendelson-799’s sensor, at virtually any measurement location.....	10
C.	Adding a convex cover to Mendelson-799 as taught by Ohsaki enhances the sensor’s light-gathering ability.	13
1.	Patent Owner ignores the behavior of scattered light in relation to reflectance-type pulse sensors and oximeters.	13
2.	A POSITA would have implemented the sensor resulting from the combination of Mendelson-799 and Ohsaki to prevent air gaps between the skin and the detectors.....	17
D.	A POSITA would have found the advantages of using a convex cover to outweigh the slight possibility of scratching the cover	19
E.	A POSITA would have added an opaque layer to the combined sensor of Mendelson-799 and Ohsaki based on the teachings of Schulz.....	19
1.	A POSITA would have modified the combined sensor of Mendelson-799 and Ohsaki to guard against saturation based on Schulz’s teachings	20
2.	Schulz’s teachings are applicable to the combined sensor of Mendelson-799 and Ohsaki.....	22
3.	A POSITA would have understood Schulz’s teachings to render obvious a corresponding window for each of at least four detectors.....	23
4.	A POSITA would have understood Schulz’s window to restrict the amount of ambient light reaching the corresponding detector.....	24
F.	A POSITA would have enabled the combined sensor of Mendelson-799, Ohsaki, and Schulz to communicate wirelessly with a handheld computing device, based on the teachings of Mendelson-2006	26
G.	A POSITA would have expected success in performing the combination	28
H.	The challenged dependent claims are rendered obvious by Mendelson-799, Ohsaki, Schulz, and Mendelson-2006.	29

III. CONCLUSION.....31

EXHIBITS

APPLE-1001	US Patent No. 10,588,554
APPLE-1002	File History for U.S. Patent No. 10,588,554
APPLE-1003	Declaration of Dr. Kenny
APPLE-1004	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Kenny
APPLE-1005	<i>Masimo Corporation, et al. v. Apple Inc.</i> , Complaint, Civil Action No. 8:20-cv-00048 (C.D. Cal.)
APPLE-1006	US Pub. No. 2002/0188210 (“Aizawa”)
APPLE-1007	JP Pub. No. 2006/296564 (“Inokawa”)
APPLE-1008	Certified English Translation of Inokawa and Translator’s Declaration
APPLE-1009	US Pub. No. 2001/0056243 (“Ohsaki”)
APPLE-1010	“A Wearable Reflectance Pulse Oximeter for Remote Physiological Monitoring,” Y. Mendelson, et al.; Proceedings of the 28th IEEE EMBS Annual International Conference, 2006; pp. 912-915 (“Mendelson-2006”)
APPLE-1011	RESERVED
APPLE-1012	US Patent No. 6,801,799 (“Mendelson ’799”)
APPLE-1013	US Pub. No. 2004/0054291 (“Schulz”)
APPLE-1014-1016	RESERVED
APPLE-1017	“Design and Evaluation of a New Reflectance Pulse Oximeter Sensor,” Y. Mendelson, et al.; Worcester Polytechnic Institute, Biomedical Engineering Program, Worcester, MA 01609;

Association for the Advancement of Medical Instrumentation,
Vol. 22, No. 4, 1988; pp. 167-173 (“Mendelson-1988”)

- APPLE-1018 “Skin Reflectance Pulse Oximetry: In Vivo Measurements from the Forearm and Calf,” Y. Mendelson, et al.; Journal of Clinical Monitoring, vol. 7, No. 1, January 1991 (“Mendelson 1991”)
- APPLE-1019 Design of Pulse Oximeters, J.G. Webster; Institution of Physics Publishing, 1997 (“Webster”)
- APPLE-1020 QuickSpecs; HP iPAQ Pocket PC h4150 Series
- APPLE-1021 How to Do Everything with Windows Mobile, Frank McPherson; McGraw Hill, 2006 (“McPherson”)
- APPLE-1022 Master Visually Windows Mobile 2003, Bill Landon, et al.; Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2004 (“Landon”)
- APPLE-1023 “Stimulating Student Learning with a Novel ‘In-House’ Pulse Oximeter Design,” J. Yao and S. Warren; Proceedings of the 2005 American Society for Engineering Education Annual Conference & Exposition, 2005 (“Yao”)
- APPLE-1024 US Pub. No. 2008/0194932 (“Ayers”)
- APPLE-1025 U.S. Patent No. 7,031,728 (“Beyer”)
- APPLE-1026 US Pub. No. 2007/0145255 (“Nishikawa”)
- APPLE-1027 National Instruments LabVIEW User Manual
- APPLE-1028-1030 RESERVED
- APPLE-1031 Scheduling Order, *Masimo v. Apple et al.*, Case 8:20-cv-00048, Paper 37 (April 17, 2020)
- APPLE-1032 Stipulation by Apple

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.