

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

YITA LLC,  
Petitioner

v.

MACNEIL IP LLC,  
Patent Owner

---

Case No. IPR2020-01138  
Patent No. 8,382,186

---

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW  
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 8,382,186**

***Mail Stop PATENT BOARD***  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION .....1

II. BACKGROUND IN THE ART .....2

    A. Thermoplastics and thermoforming were used to manufacture prior-art floor trays. ....2

        1. Advantages of Thermoforming and Thermoplastics .....2

        2. Impact of Non-Uniform Thinning During Thermoforming .....4

        3. Thermoplastic Floor Trays of the Prior Art .....6

    B. Prior art floor trays closely conformed to vehicle sidewalls.....8

    C. Prior art floor mats had a reservoir for collecting liquid.....14

    D. Hollow baffles to elevate feet above water collected in a reservoir were not new. ....16

III. THE '186 patent .....19

    A. Problems Allegedly Addressed by the '186 Patent.....20

    B. '186 Patent Prosecution History.....20

IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....25

V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....26

    A. “thicknesses . . . being substantially uniform throughout the tray” ....27

VI. The '186 patent is not entitled to a priority date of any of its parent applications' filing dates.....29

VII. SUMMARY OF GROUNDS .....36

    A. Prior Art Applied.....36

    B. Grounds .....36

VIII. Claims 1-7 of the '186 patent are unpatentable under Pre-AIA 35 U.S.C. § 103. ....37

*Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186*

A.	Ground 1: Claims 1-7 would have been obvious over MacNeil.....	37
1.	Independent claim 1 .....	37
a.	Preamble: <i>A vehicle floor tray thermoformed from a sheet of thermoplastic polymeric material of substantially uniform thickness .....</i>	37
b.	Element 1.a: <i>a central panel substantially conforming to a floor of a vehicle foot well .....</i>	40
c.	Element 1.b: <i>the central panel of the floor tray having at least one longitudinally disposed lateral side and at least one transversely disposed lateral side.....</i>	42
d.	Element 1.c: <i>a first panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray, upwardly extending from the transversely disposed lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray, and closely conforming to a first foot well wall.....</i>	45
e.	Element 1.d: <i>the first panel of the floor tray joined to the central panel of the floor tray by a curved transition ...</i>	48
f.	Element 1.e: <i>a second panel integrally formed with the central panel of the floor tray and the first panel, upwardly extending from the longitudinally disposed lateral side of the central panel of the floor tray, and closely conforming to a second foot well wall .....</i>	52
g.	Element 1.f: <i>the second panel of the floor tray joined to the central panel of the floor tray and to the first panel of the floor tray by curved transitions .....</i>	56
h.	Element 1.g: <i>a reservoir disposed in the central panel of the floor tray .....</i>	61
i.	Element 1.h: <i>a plurality of upstanding, hollow, elongate baffles disposed in the reservoir.....</i>	62
j.	Element 1.i: <i>each of the baffles having at least two ends remote from each other.....</i>	64

*Petition for Inter Partes Review of U.S. Patent No. 8,382,186*

k.	Element 1.j: <i>the central panel, the first panel, the second panel, the reservoir and the baffles each having a thickness from a point on the upper surface to a closest point on the bottom surface thereof, said thicknesses, as a result of the tray being thermoformed from the sheet of thermoplastic polymeric material of substantially uniform thickness, being substantially uniform throughout the tray</i> .....	67
l.	Element 1.k: <i>the baffles each having a width, in any horizontal direction, of more than two times its thickness</i> .....	70
m.	Element 1.l: <i>the baffles adapted to elevate the shoe or foot of the occupant above fluid collected in the reservoir, and further adapted to impede lateral movement, induced by a change in vehicle speed or direction, of fluid collected in the reservoir</i> .....	72
n.	Element 1.m: <i>any portion of the reservoir connected to a remote portion of the reservoir by a path formed around ends of the baffles</i> .....	72
o.	A POSA would have been motivated to achieve the claimed uniform thickness.....	75
p.	A POSA would have had a reasonable expectation of success. ....	77
2.	Claim 2 .....	79
3.	Claim 3 .....	82
4.	Claim 4 .....	86
5.	Claim 5 .....	88
6.	Claim 6 .....	90
7.	Claim 7 .....	91
B.	Objective indicia do not support patentability. ....	92



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.