

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS LTD.,
Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 10,330,897

Declaration of José Sasián, Ph.D.
under 37 C.F.R. § 1.68

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	5
II.	QUALIFICATIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE	8
III.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	12
IV.	RELEVANT LEGAL STANDARDS	13
	A. Anticipation.....	14
	B. Obviousness	14
V.	OVERVIEW OF THE '897 PATENT	15
	A. Summary of the Patent.....	15
	B. Priority Date of the '897 Patent	19
	C. Prosecution History of the '897 Patent.....	20
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	21
VII.	IDENTIFICATION OF HOW THE CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE....	22
	A. Claims 1, 4, 9-15, 17, 20, and 25-29 are anticipated by Ogino.....	23
	1. Summary of Ogino.....	23
	2. Detailed Analysis	26
	B. Claims 2, 5, 6, 18, and 21-23 are obvious over the combination of Ogino and Bareau.	54
	1. Summary of Bareau.....	54
	2. Reasons to combine Ogino and Bareau	56
	3. Detailed Analysis	61
	C. Claims 3, 8, 19, and 24 are obvious over the combination of Ogino, Bareau, and Kingslake.....	67
	1. Summary of Kingslake.....	67

2.	Reasons to combine Ogino, Bareau, and Kingslake	67
3.	Detailed Analysis	72
D.	Claims 16 and 30 are obvious over the combination of Chen, Iwasaki, and Beich.	76
1.	Summary of Chen	76
2.	Summary of Iwasaki	77
3.	Reasons to combine Chen and Iwasaki.....	79
4.	Summary of Beich.....	80
5.	Reasons to combine Chen and Beich.....	82
6.	Detailed Analysis	85
VIII.	CONCLUSION.....	100
IX.	APPENDIX.....	101
A.	Ogino Example 5 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011)	101
1.	Fig. 1A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	101
2.	Fig. 1B – Relative Illumination.....	102
3.	Fig. 1C – Analysis.....	103
B.	Ogino Example 5 modified for F#=2.8 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011)	104
1.	Fig. 2A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	104
2.	Fig. 2B – Relative Illumination.....	105
3.	Fig. 2C – Analysis.....	106
4.	Fig. 2D – Prescription Data.....	107
C.	Ogino Example 5 modified for F#=2.45 using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011)	108
1.	Fig. 3A – Ray Trace Diagram.....	108

- 2. Fig. 3B – Relative Illumination.....109
- 3. Fig. 3C – Analysis.....110
- 4. Fig. 3D – Prescription Data.....111
- D. Chen Example 1 modified with 0.145 mm IR filter using Zemax (v. 02/14/2011).....112
 - 1. Fig. 4A – Ray Trace Diagram.....112
 - 2. Fig. 4B – Relative Illumination.....113
 - 3. Fig. 4C – Analysis.....114
 - 4. Fig. 4D – Prescription Data.....115
 - 5. Fig. 4E – Edge Data116

I. INTRODUCTION

1. I am making this declaration at the request of Apple Inc. in the matter of the *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 10,330,897 (“the ’897 Patent”) to Dror, *et al.*

2. I am being compensated for my work in this matter at the rate of \$525/hour. I am also being reimbursed for reasonable and customary expenses associated with my work and testimony in this investigation. My compensation is not contingent on the outcome of this matter or the specifics of my testimony.

3. I have been asked to provide my opinions regarding whether the claims of the ’897 Patent are unpatentable because they would have been either anticipated or obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art (“POSITA”) at the time of the alleged invention, in light of the prior art. After a careful analysis it is my opinion that all of the limitations of claims 1-6 and 8-30 would have been either anticipated or obvious to a POSITA.

4. In the preparation of this declaration, I have reviewed:

- The ’897 Patent, APPL-1001;
- The prosecution history of the ’897 Patent, APPL-1002;
- U.S. Patent No. 9,128,267 to Ogino et al. (“Ogino”), APPL-1005;
- Warren J. Smith, MODERN LENS DESIGN (1992) (“Smith”), APPL-1006;

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.