

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

**MEDTRONIC COREVALVE LLC, EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES
CORPORATION, AND
EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES LLC,**

Petitioner,

v.

COLIBRI HEART VALVE, LLC,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-01454¹

U.S. Patent No. 9,125,739

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

¹ Edwards Lifesciences Corporation and Edwards Lifesciences LLC filed a petition in IPR2021-00775, and have been joined as petitioners in this proceeding.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....1

III. GARRISON RENDERS OBVIOUS CLAIMS 1-5 (GROUND 1).....3

A. Garrison renders obvious “a valve means including...leaflets made of fixed pericardial tissue” [1.3]3

B. Garrison Discloses, and at Minimum Renders Obvious, “the stent member...flares at both ends in a trumpet-like configuration” [1.2]5

1. A POSITA Would Have Known How to Implement Garrison’s Features6

2. A POSITA Would Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success Implementing Garrison’s Features.....10

C. Garrison Discloses or Renders Obvious a “controlled release mechanism that can be activated” (claim 5)13

IV. GARRISON IN FURTHER VIEW OF LEONHARDT RENDERS OBVIOUS CLAIMS 1-5 (GROUND 2)15

A. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Apply Leonhardt’s Teachings to Garrison15

B. Garrison in View of Leonhardt Renders Obvious “the stent member includes a tubular structure away from a central portion that flares at both ends in a trumpet-like configuration” [1.2]18

V. GARRISON (AND GARRISON IN VIEW OF LEONHARDT) IN FURTHER VIEW OF NGUYEN RENDERS OBVIOUS CLAIMS 1-5 (GROUNDS 3-4)18

VI. ANDERSEN IN VIEW OF LIMON, IN FURTHER VIEW OF GABBAY, PHELPS, GARRISON AND/OR NGUYEN (GROUNDS 5-10)19

A. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Apply Limon’s Teachings to Andersen20

B. Andersen, Gabbay, and Nguyen Disclose or Render Obvious “a Valve Means Including Two to Four Individual Leaflets Made of Fixed Pericardial Tissue”24

C. A POSITA Would Have Implemented the Flared Stents of Gabbay or Phelps in Andersen’s Valve Prosthesis25

D. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Apply Limon’s Delivery System Teachings to Andersen’s Prosthesis to Achieve a “Controlled Release Mechanism That Can Be Activated”27

VII. PO MISCHARACTERIZES DR. DRASLER’S TESTIMONY28

VIII. DIRECTOR REVIEW IS AVAILABLE29

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Ex. 1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,125,739 (“739”)
Ex. 1002	Declaration of William J. Drasler, Ph.D. (“Drasler”)
Ex. 1003	File History of U.S. Patent No. 9,125,739
Ex. 1004	Reserved
Ex. 1005	U.S. Patent No. 6,425,916 to Garrison
Ex. 1006	U.S. Patent No. 5,957,949 to Leonhardt
Ex. 1007	Reserved
Ex. 1008	U.S. Patent No. 6,077,295 to Limon
Ex. 1009	U.S. Patent No. 7,025,780 to Gabbay
Ex. 1010	International Patent No. WO 00/15147 to Phelps
Ex. 1011	File History of U.S. Patent 8,900,294
Ex. 1012	International Patent No. WO 98/29057 to Letac
Ex. 1013	U.S. Patent No. 5,840,081 to Andersen
Ex. 1014	Reserved
Ex. 1015	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 09/659,882
Ex. 1016	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 10/887,688
Ex. 1017	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 13/675,665
Ex. 1018	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 10/037,266
Ex. 1019	AneuRX Stent Graft System.pdf available at https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/cdrh_docs/pdf/P990020c.pdf
Ex. 1020	U.S. Patent No. 5,961,549 to Nguyen
Ex. 1021	U.S. Patent No. 5,713,950 to Cox
Ex. 1022	Screenshot of Docket Navigator Time-to-Milestone Report for the United States District Court of the Central District of California
Ex. 1023	Stipulation Regarding IPRs, dated September 1, 2020
Ex. 1024	Declaration of Crena Pacheco
Ex. 1025	Stipulation Regarding IPRs, dated December 22, 2020
Ex. 1026	Jane Doe et al. v. Xavier Becerra et al., No. 8:19-cv-02105, U.S. District Court Docket (C.D. Cal.)

Ex. 1027	Shuthima Pongsai V. Am. Express Co., No. 8:19cv1628, U.S. District Court Docket (C.D. Cal.)
Ex. 1028	C.D. Cal. General Order 20-12 dated September 14, 2020
Ex. 1029	C.D. Cal. General Order 20-15 dated November 25, 2020
Ex. 1030	C.D. Cal. General Order 20-05 dated April 13, 2020
Ex. 1031	C.D. Cal. General Order 20-08 dated May 28, 2020
Ex. 1032	C.D. Cal. General Order 20-09 dated August 6, 2020
Ex. 1033	C.D. Cal. Order of the Chief Judge 20-042 dated March 19, 2020
Ex. 1034	Activation of Continuity of Operations Plan dated December 7, 2020
Ex. 1035	Press Release - Activation of Continuity of Operations Plan dated December 7, 2020
Ex. 1036	Colibri Heart Valve LLC v Medtronic Corevalve LLC, No. 8:20-cv-00847, U.S. District Court Docket (C.D. Cal.)
Ex. 1037	Extension of Continuity of Operations Plan dated January 6, 2021
Ex. 1038	Colibri Heart Valve LLC v Medtronic Corevalve LLC, No. 8:20-cv-00847-DOC-JDE, Dkt. 73, Scheduling Order (C.D. Cal. November 24, 2020)
Ex. 1039	Medtronic, Inc. v. Axonics Modulation Techns., Inc., No. 8:19-cv-02115-DOC-JDE, Dkt. 55, Order Granting Defendant's Motion to Stay Litigation Pending Inter Partes Review (C.D. Cal. May 8, 2020)
Ex. 1040	Declaration of Crena Pacheco
Ex. 1041	Reply Declaration of William J. Drasler, Ph.D. ("DraslerReply")
Ex. 1042	USPTO implementation of an interim Director review process following <i>Arthrex</i> , available at https://www.uspto.gov/patents/patent-trial-and-appeal-board/procedures/uspto-implementation-interim-director-review (last accessed August 24, 2021)
Ex. 1043	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2021/0145572
Ex. 1044	Declaration of Jonathan Bradford

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.