

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re *Inter Partes* Review of:)
U.S. Patent No. 9,901,123)
Issued: February 27, 2018)
Application No.: 15/286,087)
Filing Date: October 5, 2016)

For: **Tobacco-Containing Smoking Article**

FILED VIA E2E

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,901,123**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------|--|----|
| I. | Introduction..... | 1 |
| II. | Mandatory Notices under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8..... | 5 |
| | A. Real Parties-in-Interest..... | 5 |
| | B. Related Matters..... | 5 |
| | C. Grounds for Standing | 6 |
| | D. Lead and Backup Counsel and Service Information..... | 6 |
| | E. Fee for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review | 7 |
| III. | Identification of Challenges (37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b)) | 7 |
| IV. | Background..... | 8 |
| | A. Overview of the '123 Patent (Ex. 1001) | 8 |
| | B. State of the Art | 11 |
| | C. Prosecution History | 13 |
| | D. The Person of Ordinary Skill In The Art | 13 |
| | E. Claim Construction | 13 |
| | 1. The recited “controller” does not invoke § 112, ¶ 6, but if it does, the relevant structure includes Brooks’s prior-art controller. | 14 |
| | 2. The art teaches the “removably engaged” term even if it requires the cigarette-type device to be interlocked with the outer housing..... | 17 |
| V. | Ground 1: Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable Over Morgan (Ex. 1005), Alone or in Combination with Adams (Ex. 1007) and Brooks (Ex. 1006) | 18 |
| | A. Overview of Morgan | 18 |

Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of USP 9,901,123

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| B. | Overview of Adams..... | 20 |
| C. | Overview of Brooks | 22 |
| D. | Claim 27 | 23 |
| 1. | Preamble..... | 23 |
| 2. | Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source | 23 |
| 3. | Limitation 27[b]: at least one electrical resistance heater | 25 |
| 4. | Limitation 27[c]: elongated portion of resistance heating element | 25 |
| 5. | Limitation 27[d]: controller | 33 |
| 6. | Limitation 27[e]: removably engaged cigarette-type device | 35 |
| 7. | Limitation 27[f]: elongated heater portion extends into tobacco segment..... | 41 |
| 8. | Limitation 27[g]: visible mainstream aerosol..... | 42 |
| E. | Claims 28-30 | 44 |
| VI. | Ground 2: Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable Over Adams (Ex. 1007), Morgan (Ex. 1005), and Brooks (Ex. 1006) | 46 |
| 1. | Preamble..... | 50 |
| 2. | Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source | 50 |
| 3. | Limitation 27[b]: at least one electrical resistance heater | 52 |
| 4. | Limitation 27[c]: elongated portion of resistance heating element | 52 |
| 5. | Limitation 27[d]: controller | 53 |
| 6. | Limitation 27[e]: removably engaged cigarette-type device | 55 |

Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of USP 9,901,123

| | | |
|-------|---|----|
| 7. | Limitation 27[f]: elongated heater portion extends into the tobacco segment..... | 58 |
| 8. | Limitation 27[g]: visible mainstream aerosol..... | 58 |
| B. | Claims 28-30 | 59 |
| VII. | Ground 3: Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable Over Counts-962, Alone or in Combination with Brooks..... | 62 |
| A. | Overview of Counts-962 | 62 |
| B. | Claim 27 | 64 |
| 1. | Preamble..... | 64 |
| 2. | Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source | 64 |
| 3. | Limitation 27[b]: at least one electrical resistance heater | 65 |
| 4. | Limitation 27[c]: elongated portion of resistance heating element | 65 |
| 5. | Limitation 27[d]: controller | 67 |
| 6. | Limitation 27[e]: removably engaged cigarette-type device | 68 |
| 7. | Limitation 27[f]: elongated heater portion extends into the tobacco segment..... | 71 |
| 8. | Limitation 27[g]: visible mainstream aerosol..... | 71 |
| C. | Claims 28-30 | 73 |
| VIII. | Secondary Considerations | 75 |
| IX. | Conclusion | 76 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|---|---------------|
| Federal Cases | |
| <i>Allied Erecting v. Genesis Attachments</i> , 825 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2016) | 32 |
| <i>Dynamic Drinkware, LLC v. National Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 21 |
| <i>E.I. DuPont de Nemours & Co. v. Synvina C.V.</i> , 904 F.3d 996 (Fed. Cir. 2018) | 46, 61, 75 |
| <i>King Pharms., Inc. v. Eon Labs, Inc.</i> , 616 F.3d 1267 (Fed. Cir. 2012) | 45, 61, 75 |
| <i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007)..... | 51, 54 |
| <i>In re Peterson</i> , 315 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2003) | 46, 61, 75 |
| <i>RAI Strategic Holdings, Inc. v. Altria Client Services LLC</i> , No. 1:20-cv-393 (E.D. Va. filed Apr. 9, 2020)..... | 5 |
| <i>Williamson v. Citrix Online, LLC</i> , 792 F.3d 1339 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 14 |
| Federal Statutes | |
| 35 U.S.C. § 103 | 7, 8, 46 |
| 35 U.S.C. § 112 | <i>passim</i> |
| 35 U.S.C. § 312 | 5 |
| 35 U.S.C. § 315 | 5 |

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.