PUBLIC VERSION

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS, LTD.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2020-00861
U.S. Patent No. 10,230,898

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. OVERVIEW OF THE '898 PATENT 1

III. LEGAL STANDARDS 6

IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL 8

V. OVERVIEW OF THE ASSERTED PRIOR ART 9

A. Golan (APPL-1005) 9

B. Martin (APPL-1006) 15

C. Togo (APPL-1010) 16

D. Levey (APPL-1015) 16

E. Border (APPL-1009) 17

F. Parulski (APPL-1008) 17

VI. PATENTABILITY OF CHALLENGED CLAIMS 21

A. The Petition Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Golan and Martin 21

1. A POSITA Would Not Have Selected Martin to Combine with Golan, Which Are Fundamentally Dissimilar and Directed to Different Goals 23

2. The Petition Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Togo with Golan and Martin 31

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

B. Ground 1: The Petition fails to demonstrate that Claims 1, 4, 8, 12 and 15 are unpatentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Golan in view of Martin and Togo 35

C. Claim 4 41

D. Independent Claim 12 and Dependent Claims 15, 19 and 20. 42

E. Claim 15 43

F. Ground 2: The Petition fails to demonstrate that Claim 9 is unpatentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Golan in view of Martin, Togo and Levey 43

1. The Petition Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Levey with Golan, Martin and Togo 43

2. Claim 9 47

G. Ground 3: The Petition fails to demonstrate that Claims 11 and 19 are patentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Golan in view of Martin, Togo and Border 49

1. No Motivation to Combine Golan, Martin, Togo and Border.. 49

2. Claim 11 and 19 51

H. Ground 4: The Petition Fails to Demonstrate that Claims 10 and 20 are unpatentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Golan in view of Martin, Togo and Parulski 53

1. The Petition Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Parulski with Golan, Martin and Togo 53

2. Claim 20 54

I. Secondary Considerations/Objective Indicia of Non-Obviousness 56

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

1. Industry Praise / Licensing 58

2. Commercial Success 65

3. Failure of Others / Copying 66

VII. CONCLUSION 69

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

ActiveVideo Networks, Inc. v. Verizon Commc'ns, Inc.,
694 F.3d 1312 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 7

Adidas AG v. Nike, Inc.,
963 F.3d 1355 (Fed. Cir. 2020) 31

Apple Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.,
839 F.3d 1034 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 29

Ariosa Diagnostics v. Verinata Health, Inc.,
805 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 7

Harmonic Inc. v. Avid Tech., Inc.,
815 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir.2016) 7

Heidelberger Druckmaschinen AG v. Hantscho Commercial Products, Inc.,
21 F.3d 1068, 30 U.S.P.Q.2d 1377 (Fed. Cir. 1994) 67

In re Magnum Oil Tools Int'l, Ltd.,
829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 7

Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs,
512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008) 33

Lectronsonics, Inc. v. Zaxcom, Inc.,
IPR2018-01129 (Jan. 24, 2020) 58

Nichia Corp. v. Everlight Elecs. Co.,
No. 02:13-CV-702-JRG, 2016 WL 310142 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 25, 2016) 30

SAS Inst., Inc. v. Iancu,
138 S. Ct. 1348 (2018) 7

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.