

Filed December 8, 2017

Filed on behalf of:

Illumina, Inc.

By: Kerry S. Taylor

Michael L. Fuller

KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP

2040 Main Street, 14th Floor

Irvine, CA 92614

Telephone: 949-760-0404

Facsimile: 949-760-9502

Email: BoxIllumina@knobbe.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ILLUMINA, INC.

Petitioner,

v.

**THE TRUSTEES OF COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2018-00291

U.S. Patent No. 9,718,852

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF
U.S. PATENT NO. 9,718,852**

Columbia Ex. 2034 Illumina, Inc. v. The Trustees of Columbia University in the City of New York
--

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND REGARDING THE '852 PATENT	3
A. Prosecution History and Patent Owner Estoppel	4
1. The double patenting rejection and patent owner estoppel	4
2. Lack of written description support	5
3. Columbia incorrectly asserted “small” was inventive, and did not address Tsien.....	6
III. THE BOARD SHOULD PRECLUDE COLUMBIA FROM PARTICIPATING IN THIS PROCEEDING	6
IV. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	7
V. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	7
VI. STATE OF THE ART	8
A. Deoxyribonucleotides Were Known	8
B. Nucleotide Analogues Were Known.....	10
1. Nucleotide analogues having a 3'-OH cap and a labeled base were known	11
a. Small 3'-capping groups were desirable.....	11
b. 7-Substituted deaza-purine labels were common	12
VII. THERE IS A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT THE CHALLENGED CLAIM IS UNPATENTABLE	14

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd)

	Page No.
A. The Asserted References Are Prior Art	14
B. Grounds Of Challenges	15
VIII. GROUND 1: OBVIOUSNESS OVER TSIENT IN VIEW OF PROBER.....	15
A. Introduction to Tsien and Prober.....	15
B. Claim 1 is Obvious Over Tsien in view of Prober.....	16
1. The structure depicted in Claim 1 is not new	16
a. Tsien in view of Prober renders obvious the nucleotide depicted in Claim 1	19
2. Limitation R(a): “wherein R(a) represents a small, chemically cleavable, chemical group capping the oxygen at the 3’ position of the deoxyribose of the deoxyribonucleotide analogue”	21
3. Limitation R(b): “wherein R ... (b) does not interfere with recognition of the analogue as a substrate by a DNA polymerase”	24
4. Limitations “wherein R ... (c) is stable during a DNA polymerase reaction” and “wherein the covalent bond between the 3’-oxygen and R is stable during a DNA polymerase reaction”	25
5. Limitations “wherein R ... (d) does not contain a ketone group” and “wherein OR is not a methoxy group or an ester group”	26
6. Limitation “wherein tag represents a detectable fluorescent moiety”	26

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd)

	Page No.
7. Limitation Y is a “chemically cleavable, chemical linker”	27
8. Limitation Y(a): “wherein Y ... (a) does not interfere with recognition of the analogue as a substrate by a DNA polymerase”	28
9. Limitation Y(b): “wherein Y ... (b) is stable during a DNA polymerase reaction”	29
10. Limitation i): “wherein the adenine deoxyribonucleotide analogue: i) is recognized as a substrate by a DNA polymerase”	30
11. Limitation ii): “wherein the adenine deoxyribonucleotide analogue ... ii) is incorporated at the end of a growing strand of DNA during a DNA polymerase reaction”	31
12. Limitation iii): “wherein the adenine deoxyribonucleotide analogue ... iii) produces a 3'-OH group on the deoxyribose upon cleavage of R”	31
13. Limitation iv): “wherein the adenine deoxyribonucleotide analogue ... iv) no longer includes a tag on the base upon cleavage of Y”	32
14. Limitation v): “wherein the adenine deoxyribonucleotide analogue ... v) is capable of forming hydrogen bonds with thymine or a thymine nucleotide analogue”	32
15. There was motivation to combine Tsien and Prober	33
a. The motivation here was not present in IPR2013-00517.....	36

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd)

	Page No.
16. There was a reasonable expectation of success	36
C. The Pharmaceutical “Lead Compound” Analysis Does Not Apply	38
1. A pharmaceutical “lead compound” analysis compares compounds having specific arrangements of atoms	40
2. Claim 1 does not define a compound having a specific arrangement of atoms	40
3. Columbia’s §112 arguments cut against a “lead compound” analysis	42
D. Tsien’s 3'-O-allyl dATP is a Lead Compound.....	42
1. Tsien’s 3'-O-acetyl dTTP also qualifies as a Lead Compound	45
2. Motivation to use Prober’s 7-substituted deaza-adenine base having a linker and label	46
3. Motivation to use a cleavable allyl linker	48
4. There was a reasonable expectation of success	49
IX. 35 U.S.C. §325(d) IS NOT APPLICABLE.....	51
A. Columbia’s improper prosecution tactics should not be rewarded	51
B. The Petition provides arguments and evidence not cited during prosecution.....	52
X. GROUND 2: OBVIOUSNESS BASED ON DOWER IN VIEW OF PROBER AND METZKER.....	54

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.