

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.

Petitioner,

v.

MASIMO CORPORATION,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-01526

U.S. Patent 6,771,994

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	GROUND 1 ESTABLISHES OBVIOUSNESS	1
	A. Diab explicitly discloses removing the scattering medium from its photodetector, which is consistent with the proposed combination	1
	B. Adding the light control film over Diab’s photodetector would reduce the amount of ambient light reaching the photodetector	2
	C. Masimo’s argument regarding the results of the Diab-Benjamin-Melby combination lacking predictability fails	2
III.	GROUND 2 ESTABLISHES OBVIOUSNESS	4
	A. Masimo’s arguments mischaracterize Webster’s disclosure of placing a light filter over the photodetector to minimize the effects of ambient light	4
IV.	GROUND 3 ESTABLISHES OBVIOUSNESS	5
	A. Masimo’s arguments regarding the complexity and price of Fine’s design are irrelevant	5
	B. Fine’s bundles of optical fibers teach or suggest the claimed “plurality of louvers”	6
V.	GROUND 4 ESTABLISHES OBVIOUSNESS	8
	A. Masimo mischaracterizes the proposed combination	8
VI.	CONCLUSION	9

EXHIBITS

APPLE-1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,771,994
APPLE-1002	File History for U.S. Patent No. 6,771,994
APPLE-1003	Declaration of Dr. Anthony
APPLE-1004	Reserved
APPLE-1005	Masimo Corporation, et al. v. Apple Inc., Complaint, Civil Action No. 8:20-cv-00048 (C.D. Cal.)
APPLE-1006	U.S. Patent No. 5,638,818 (“Diab”)
APPLE-1007	U.S. Patent No. 4,015,595 (“Benjamin”)
APPLE-1008	U.S. Patent No. 5,254,388 (“Melby”)
APPLE-1009	WO Pub. No. 1996/41566 (“Fine”)
APPLE-1010	Excerpts from Design of Pulse Oximeters, J.G. Webster; Institution of Physics Publishing, 1997 (“Webster”)
APPLE-1011	Tremper, Pulse Oximetry, Anesthesiology, The Journal of the American Society of Anesthesiologists, Inc., Vol. 70, No. 1 (January 1989) (“APPLE-1011”)
APPLE-1012	Mendelson, Skin Reflectance Pulse Oximetry: In Vivo Measurements from the Forearm and Calf, Journal of Clinical Monitoring, Vol. 7, No. 1 (January 1991) (“APPLE-1012”)
APPLE-1013	Excerpts from Bronzino, The Biomedical Engineering Handbook, CRC Press, Inc. (1995) (“APPLE-1013”)
APPLE-1014	Konig, Reflectance Pulse Oximetry – Principles and Obstetric Application in the Zurich System, Journal of Clinical Monitoring, Vol. 14, No. 6 (August 1998) (“APPLE-1014”)

APPLE-1015	Declaration of Jacob Munford
APPLE-1016 to 1030	Reserved
APPLE-1031	Scheduling Order, Masimo v. Apple et al., Case 8:20-cv-00048, Paper 37 (April 17, 2020)
APPLE-1032	Stipulation by Apple
APPLE-1033	Telephonic Status Conference, Masimo v. Apple et al., Case 8:20-cv-00048, Paper 78 (July 13, 2020)
APPLE-1034	Joseph Guzman, "Fauci says second wave of coronavirus is 'inevitable'", TheHill.com (Apr. 29, 2020), available at: https://thehill.com/changing-america/resilience/natural-disasters/495211-fauci-says-second-wave-of-coronavirus-is
APPLE-1035	"Tracking the coronavirus in Los Angeles County," LATimes.com (Aug. 20, 2020), available at https://www.latimes.com/projects/california-coronavirus-cases-tracking-outbreak/los-angeles-county/
APPLE-1036	Reserved
APPLE-1037	Order Regarding Motion to Stay (Redacted) in Masimo Corporation et al. v. Apple Inc., Case 8:20-cv-00048, October 13, 2020
APPLE-1038	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Vijay Madisetti

I. Introduction

Apple Inc. (“Petitioner” or “Apple”) submits this Reply to Patent Owner’s Response (“POR”) to the Petition for *Inter Partes* Review (“IPR”) of U.S. Patent No. 6,771,994 (“the ’994 patent”) filed by Masimo Corporation (“Patent Owner” or “Masimo”). As demonstrated below with reference to evidence including Dr. Anthony’s testimony, the POR fails to address, much less rebut, positions advanced in the Petition. Accordingly, Apple respectfully submits that the Board should find claim 15 (“the Challenged Claim”) of the ’994 patent unpatentable.

II. Ground 1 Establishes Obviousness

A. Diab explicitly discloses removing the scattering medium from its photodetector, which is consistent with the proposed combination

Masimo argues that a POSITA would have had no reason to perform the combination of Diab, Benjamin, and Melby. *See* POR, 28-33. In particular, Masimo argues that “neither Apple nor the Board explains why a POSITA explicitly seeking to scatter light as the critical teaching of Diab would make modifications to eliminate this core feature and cause the light to be uniform in direction.” *See id.*, 30-31. Masimo argues that this purportedly “critical teaching” of Diab is its “scattering medium...interposed between the” user tissue “and the photodetector,” which the Petition proposes replacing in the combination. *See id.*, 29-31; APPLE-1006, 4:8-10. But Diab explicitly discloses examples in which the scattering medium is “interposed” only “between the light source and the” the user

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.