UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS, LTD.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2020-00896
U.S. Patent No. 10,317,647

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. APPLE AND ITS EXPERT IMPROPERLY USE THE '647 PATENT TO GUIDE ITS OBVIOUSNESS DETERMINATION. 1

III. APPLE HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIMS 1 AND 4 ARE OBVIOUS OVER OGINO'S EXAMPLE 5 IN VIEW OF CHEN II 4

A. A POSITA Would Not Have Combined Ogino's Example 5 and Chen II 4

B. Dr. Sasian Does Not Use the Lens Design Process That a POSITA Would Have Used 6

C. A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Ogino Example 5 and Chen II 7

D. Dr. Sasian Used Different Starting Vignetting in Ogino Example 5 Based on the Patent Claims at Issue 9

IV. APPLE HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIMS 2, 3, 5, AND 8-11 ARE OBVIOUS OVER OGINO'S EXAMPLE 5 IN VIEW OF CHEN II AND BAREAU 10

A. Dr. Sasian Does Not Use the Lens Design Process That a POSITA Would Have Used 10

B. A POSITA Would Not Design Lenses that Touch 11

C. A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Ogino Example 5, Chen II, and Bareau 12

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

V. APPLE HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIM 6 IS OBVIOUS OVER OGINO'S EXAMPLE 5 IN VIEW OF CHEN II, BAREAU, AND KINGSLAKE 12

A. Dr. Sasian Does Not Use the Lens Design Process That a POSITA Would Have Used 12

B. A POSITA Would Not Design Lenses that Effectively Touch 12

C. A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Ogino Example 5, Chen II, Bareau, and Kingslake ... 13

D. Relative Illumination Is a Factor a POSITA Would Have Considered 13

VI. APPLE HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIM 7 IS OBVIOUS OVER HSIEH AND BEICH 16

A. A POSITA Would Have Considered Manufacturability When Combining Hsieh and Beich 16

B. Dr. Sasian Does Not Use the Lens Design Process That a POSITA Would Have Used 16

VII. APPLE HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT CLAIM 12 IS OBVIOUS OVER CHEN, IWASAKI, AND BEICH 17

A. Apple Did Not Address All the Limitations in Its Petition 17

VIII. CONCLUSION 19

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Bausch & Lomb, Inc. v. Barnes-Hind/Hydrocurve, Inc.,
796 F.2d 443 (Fed. Cir. 1986) 15

Cardiac Pacemakers, Inc. v. St. Jude Medical, Inc.,
381 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 3

Eisai Co. Ltd. v. Dr. Reddy's Labs., Ltd.,
533 F.3d 1353 (Fed. Cir. 2008) 6

Ericsson Inc, v. Intellectual Ventures I LLC,
901 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2018) 19

Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City,
383 U.S. 1 (1966) 14

Grain Processing Corp. v. American Maize-Prods. Co.,
840 F.2d 902 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 3

In re Dow Chem. Co.,
837 F.2d 469 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 2

In re Lee,
277 F.3d 1338 (Fed. Cir. 2002) 2, 10

In re Wesslau,
353 F.2d 238 (CCPA 1965) 15

W.L. Gore & Assocs. v. Garlock, Inc.,
721 F.2d 1540 (Fed. Cir. 1983) 2

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 112 8

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

35 U.S.C. § 316(e) 6, 10

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.