

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

YITA, LLC
Petitioner

v.

MACNEIL IP LLC
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2020-01139
Patent No. 8,382,186

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 8,382,186**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. BACKGROUND IN THE ART 2

 A. Thermoplastics and thermoforming were used to manufacture prior-art floor trays. 2

 1. Advantages of Thermoforming and Thermoplastics 2

 2. Impact of Non-Uniform Thinning During Thermoforming 3

 3. Thermoplastic Floor Trays of the Prior Art 6

 B. Prior art floor trays closely conformed to vehicle sidewalls 8

 C. Prior art floor mats had a reservoir for collecting liquid 13

 D. Hollow baffles to elevate feet above water collected in a reservoir were not new. 16

III. THE '186 PATENT 18

 A. Problems Allegedly Addressed by the '186 Patent 19

 B. '186 Patent Prosecution History 19

IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART 23

V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 24

 A. “thickness...being substantially uniform throughout the tray” 25

VI. SUMMARY OF GROUNDS 27

 A. Applied Prior Art 27

 B. Grounds 27

VII. GROUND 1: THE COMBINATION OF RABBE, YUNG, AND GRUENWALD RENDERS OBVIOUS CLAIMS 1-7 27

 A. Overview of Applied References 28

Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186

1.	Rabbe.....	28
2.	Yung.....	29
3.	Gruenwald.....	33
B.	The prior art and arguments relied on here were not previously before the Office.....	35
C.	Independent Claim 1	35
1.	Preamble: “A vehicle floor tray thermoformed from a sheet of thermoplastic polymeric material of substantially uniform thickness, comprising”	35
2.	Element 1[a]: “a central panel substantially conforming to a floor of a vehicle foot well”	37
3.	Element 1[b]: “the central panel of the floor tray having at least one longitudinally disposed lateral side and at least one transversely disposed lateral side”	39
4.	Element 1[c]: “a first panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray, upwardly extending from the transversely disposed lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray, and closely conforming to a first foot well wall”	41
5.	Element 1[d]: “the first panel of the floor tray joined to the central panel of the floor tray by a curved transition”	42
6.	Element 1[e]: “a second panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray and the first panel, upwardly extending from the longitudinally disposed lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray, and closely conforming to a second foot well wall”	46
7.	Element 1[f]: “the second panel of the floor tray joined to the central panel of the floor tray and to the first panel of the floor tray by curved transitions”	47
8.	Element 1[g]: “a reservoir disposed in the central panel of the floor tray”	48

9.	Element 1[h]: “a plurality of upstanding, hollow, elongate baffles disposed in the reservoir”	50
10.	Element 1[i]: “each of the baffles having at least two ends remote from each other”	54
11.	Element 1[j]: “the central panel, the first panel, the second panel, the reservoir and the baffles each having a thickness from a point on the upper surface to a closest point on the bottom surface thereof, said thicknesses, as a result of the tray being thermoformed from the sheet of thermoplastic polymeric material of substantially uniform thickness, being substantially uniform throughout the tray”	55
12.	Element 1[k]: “the baffles each having a width, in any horizontal direction, of more than two times its thickness”	57
13.	Element 1[l]: “the baffles adapted to elevate the shoe or foot of the occupant above fluid collected in the reservoir, and further adapted to impede lateral movement, induced by a change in vehicle speed or direction, of fluid collected in the reservoir”	58
14.	Element 1[m]: “any portion of the reservoir connected to a remote portion of the reservoir by a path formed around ends of the baffles”	60
15.	A POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Combine Rabbe, Yung, and Gruenwald to Arrive at the Claimed Vehicle Floor Tray	61
16.	Reasonable Expectation of Success	67
D.	Claim 2: “The floor tray of claim 1, further comprising a third panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray and joined to at least one of the first and second panels by curved transitions, the third panel upwardly extending from a third lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray.”	69
E.	Claim 3: “The floor tray of claim 2, further comprising a fourth panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray and joined to at least one of the second and third panels by curved transitions, the	

fourth panel upwardly extending from a fourth lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray.”72

F. Claim 4: “The floor tray of claim 1, wherein at least one of the first and second panels has a top margin, the top margin being at least five inches higher than the central panel of the floor tray at its greatest vertical separation therefrom.”74

G. Claim 5: “The floor tray of claim 1, wherein the first and second panels have top margins which are substantially coplanar with each other.”76

H. Claim 6: “The floor tray of claim 1, wherein ones of the baffles include longitudinal portions for impeding side-to-side lateral movement of fluid.”77

I. Claim 7: “The floor tray of claim 1, wherein ones [sic] of the baffles include transverse portions for impeding forward or rearward lateral movement of fluid.”79

VIII. OBJECTIVE INDICIA DO NOT SUPPORT PATENTABILITY81

IX. MANDATORY NOTICES81

A. Real Parties-in-Interest81

B. Related Matters81

C. Lead and Back-up Counsel and Service Information82

X. GROUNDS FOR STANDING83

XI. STATEMENT OF PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED FOR EACH CLAIM CHALLENGED84

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.