

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

YITA LLC
Petitioner

v.

MACNEIL IP LLC
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2020-01139
Patent No. 8,382,186

**DECLARATION OF MARK STRACHAN IN SUPPORT OF
PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Qualifications and Experience	3
III.	Legal Principles	12
	A. Obviousness.....	12
	B. Motivation to Combine	16
IV.	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art	18
V.	The Rabbe-Yung-Gruenwald combination discloses a thermoformed floor tray with integrally formed panels that closely conform to a vehicle foot well contour.....	19
	A. A POSA would have understood that Rabbe’s floor tray is conducive to thermoforming.	20
	1. Rabbe’s floor tray is not limited to thermosets.....	21
	2. Rabbe’s floor tray design would have suggested thermoforming a single sheet of thermoplastic polymeric material.....	26
	3. Rabbe’s drawings do not suggest sharp corners.	30
	4. Rabbe’s floor tray would actually have a shallow draw, although a POSA would have known how to thermoform a deeper draw.....	33
	5. Rabbe’s undercuts and walls of unequal heights would not have deterred a POSA from thermoforming.....	36
	B. A POSA reading Yung would have been led to thermoforming to produce the vehicle floor mat.....	40
	1. The materials of Yung’s tri-layer floor mat would have led a POSA to thermoforming, not compression molding.	41

2.	Thermoforming fabric and foam materials was well known and well within the level of ordinary skill in the art.	46
3.	Thermoforming Yung’s tri-layer structure was well within the level of ordinary skill in the art.....	54
4.	Thermoforming Yung’s embossments was well within the level of ordinary skill in the art.	61
C.	A POSA would have understood that Gruenwald’s well known thermoforming techniques were applicable to thermoforming Rabbe’s floor tray.	63
VI.	Conclusion.....	65

LIST OF MATERIALS CONSIDERED

Case No.	Exhibit No.	Description
IPR2020-01139	3	Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186
IPR2020-01139	17	Decision Granting <i>Inter Partes</i> Review
IPR2020-01139	29	Patent Owner's Response (Redacted)
IPR2020-01142	3	Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,833,834
IPR2020-01142	17	Decision Granting <i>Inter Partes</i> Review
IPR2020-01142	28	Patent Owner's Response (Redacted)
IPR2020-01139	1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186 to MacNeil et al., issued February 26, 2013 ("186 Patent")
IPR2020-01142	1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,833,834 to MacNeil et al., issued September 16, 2014 ("834 Patent")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1005	French Patent Application Pre-Grant Publication No. 2547252 to Rabbe, published December 14, 1984, with attached certified English-language translation ("Rabbe")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1006	U.S. Patent Application Pre-Grant Publication No. 2002/0045029 A1 to Yung, published April 18, 2002 ("Yung")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1007	Gruenwald, G., <i>Thermoforming: A Plastics Processing Guide</i> , CRC Press, 2nd Edition, 1998 ("Gruenwald")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1008	Throne, J., <i>Technology of Thermoforming</i> , Hanser, 1996 ("Throne I")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1009	Throne, J., <i>Understanding Thermoforming</i> , Hanser, 2nd Edition, 2008 ("Throne II")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1012	U.S. Patent No. 6,793,872 to Buss, issued September 21, 2004 ("Buss")
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1013	U.S. Patent No. 6,361,099 to McIntosh, issued March 26, 2002 ("McIntosh")

IPR2020-01139 & IPR2020-01142
Declaration of Mark Strachan

Case No.	Exhibit No.	Description
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1016	DOW HDPE DGDA-5004 NT 7 Data Sheet, published October 10, 2003
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1017	Black Armor Web Advertisement
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1018	<i>Husky Liner Advertisement</i> , August 24, 2000
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1019	U.S. Patent No. 4,420,180 to Dupont et al., issued December 13, 1983 (“Dupont”)
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1043	<i>Curriculum vitae</i> of Mark Strachan
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1047	Transcript of the Deposition of Ray Sherman, taken July 28, 2021
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1049	Transcript of the Deposition of Tim A. Osswald, Ph.D., taken August 5, 2021
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1054	U.S. Patent No. 6,953,545 to Tyler (“Tyler”)
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1056	U.S. Patent Application Publication 2001/0028932 to Akaike et al.
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1057	<i>Handbook of Plastic Foams: Types, Properties, Manufacture and Applications</i> , ed. Arthur H. Landrock, Noyes Publications, 1995
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1058	Reinkemeyer, Heiz-Gerd, “New Solutions for the Trim of Automotive Vehicles,” Society of Automotive Engineers, Automotive Engineering Congress and Exposition, 1976.
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1063	U.S. Patent No. 6,817,649 to Stanesic
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1064	U.S. Patent No. 5,648,031 to Sturtevant et al.
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1065	European Patent No. 0288728 to Landler
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1066	U.S. Patent No. 5,529,826 to Tailor et al.
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1067	International Patent Publication No. WO 2004/087804 to Walther et al.
IPR2020-01139, -01142	1068	U.S. Patent No. 6,849,667 to Haseyama et al.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.