

1 DERRICK F. COLEMAN (SBN 170955)

*derrick@colemanfrost.com*

2 DAVID J. FARKAS (SBN 203821)

*david@colemanfrost.com*

3 **COLEMAN FROST LLP**

201 Nevada Street

4 El Segundo, California 90245-4211

Telephone: (424) 277-1650

5 Facsimile: (310) 648-8739

6 JOHN R. HORVACK, JR. (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)

*JHorvackJr@carmodylaw.com*

7 **CARMODY TORRANCE SANDAK & HENNESSEY LLP**

8 195 Church Street

New Haven, Connecticut 06509-1950

9 Telephone: (203) 784-3120

10 Facsimile: (203) 784-3199

11 Attorneys for Defendant and

Counterclaimant ShelterLogic Corp.

12  
13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

14 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, SOUTHERN DIVISION**

15 CARAVAN CANOPY INT'L, INC., a  
California corporation,

16 Plaintiff,

17 v.

18 SHELTERLOGIC CORP., a Delaware  
19 corporation; and DOES 1 through 10,  
20 inclusive

21 Defendants.

CASE NO. 5:19-cv-01224-AG-ADS  
**consolidated with 8:19-cv-01072-AG-ADS**

Hon. Andrew J. Guilford

**INVALIDITY CONTENTIONS OF  
SHELTERLOGIC CORP**

22 AND RELATED CROSS-CLAIMS  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **INVALIDITY CONTENTIONS OF SHELTERLOGIC CORP.**

2 In accordance with the Court's Standing Patent Rules ("S.P.R."), the defendant and  
3 counterclaimant, ShelterLogic Corp. ("ShelterLogic"), respectfully submits its Invalidity Contentions  
4 containing the information described in S.P.R. 2.5.1 through 2.5.4.

5 In particular, ShelterLogic contends that the claims of U.S. Patent No. 5,944,040 are anticipated  
6 by (1) Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 filed March 7, 1996 and issued June 17, 1997 (and/or its German  
7 counterpart DE 296 05 106 U1 published on May 23, 1996), and/or (2) Lynch, U.S. Patent No.  
8 4,947,884 issued August 14, 1990.

9 In addition, ShelterLogic contends that the claims of U.S. Patent No. 5,944,040 would have been  
10 obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art based on:

- 11 (1) Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 filed March 7, 1996 and issued June 17, 1997  
12 (and/or its German counterpart DE 296 05 106 U1 published on May 23, 1996) in  
13 view of Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,779,635;
- 14 (2) Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 filed March 7, 1996 and issued June 17, 1997  
15 (and/or its German counterpart DE 296 05 106 U1 published on May 23, 1996) in  
16 view of Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,947,884;
- 17 (3) Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,947,884 issued August 14, 1990 in view of Tsai, U.S.  
18 Patent No. 5,638,853 filed March 7, 1996 and issued June 17, 1997 (and/or its  
19 German counterpart DE 296 05 106 U1 published on May 23, 1996);
- 20 (4) Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,779,635 in view of Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 filed  
21 March 7, 1996 and issued June 17, 1997 (and/or its German counterpart DE 296  
22 05 106 U1 published on May 23, 1996); and/or
- 23 (5) Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,779,635 in view of Lynch, U.S. Patent No. 4,947,884  
24 issued August 14, 1990.

25 Charts identifying where specifically in each alleged item of prior art each limitation of each  
26 claim of U.S. Patent No. 5,944,040 is found, are attached hereto as **Exhibit A**. In addition, where  
27 obviousness is alleged, the charts contain an explanation as to why the prior art renders the asserted  
28 claims obvious and include an identification of the prior art combinations showing obviousness. Finally,

1 a copy of each cited prior art reference is attached as **Exhibit B**.

2 ShelterLogic respectfully reserves the right to supplement and/or amend these Invalidity  
3 Contentions based upon the discovery of additional prior art and/or unanticipated construction of the  
4 claimed invention.

5 Dated: January 21, 2020

Respectfully submitted:

6 **CARMODY TORRANCE SANDAK &**  
7 **HENNESSEY LLP**

JOHN R. JORVACK, JR.

8  
9  
10 By: /s/ John R. Horvack, Jr.

Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant  
ShelterLogic Corp.

11  
12 Dated: January 21, 2020

Respectfully submitted:

13 **COLEMAN FROST LLP**

14 DERRICK COLEMAN

15 DAVID J. FARKAS

16  
17 By: /s/ David J. Farkas

18 Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant  
19 ShelterLogic Corp.  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

# EXHIBIT A

Anticipation by Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 and its German Counterpart

U.S. Patent No. 5,944,040	Tsai, U.S. Patent No. 5,638,853 (Issued June 17, 1997) and German Counterpart published as DE 296 05 106 U1 on May 23, 1996 ("Tsai")
Claim 1	
A collapsible tent frame, comprising:	"Tent Structure"
a center pole	<p>Tsai teaches a "head connector" (7) as depicted in FIG. 5 and 9 (2:33-36), which meets the limitation of "center pole" if this limitation is not properly construed to be limited to a "long slender cylindrical object"</p> <p>In addition, this limitation is satisfied because the Patent-in-Suit admits that prior art tents included a "center strut C" (which includes a sliding cross-shaped connector E and a fixed cross shaped connector F). (See 1:11-26 and Figs. 16 and 17)</p>
constructed for stretching and sustaining a tent's roof when a tent is pitched with the tent frame;	<p>The "head connector" (7) of Tsai is constructed to stretch and sustain the roof when the tent is pitched. (See Figs. 9, 10 and 15; and 2:33-48)</p> <p>In addition, this limitation is satisfied because the Patent-in-Suit admits that prior art tents included a "center strut C" constructed to stretch and sustain the tent's roof when pitched. (See 1:11-26 and Figs. 16 and 17)</p>
a plurality of side poles	Tsai teaches four vertical side poles 1. (1:65 to 2:2; Fig. 1)
coupled to each other through a plurality of scissor-type ribs,	Tsai teaches the vertical side poles 1 are coupled to each other by scissor type linkages 2. (2:9-13; Fig. 1)
with upper ends of said ribs being hinged to connectors provided at top ends of said side poles and	Tsai teaches that each scissor type linkage 2 has an upper end hinged to fixed connectors 5 at the top end of each side pole 1. (2:5-15; Fig. 6)
lower ends of said ribs being hinged to sliders movably fitted over said side poles; and	And Tsai teaches that each scissor type linkage 2 has a lower end hinged to sliders 6 movably fitted over the side pole 1. (2:5-15; Fig. 6)
a plurality of center pole ribs coupling said center pole to said connectors of the side poles,	Tsai also teaches four rod sets 3 that couple the "head connector" 7 to the fixed top connectors 5 of the side poles 1. (2:16-26; Fig. 7 and 9)
said center pole ribs individually comprising two rib members coupled to each other	Each rod set 3 comprises two rod members coupled to each other through a hinge joint 31. (2:16-26;

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.