

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
WACO DIVISION

SOLAS OLED, LTD.) Docket No. WA 19-CA-236 ADA
)
vs.) Waco, Texas
)
LG DISPLAY CO., LTD.,)
LG ELECTRONICS, INC.,)
SONY CORPORATION) May 22, 2020

TRANSCRIPT OF TELEPHONIC MARKMAN HEARING
BEFORE THE HONORABLE ALAN D. ALBRIGHT

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff: Ms. Andrea L. Fair
Ward, Smith & Hill, PLLC
P.O. Box 1231
Longview, Texas 75606

Mr. Marc A. Fenster
Mr. Reza Mirzaie
Mr. Neil A. Rubin
Mr. Philip X. Wang
Russ, August & Kabat
12424 Wilshire Boulevard,
12th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90025

For the Defendants: Ms. Jennifer A.H. Doan
Mr. Joshua R. Thane
Haltom & Doan
6500 Summerhill Road, Suite 100
Texarkana, Texas 75503

Mr. Joseph H. Lee
Latham & Watkins, LLP
650 Town Center Drive, 20th Floor
Costa Mesa, California 92626



1 **Appearances Continued:**

2 For the Defendants: Mr. Blake R. Davis
Latham & Watkins, LLP
3 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
San Francisco, California 94111

4
5 Mr. Gabriel S. Gross
Mr. Douglas E. Lumish
6 Mr. Chris Schmoller
Latham & Watkins, LLP
7 140 Scott Drive
Menlo Park, California 94025

8 Court Reporter: Ms. Lily Iva Reznik, CRR, RMR
501 West 5th Street, Suite 4153
9 Austin, Texas 78701
(512)391-8792

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

25 Proceedings reported by computerized stenography,
transcript produced by computer-aided transcription.
LG DISPLAY CO., V. SOLAS OLED, LTD.

09:01:43 1 THE COURT: Then, Suzanne, I guess you could call
09:01:44 2 the case, please.

09:01:48 3 THE CLERK: Certainly.

09:01:49 4 Markman hearing in Civil Action 6:19-CV-236,
09:01:53 5 styled, Solas OLED, Limited vs. LG Display Company, and
09:01:59 6 others.

09:02:13 7 THE COURT: I'm not hearing anything.

09:02:17 8 THE CLERK: I apologize, you couldn't hear me
09:02:19 9 call the case?

09:02:20 10 THE COURT: I did hear you okay.

09:02:24 11 THE CLERK: You did hear me?

09:02:25 12 THE COURT: I did.

09:02:27 13 THE CLERK: All right then. I'm out.

09:02:44 14 THE COURT: Did you hear me ask for you all to
09:02:48 15 announce?

09:02:52 16 MS. DOAN: No. We did not hear that. We can
09:02:54 17 make announcements.

09:02:55 18 THE COURT: Okay. Please do.

09:02:58 19 MS. FAIR: Good morning, your Honor.

09:02:59 20 This is Andrea Fair on behalf of Solas, and I'm
09:03:02 21 joined today by Mr. Reza Mirzaie, Mr. Marc Fenster, Mr.
09:03:06 22 Neil Rubin, and Mr. Philip Wang. And we also have our
09:03:10 23 client representative, Mr. Richard Tashjian, with us
09:03:13 24 today. And we're ready to proceed.

09:03:15 25 THE COURT: All right. Who will be speaking for

LG DISPLAY CO., V. SOLAS OLED, LTD.

09:03:18 1 plaintiff?

09:03:19 2 MS. FAIR: That will be Mr. Mirzaie. Go ahead,
09:03:22 3 Reza. I'm sorry.

09:03:23 4 MR. MIRZAIE: No. It's okay.

09:03:24 5 Your Honor, this is Reza Mirzaie. I'll be
09:03:27 6 speaking on behalf of plaintiff for the 137 patent. My
09:03:31 7 colleague, Philip Wang, will be speaking on behalf of
09:03:34 8 plaintiff on the 891. And my colleague, Neil Rubin, and
09:03:40 9 Philip Wang will be splitting up the remaining patent, the
09:03:43 10 068 patent.

09:03:44 11 THE COURT: Okay. Lily, are you getting this?

09:03:44 12 COURT REPORTER: Yes, sir.

09:04:03 13 THE COURT: And for defendants.

09:04:05 14 MS. DOAN: Good morning, your Honor.

09:04:07 15 Jennifer Doan and Josh Thane for the LG
09:04:09 16 Defendants and for Sony. And arguing today for LG and
09:04:11 17 Sony will be Mr. Doug Lumish, Joseph Lee, Blake Davis, all
09:04:20 18 from Latham Watkins. And also today, your Honor, Gabe
09:04:22 19 Gross and Chris Schmoller are appearing for Latham
09:04:26 20 Watkins, as well. And we're ready to proceed.

09:04:27 21 THE COURT: Very nice.

09:04:30 22 And I have -- I believe we got an e-mail from the
09:04:34 23 plaintiff saying that they were okay with the Court's
09:04:39 24 preliminary constructions. Let me hear from Mr. Mirzaie
09:04:43 25 or Mr. Wang if that is incorrect.

LG DISPLAY CO., V. SOLAS OLED, LTD.

09:04:48 1 MR. MIRZAIE: This is Mr. Mirzaie.

09:04:49 2 That is correct, your Honor.

09:04:50 3 THE COURT: Okay. And so -- and with respect to
09:04:55 4 I'll ask any of the defense counsel, are there any of the
09:05:00 5 claims -- Court's preliminary constructions that
09:05:06 6 defendants find acceptable and do not intend to argue?

09:05:11 7 MR. LUMISH: Your Honor, this is Doug Lumish for
09:05:13 8 the defendants.

09:05:14 9 I'll take that in two parts, if I may. There
09:05:15 10 are --

09:05:16 11 THE COURT: Sure.

09:05:16 12 MR. LUMISH: I think for most of the construction
09:05:19 13 that you've proposed as tentatives, there are some
09:05:24 14 suggested modifications that we would like to propose
09:05:27 15 today. As far as terms we are not going to argue, we
09:05:29 16 agreed with Solas that we won't argue the before-and-after
09:05:34 17 term for the patterning on its own term, but we're going
09:05:39 18 to submit those on the briefing, as opposed to submit to
09:05:41 19 your Honor's tentative. We understand that that probably
09:05:42 20 leads to the attentive. But instead of waiving our
09:05:46 21 position, instead, we'll just submit that and not argue
09:05:51 22 it, with your permission.

09:05:52 23 THE COURT: Absolutely fine.

09:05:54 24 MR. LUMISH: And I did want to mention, your
09:05:54 25 Honor, we have a number of client representatives that are

LG DISPLAY CO., V. SOLAS OLED, LTD.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.