

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

WALMART INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

CARAVAN CANOPY INTERNATIONAL, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2020-01026
Patent No. 5,944,040
Issue Date: AUGUST 31, 1999
Title: COLLAPSIBLE TENT FRAME

**PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND	2
III. THE BOARD SHOULD EXERCISE ITS STATUTORY DISCRETION AND DENY INSTITUTION	3
A. The Co-Pending Related Litigations	4
B. The <i>Apple</i> Factors Favor Denial.....	6
1. Existence of a Stay (<i>Apple</i> Factor 1)	7
2. Trial Timing (<i>Apple</i> Factor 2).....	7
3. Investment in the Parallel Proceedings (<i>Apple</i> Factor 3).....	7
4. Petition Timing (<i>Apple</i> Factor 3 Continued)	9
5. Overlap in Issues (<i>Apple</i> Factor 4)	10
6. Whether the Parties are the Same (<i>Apple</i> Factor 5).....	13
7. Other Circumstances (<i>Apple</i> Factor 6).....	14
a) Strength of the Merits	14
b) § 325(d) Implications.....	14
c) Quality, Efficiency, and Fairness Concerns Underlying the AIA	15
IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	15
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	16
VI. WALMART HAS NO REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS	16
A. Walmart’s Motivations To Combine The References Lack Any Rational Underpinning	17
1. Walmart’s Proposed Combinations Would Not Increase Headroom.....	18
2. Walmart’s Reasoning For Increasing Canopy Pitch Is Contradicted By Contemporaneous Art.....	28
3. Walmart’s Proposed Modifications To Tsai and Yang Would Actually Increase Canopy Sag	34

B.	Individual Deficiencies In The Grounds Of Unpatentability.....	40
1.	Grounds 1-3 Generally: Walmart Fails To Explain Why A POSITA Would Ignore A Primary Teaching of Yang	40
2.	Ground 1: Yang in view of Lynch.....	41
a)	Walmart’s Proposed Modification Would Increase the Collapsed Volume of Yang	41
b)	Walmart’s Expert Proposes a Different Modification Than Walmart	43
3.	Ground 2: Yang in view of the alleged AAPA.....	45
4.	Ground 3: Yang in view of Berg.....	49
5.	Grounds 4-7 Generally: Losi Teaches Away From Walmart’s Proposed Modifications To Its Parent Patent Tsai	50
6.	Ground 4: Tsai in view of Lynch.....	53
7.	Ground 5: Tsai in view of Alleged AAPA	54
8.	Grounds 6 and 7: Tsai in view of Berg (and Carter)	55
a)	Walmart and Its Expert Propose Two Different Modifications of Tsai in View of Berg.....	55
b)	A POSITA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Make Either Modification to Tsai	58
VII.	THE CITED REFERENCES ARE DUPLICATIVE OF THOSE CONSIDERED BY THE EXAMINER	61
A.	The Cited References Were Either Considered By Or Are Cumulative Of Other References Considered By The Examiner	62
B.	Walmart Omits The Disclosure Of Losi To Allege Material Error By The Examiner	70
C.	Walmart’s Expert’s Declaration Fails To Meaningfully Supplement The Record	72
VIII.	THE MERE EXISTENCE OF WALMART’S EXPERT’S DECLARATION DOES NOT DEMAND INSTITUTION	73
IX.	THE BOARD SHOULD DENY INSTITUTION DUE TO WALMART’S EXCESSIVE AND INSUFFICIENTLY PLED GROUNDS	74
X.	CONCLUSION.....	75

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Home Depot U.S.A., et al.</i> , No. SACV 19-01072, Order Consolidating Cases, dated December 13, 2019
2002	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Costco Wholesale Corporation, et al.</i> , No. SACV 19-01072, Scheduling Order, dated January 27, 2020
2003	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Walmart Inc., et al.</i> , No. 19-06978 Consolidated with 19-01072, Walmart's Memorandum in Support of its Motion to Stay Litigation Pending Inter Partes Review, dated June 18, 2020
2004	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Lowe's Home Centers, LLC et al.</i> , No. 19-06952 Consolidated with 19-01072, Request for Clarification re Stay of Litigation, dated August 26, 2020
2005	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Home Depot U.S.A., Inc., et al.</i> , No. SACV 19-01072, Order Denying Defendants' Request for Clarification, dated August 28, 2020
2006	Claim Chart for Walmart's Ozark Trial Canopy, dated December 9, 2019
2007	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Walmart Inc., et al.</i> , No. 19-06978 Consolidated with 19-01072, Defendant Walmart Inc.'s Preliminary Invalidity Contentions, dated March 16, 2020
2008	Walmart's Initial Invalidity Contentions Claim Chart – Ex. D
2009	Walmart's Initial Invalidity Contentions Claim Chart – Ex. A
2010	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Costco Wholesale Corporation, et al.</i> , No. 19-01072, Costco Wholesale Corporation's Invalidity Contentions and Accompanying Document Production, dated November 4, 2019
2011	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Z-Shade Co. LTD., et al.</i> , No. 19-06224, Z-Shade Co., LTD.'s Invalidity Contentions and Accompanying Document Production, dated November 4, 2019

...

Exhibit No.	Description
2012	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Shelterlogic Corp., et al.</i> , No. 19-01224 Consolidated with 19-01072, Invalidation Contentions of Shelterlogic Corp., dated January 21, 2020
2013	<i>Caravan Canopy Int'l, Inc. v. Lowe's Home Centers, LLC et al.</i> , No. 19-06952, Lowe's Invalidation Contentions and Accompanying Document Production, dated November 4, 2019
2014	Declaration of Lance Rake
2015	U.S. Patent No. 5,701,923 to Losi, Jr. et al.
2016	U.S. Patent No. 5,275,188 to Tsai
2017	U.S. Patent No. 5,421,356 to Lynch
2018	U.S. Patent No. 5,634,483 to Gwin
2019	U.S. Patent No. 5,794,640 to Jang
2020	U.S. Patent No. 4,641,676 to Lynch
2021	U.S. Patent No. 4,607,656 to Carter

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.