

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

YITA LLC
Petitioner

v.

MACNEIL IP LLC
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2020-01139
Patent No. 8,382,186

**DECLARATION OF DAN PERREAULT IN SUPPORT OF
PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------|---|----|
| I. | Introduction | 1 |
| II. | Qualifications and Experience | 3 |
| III. | Legal Principles | 8 |
| | A. Obviousness..... | 8 |
| | B. Motivation to Combine | 11 |
| IV. | Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art | 13 |
| V. | A POSA would have had the tools and the skills to obtain accurate three-dimensional position data of a vehicle foot well and to convert three-dimensional position data to a mold to create a thermoformed floor tray as of 2004..... | 14 |
| | A. Portable coordinate measuring machines were readily available and commonly used in the automobile industry as of 2004. | 16 |
| | B. Computer-aided design software was readily available and commonly used to convert scan data to make an accurate mold as of 2004. | 24 |
| VI. | A POSA would have had an expectation of success in combining Rabbe, Yung, and Gruenwald to achieve the conformance limitations..... | 33 |
| VII. | All the steps of MacNeil’s mold making method were common techniques used in prototyping automobile accessories..... | 36 |
| | A. Obtaining accurate three-dimensional positional data of complex surfaces, including a vehicle foot well surface, was well within the level of ordinary skill in the art as of 2004..... | 38 |
| | B. Converting three-dimensional positional data into a CAD model for producing a custom fit mold surface was well within the level of ordinary skill in the art as of 2004. | 39 |

VIII. A POSA in 2004 would have been able to easily scan the Lada Niva
foot wells with a portable coordinate measuring machine and use the
data to create an accurate mold for a thermoformed floor tray.44

IX. Conclusion.....52

LIST OF MATERIALS CONSIDERED

| Case No. | Exhibit/Paragraph No. | Description |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|---|
| IPR2020-01139 | 3 | Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186 |
| IPR2020-01139 | 17 | Decision Granting <i>Inter Partes</i> Review |
| IPR2020-01139 | 29 | Patent Owner's Response (Redacted) |
| IPR2020-01142 | 3 | Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,833,834 |
| IPR2020-01142 | 17 | Decision Granting <i>Inter Partes</i> Review |
| IPR2020-01142 | 28 | Patent Owner's Response (Redacted) |
| IPR2020-01139 | 1001 | U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186 to MacNeil et al., issued February 26, 2013 ("186 Patent") |
| IPR2020-01142 | 1001 | U.S. Patent No. 8,833,834 to MacNeil et al., issued September 16, 2014 ("834 Patent") |
| IPR2020-01139 | 1003 | Declaration of Paul E. Koch, Ph.D. |
| IPR2020-01142 | 1003 | Declaration of Paul E. Koch, Ph.D. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1005 | French Patent Application Pre-Grant Publication No. 2547252 to Rabbe, published December 14, 1984, with attached certified English-language translation ("Rabbe") |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1006 | U.S. Patent Application Pre-Grant Publication No. 2002/0045029 A1 to Yung, published April 18, 2002 ("Yung") |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1007 | Gruenwald, G., <i>Thermoforming: A Plastics Processing Guide</i> , CRC Press, 2nd Edition, 1998 ("Gruenwald") |
| IPR2020-01142 | 1011 | U.S. Patent No. 2,657,948 to Sturtevant, issued November 3, 1953 ("Sturtevant") |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1045 | <i>Curriculum vitae</i> of Dan Perreault |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1047 | Transcript of the Deposition of Ray Sherman, taken July 28, 2021 |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1049 | Transcript of the Deposition of Tim A. Osswald, Ph.D., taken August 5, 2021 |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1060 | FaroArm Titanium & Platinum Brochure, revised July 30, 2004 |

IPR2020-01139 & IPR2020-01142
Declaration of Dan Perreault

| Case No. | Exhibit/Par per No. | Description |
|-----------------------|------------------------|---|
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1073 | U.S. Patent No. 6,073,056 to Gawronski et al. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1074 | U.S. Patent No. 3,944,798 to Eaton |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1076 | U.S. Patent No. 5,528,505 to Granger et al. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1077 | U.S. Patent No. 5,402,582 to Raab |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1078 | Adams, Larry, "Competition Rising in Portable CMMs," <i>Quality Magazine</i> , 2003 |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1079 | "Coordinate Measuring Machine has portable design," Romer, Inc., 2004, accessed on July 23, 2021 at https://news.thomasnet.com/fullstory/coordinate-measuring-machine-has-portable-design-455365 |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1080 | U.S. Patent No. 5,363,159 to Melvin |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1081 | International Patent Publication No. WO 99/25536 to Flint et al. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1082 | U.S. Patent No. 6,377,865 to Edelsbrunner et al. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1083 | Geomagic Studio product sheet, 2003 |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1086 | U.S. Patent No. 4,575,330 to Hull |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1089 | <i>IMEdit™ Polygon-editing Software Reference Guide Version 8.0 for Windows</i> , InnovMetric Software Inc., July 2003. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1090 | <i>IMMerge™ Polygon-editing Software Reference Guide Version 8.0 for Windows</i> , InnovMetric Software Inc., July 2003. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 1091 | <i>Polyworks/Modeler™ V8.0 Beginner's Guide</i> , InnovMetric Software Inc., August 2003. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 2041 | Declaration of Tim A. Osswald, Ph.D. |
| IPR2020-01139, -01142 | 2042 | Declaration of Ryan Granger (Redacted) |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.