

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
IN AND FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

- - -

THE TRUSTEES OF COLUMBIA	:	CIVIL ACTION
UNIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF	:	
NEW YORK AND QIAGEN	:	
SCIENCES, LLC,	:	
	:	
Plaintiffs,	:	
	:	
vs.	:	
	:	
ILLUMINA, INC.,	:	
	:	
Defendant.	:	NO. 19-1681-CFC

- - -

Wilmington, Delaware
Wednesday, September 2, 2020
9:00 o'clock, a.m.
***Telephone conference

- - -

BEFORE: HONORABLE COLM F. CONNOLLY, U.S.D.C.J.

- - -

APPEARANCES:

MORRIS, NICHOLS, ARSHT & TUNNELL LLP
BY: JACK B. BLUMENFELD, ESQ.

-and-

Valerie J. Gunning
Official Court Reporter

Illumina Ex. 1161

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2
3 VENABLE LLP

4 BY: JOHN D. MURNANE, ESQ.,
5 ROBERT S. SCHWARTZ, ESQ.,
6 JUSTIN J. OLIVER, ESQ. and
7 ZACHARY L. GARRETT, ESQ.
8 (New York, New York)

9
10 Counsel for Plaintiff
11 The Trustees of Columbia University in the
12 City of New York

13 BALLARD SPAHR LLP

14 BY: BETH MOSKOW-SCHNOLL, ESQ.

15
16 -and-

17 BALLARD SPAHR LLP

18 BY: ROBERT R. BARON, JR., ESQ.,
19 SCOTT MARTY, ESQ. and.
20 MARC S. SEGAL, ESQ.
21 (Philadelphia, Pennsylvania)

22 Counsel for Plaintiff
23 Qiagen Sciences, LLC

24 ASHBY & GEDDES

25 BY: STEVEN J. BALICK, ESQ.

-and-

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES (Continued) :

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP
BY: EDWARD R. REINES, ESQ. and
DEREK C. WALTER, ESQ.
(Redwood Shores, California)

Counsel for Defendant

- - -

P R O C E E D I N G S

(The telephone conference was held beginning at 9:00 a.m.)

THE COURT: All right. Good morning, counsel. How about if we have the plaintiffs go first and just identify counsel, please.

MR. BLUMENFELD: Your Honor, it's Jack Blumenfeld from Morris Nichols for Columbia, and also on for Columbia from the Venable firm are John Murnane, Robert Schwartz, Zachary Garrett and Justin Oliver, and I believe from Columbia are Jeff Kessler and Karen Hoody.

THE COURT: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Blumenfeld. I'm sorry you were interrupted. Is there anything else you needed to say?

MR. BLUMENFELD: No, I don't think so. Thank you, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right.

MS. MOSKOW-SCHNOLL: Your Honor on behalf of Qiagen, this is Beth Moskow-Schnoll from Ballard Spahr, and appearing for Qiagen today are Robert Baron, Scott Marty, Tom Sikora.

Your Honor, I'm sorry. Scott I don't believe has entered an appearance, but he is attending, as is Mariah Trisch. Marc Segal though is appearing on behalf of Qiagen.

1 And we also have Jurgen Schneider, who is the Vice President
2 of Global IP and IP litigation for Qiagen here today as
3 well, your Honor.

4 THE COURT: All right. Thanks, Ms.
5 Moskow-Schnoll.

6 How about for Illumina?

7 MR. BALICK: Your Honor, good morning. Steven
8 Balick from Ashby & Geddes.

9 I'm joined by co-counsel from Weil Gotshal,
10 Edward Reines and Derek Walter, and I believe we also have a
11 couple of client representatives on from Illumina. Roland
12 Schwillinski and Marcus Burch.

13 THE COURT: All right. Great.

14 All right. So before we kind of dive into each
15 side's arguments, I wanted to address the question I sent
16 out to counsel yesterday.

17 As I read the papers, I'm not so sure the
18 disputed term really is Y or even Y in the box with the Y in
19 the schematic. I wonder whether the disputed term is really
20 linker, but let me hear from plaintiffs first.

21 MR. BARON: Good morning, Your Honor. This is
22 Rob Baron for Qiagen. I will be handling Y on behalf of the
23 plaintiffs.

24 I think that Y is the right term. They
25 are linked together because Y includes a linker that has

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.