

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS LTD.,  
Patent Owner

---

**Declaration of José Sasián, PhD**  
**under 37 C.F.R. § 1.68**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	4
II.	QUALIFICATIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE .....	6
III.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	10
IV.	RELEVANT LEGAL STANDARDS .....	12
	A. Anticipation.....	12
	B. Obviousness .....	13
V.	OVERVIEW OF THE '277 PATENT .....	14
	A. Summary of the Patent.....	14
	B. Prosecution History of the '277 Patent.....	18
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	20
VII.	IDENTIFICATION OF HOW THE CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE....	21
	A. Claims 1-3 and 5-8 are obvious under AIA 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Ogino in view of Bareau .....	22
	1. Summary of Ogino – (Example 4).....	22
	2. Summary of Bareau.....	26
	3. Reasons to combine Ogino and Bareau – (I) .....	28
	4. Detailed Analysis .....	34
	B. Claims 1-24 are obvious under AIA 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Ogino in view of Bareau .....	61
	1. Summary of Ogino – (Example 5).....	61
	2. Reasons to combine Ogino and Bareau – (II).....	64
	3. Detailed Analysis .....	70
VIII.	CONCLUSION.....	111

IX.	APPENDIX.....	112
A.	Fig. 1: Ogino Example 4 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011).....	112
1.	Fig. 1A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	112
2.	Fig. 1B – Relative Illumination.....	113
3.	Fig. 1C – Analysis.....	114
B.	Ogino Example 4 modified for F#=2.8 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011)	115
1.	Fig. 2A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	115
2.	Fig. 2B – Relative Illumination.....	116
3.	Fig. 2C – Analysis.....	117
4.	Fig. 2D – Prescription Data.....	118
C.	Ogino Example 5 lens assembly using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011).....	119
1.	Fig. 3A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	119
2.	Fig. 3B – Relative Illumination.....	120
3.	Fig. 3C – Field Curvature.....	121
D.	Ogino Example 5 lens assembly first modification for F#=2.8 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011) .....	122
1.	Fig. 4A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	122
2.	Fig. 4B – Relative Illumination.....	123
3.	Fig. 4C – Analysis.....	124
4.	Fig. 4D – Prescription Data.....	125
E.	Ogino Example 5 lens assembly second modification for F#=2.8 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011) .....	126
1.	Fig. 5A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	126
2.	Fig. 5B – Relative Illumination.....	127

3.	Fig. 5C – Analysis.....	128
4.	Fig. 5D – Prescription Data.....	129

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. I am making this declaration at the request of Apple Inc. in the matter of the *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 10,324,277 (“the ’277 Patent”) to Dror, *et al.*

2. I am being compensated for my work in this matter at the rate of \$525/hour. I am also being reimbursed for reasonable and customary expenses associated with my work and testimony in this investigation. My compensation is not contingent on the outcome of this matter or the specifics of my testimony.

3. I have been asked to provide my opinions regarding whether claims 1-3, 6-8, 10-15, and 17-24 of the ’277 Patent are unpatentable because they would have been obvious to a person having ordinary skill in the art (“POSITA”) at the time of the alleged invention, in light of the prior art. After a careful analysis it is my opinion that all of the limitations of claims 1-3, 6-8, 10-15, and 17-24 would have been obvious to a POSITA.

4. In the preparation of this declaration, I have reviewed:

- The ’277 Patent, APPL-1001;
- The prosecution history of the ’277 Patent, APPL-1002;
- U.S. Patent No. 9,128,267 to Ogino et al. (“Ogino”), APPL-1005;
- Warren J. Smith, MODERN LENS DESIGN (1992) (“Smith”), APPL-1006;

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.