

1 DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI

2 UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

3 BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

4  
5 \_\_\_\_\_  
6 BAYERISCHE MOTOREN WERKE AKTIENGESELLSCHAFT &

7 BMW OF NORTH AMERICA, LLC,

8 Petitioner

9 v.

10 PAICE LLC & THE ABELL FOUNDATION, INC.

11 Patent Owner

12 \_\_\_\_\_  
13 Case No. IPR2020-00994

14 Patent No. 7,104,347  
15 \_\_\_\_\_

16  
17  
18 DEPOSITION OF DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI

19 TAKEN REMOTELY BY VIDEOCONFERENCE

20 May 6, 2021

21  
22  
23  
24 Reported by: Mary Ann Payonk

25 Job No. 193241

1 DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI  
2  
3  
4

5 May 6, 2021

6 9:00 a.m. (Mountain)  
7

8 Deposition of DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI taken  
9 remotely by videoconference pursuant to Notice  
10 and agreement of counsel, stenographically  
11 reported by Mary Ann Payonk, Shorthand Reporter  
12 and Notary Public, California CSR No. 13431.

13 All attorneys participating in this  
14 deposition acknowledge that in compliance with  
15 public health orders, the reporter is not  
16 physically present in the deposition room and  
17 will be reporting remotely; further, that in  
18 lieu of an oath administered in person, the  
19 witness will verbally declare their testimony  
20 in this matter under penalty of perjury.  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI

2 APPEARANCES:

3 ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER:

4 BY: VINCENT GALLUZZO, ESQ.

5 SCOTT BITTMAN, ESQ

6 CROWELL & MORING

7 1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW

8 Washington, DC 20004

9  
10 ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER and THE WITNESS:

11 BY: BRIAN LIVEDALEN, ESQ.

12 FISH & RICHARDSON

13 1000 Maine Avenue, SW

14 Washington, DC 20004

15  
16 ALSO ATTENDING:

17 Rodolfo Duran, Legal Video Specialist

1 DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI

2 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning, 08:59  
3 counselors. My name is Rodolfo Duran. 09:00  
4 I'm the legal videographer in 09:00  
5 association with TSG Reporting, Inc. 09:00

6 Due to the severity of COVID-19 and 09:00  
7 following the practices of social 09:00  
8 distancing, I will not be in the same 09:00  
9 room with the witness; instead, I will 09:00  
10 record this remotely. 09:00

11 The court reporter, Mary Ann 09:00  
12 Payonk, also will not be in the same 09:00  
13 room and will swear in the witness 09:00  
14 remotely. 09:00

15 Do all parties stipulate to the 09:00  
16 validity of this video recording, the 09:00  
17 swearing in of the witness, and that it 09:00  
18 will be admissible in the courtroom as 09:00  
19 if it had been taken following Rule 30 09:00  
20 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedures 09:00  
21 and the state's rules where this case is 09:00  
22 pending? 09:00

23 MR. GALLUZZO: Yes. 09:00

24 MR. LIVEDALEN: Yes, I agree for 09:00  
25 patent owners. 09:00

1 DR. MAHDI SHAHBAKHTI

2 MR. GALLUZZO: And agree for 09:01

3 petitioners. 09:01

4 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you. 09:01

5 This is the start of media labeled 09:01

6 number 1 of the remote video-recorded 09:01

7 deposition of Dr. Mahdi Shahbakhti in 09:01

8 the matter of Bayerische Motoren Werke 09:01

9 Aktiengesellschaft and BMW of North 09:01

10 America LLC versus Paice LLC, et al. 09:01

11 Today is May 6, 2021. The time is 09:01

12 9:01 Mountain Daylight Time, and we're 09:01

13 on the record. 09:01

14 Will counsel please introduce 09:01

15 yourselves. 09:01

16 MR. GALLUZZO: Vince Galluzzo from 09:01

17 the law firm of Crowell & Moring, and I 09:01

18 am here on behalf of petitioners, BMW. 09:01

19 With me is my colleague, Scott Bittman. 09:01

20 MR. LIVEDALEN: Brian Livedalen 09:01

21 from the law firm of Fish & Richardson 09:01

22 representing patent owners Paice and 09:01

23 Abell and the witness. 09:01

24

25

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.