

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS, LTD.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2020-00897
U.S. Patent No. 10,324,277

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	APPLE AND ITS EXPERT IMPROPERLY USE THE ‘277 PATENT TO GUIDE ITS OBVIOUSNESS DETERMINATION.....	1
III.	GROUND 1 – APPLE FAIL’S TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIMS 1-3 AND 5-8 ARE UNPATENTABLE OVER OGINO EXAMPLE 4 IN VIEW OF BAREAU.....	4
A.	A POSITA Would Not Have Combined Ogino’s Example 4 and Bateau	4
B.	Dr. Sasian Does Not Use the Lens Design Process That a POSITA Would Have Used.....	5
C.	A POSITA Would Not Design Lenses that Effectively Touch	6
D.	A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Ogino Example 4 and Bateau	7
E.	Relative Illumination Is a Factor a POSITA Would Have Considered.....	9
IV.	GROUND 2 – APPLE FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIMS 1-24 ARE UNPATENTABLE OVER OGINO EXAMPLE 5 IN VIEW OF BAREAU.....	11
A.	Example 5 in view of Bateau (First Modification) Does Not Render Claims 11-17 Unpatentable	11
1.	A POSITA Would Not Design Lenses that Effectively Touch .	12
2.	A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Ogino Example 5 and Bateau	12

Case No. IPR2020-00897
U.S. Patent No. 10,324,277

3.	Dr. Sasian Used Different Starting Vignetting in Ogino Example 5 Based on the Patent Claims at Issue	14
B.	Example 5 in view of Bateau (Second Modification) Does Not Render Claims 1-10 and 18-24 Unpatentable	15
V.	CONCLUSION	17

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Bausch & Lomb, Inc. v. Barnes-Hind/Hydrocurve, Inc.,
796 F.2d 443 (Fed. Cir. 1986)..... 10

Cardiac Pacemakers, Inc. v. St. Jude Medical, Inc.,
381 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2004)..... 2

Eisai Co. Ltd. v. Dr. Reddy’s Labs., Ltd.,
533 F.3d 1353 (Fed. Cir. 2008)..... 6

Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City,
383 U.S. 1 (1966) 9

Grain Processing Corp. v. American Maize-Prods. Co.,
840 F.2d 902 (Fed. Cir. 1988)..... 3

In re Dow Chem. Co.,
837 F.2d 469 (Fed. Cir. 1988)..... 2

In re Lee,
277 F.3d 1338 (Fed. Cir. 2002)..... 2

In re Wesslau,
353 F.2d 238 (CCPA 1965)..... 10

W.L. Gore & Assocs. v. Garlock, Inc.,
721 F.2d 1540 (Fed. Cir. 1983)..... 2

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 112..... 8

35 U.S.C. § 316(e) 5

PATENT OWNER'S EXHIBIT LIST

<i>Exhibit No</i>	<i>Description</i>
2001	Declaration of Tom D. Milster, Ph.D.
2002	Curriculum Vitae of Tom D. Milster, Ph.D.
2003	Deposition transcript of José Sasián, February 19, 2021
2004	José Sasián, Introduction to Lens Design (2019)
2005	Declaration of José Sasián in IPR2020-00897
2006	McGuire Jr, J. P., & Kuper, T. G. (2012, October). Approaching direct optimization of as-built lens performance. In Novel Optical Systems Design and Optimization XV (Vol. 8487, p. 84870D). International Society for Optics and Photonics
2007	Sturlesi, D., & O'Shea, D. C. (1991). Global view of optical design space. <i>Optical engineering</i> , 30(2), 207-218
2008	Symmons and Schaub, <i>Field Guide to Molded Optics</i> (2016)
2009	Declaration of Tom Milster in IPR2020-00878
2010	Declaration of Marc A. Fenster in Support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice
2011	Declaration of James S. Tsuei in Support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice
(New) 2012	Deposition transcript of José Sasián, July 16, 2021

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.