

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

In re *Inter Partes* Review of:            )  
U.S. Patent No. 9,901,123                 )  
Issued: February 27, 2018                 )  
Application No.: 15/286,087                )  
Filing Date: October 5, 2016              )

For: **Tobacco-Containing Smoking Article**

**FILED VIA E2E**

**DECLARATION OF DR. SEETHARAMA C. DEEVI IN SUPPORT OF  
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW  
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,901,123**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction and Qualifications .....	4
II.	Summary of Materials Reviewed and Considered .....	15
III.	Level of Skill in the Art and Perspective Applied in this Declaration .....	17
IV.	The '123 Patent .....	18
	A. Background.....	18
	B. Description – Additional Background.....	19
	C. Description – The Described Embodiments.....	20
	1. Figure 1’s embodiment.....	20
	2. Figure 2’s embodiment.....	23
	3. Figure 3’s embodiment.....	27
	4. Battery and heating elements are “a matter of design choice” .....	31
	5. Control and Sensing (Figures 4 and 5).....	31
	D. The Claims .....	34
V.	The State of the Art in 2006.....	35
VI.	Claim Construction - Controller .....	38
VII.	Understanding of Legal Principles Relevant to Obviousness.....	47
VIII.	Summary of Primary Prior Art References.....	49
	A. U.S. Patent No. 5,249,586 (“Morgan”) .....	50
	B. U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2007/0102013 (“Adams”).....	52
	C. U.S. Patent No. 4,947,874 (“Brooks”) .....	56
	D. U.S. Patent No. 5,144,962 (“Counts-962”) .....	57
IX.	Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable over Morgan, alone or with Adams and Brooks .....	58
	A. Claim 27: Overview and the Combination .....	58
	B. Claim 27: Preamble .....	69
	C. Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source.....	70

D.	Limitations 27[b] and [c]: at least one elongated electrical resistance heater extending downstream .....	72
E.	Limitation 27[d]: a controller .....	78
F.	Limitation 27[e] .....	82
G.	Limitation 27[f]: the elongated portion of the resistance heating element extends into the tobacco segment.....	90
H.	Limitation 27[g]: during draw, aerosol-forming material can be volatilized to produce a visible mainstream aerosol.....	92
I.	Claim 28: cigarette-type device’s filter element .....	93
J.	Claim 29: manual actuation .....	94
K.	Claim 30: temperature 200° C to 600° C.....	95
X.	Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable over Adams in view of Morgan and Brooks .....	97
A.	Claim 27: Overview and the Combination .....	97
B.	Claim 27: Preamble .....	101
C.	Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source.....	102
D.	Limitations 27[b] and [c]: at least one elongated electrical resistance heater extending downstream .....	105
E.	Limitation 27[d]: a controller .....	106
F.	Limitation 27[e] .....	110
G.	Limitation 27[f]: the elongated portion of the resistance heating element extends into the tobacco segment.....	114
H.	Limitation 27[g]: during draw, aerosol-forming material can be volatilized to produce a visible mainstream aerosol.....	115
I.	Claim 28: cigarette-type device’s filter element .....	117
J.	Claim 29: manual actuation .....	118
K.	Claim 30: temperature 200° C to 600° C.....	118
XI.	Claims 27-30 are Unpatentable over Counts-962, Alone or in Combination with Brooks .....	120
A.	Claim 27: Overview and the Combination .....	120
B.	Claim 27: Preamble .....	122
C.	Limitation 27[a]: an electrical power source.....	124
D.	Limitations 27[b] and [c]: at least one elongated electrical resistance heater extending downstream .....	125
E.	Limitation 27[d]: a controller .....	126
F.	Limitation 27[e] .....	131

G.	Limitation 27[f]: the elongated portion of the resistance heating element extends into the tobacco segment.....	135
H.	Limitation 27[g]: during draw, aerosol-forming material can be volatilized to produce a visible mainstream aerosol.....	135
I.	Claim 28: cigarette-type device's filter element .....	137
J.	Claim 29: manual actuation .....	137
K.	Claim 30: temperature 200° C to 600° C.....	138
XII.	CONCLUSION .....	141

## **I. Introduction and Qualifications**

1. I have been retained by Philip Morris Products, S.A (“Petitioner”) to provide my opinion concerning the validity of U.S. Patent No. 9,901,123 (attached to the accompanying Petition as Ex. 1001 and henceforth referred to as “the ’123 patent”) in support of a Petition for *Inter Partes* Review. I am being compensated for my time in connection with this IPR at my standard consulting rate, which is \$450 per hour, plus actual expenses, regardless of the outcome of this matter.

2. I have over 30 years of experience in the development of reduced risk products, focusing on “heat not burn” technology such as that described in the ’123 patent.

3. My research work for my Ph.D. focused on Solid State and Metallurgical Reactions and I was granted a Ph.D from the Indian Institute of Science in 1981. I subsequently continued my education and obtained a Master of Engineering in Mechanical Engineering from the University of Virginia, and Master of Business Administration from Fuqua School of Business of Duke University.

4. After several research positions in academia (University of California, Davis; Brown University; and Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore), I began working at the RD&E Center at Philip Morris USA in Richmond, Virginia in 1988 as a Research Scientist developing reduced risk products. I remained with the

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.