

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

QUALCOMM INCORPORATED

Petitioner,

v.

REMBRANDT WIRELESS TECHNOLOGIES, LP

Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2020-00510  
U.S. Patent No. 8,023,580

---

DECLARATION OF DR. JOSE LUIS MELENDEZ IN SUPPORT OF  
PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE RELATED TO  
*INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF  
U.S. PATENT NO. 8,023,580

**Rembrandt Exhibit 2002  
Qualcomm v. Rembrandt  
IPR2020-00510**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS .....	2
III. MATERIALS REVIEWED .....	6
IV. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS .....	8
V. UNDERSTANDING OF APPLICABLE LEGAL STANDARDS.....	10
VI. TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND AND OVERVIEW OF THE '580 PATENT.....	13
A. Master/Slave Art Prior To The '580 Patent.....	13
B. The Claimed Inventions .....	17
1. Problems Identified By The '580 Patent .....	17
2. The '580 Patent's Solution To The Identified Problems.....	20
VII. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS .....	26
VIII. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	29
IX. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	30
A. "Modulation Method Is Of A Different Type" .....	31
B. "Master" And "Slave"/"Trib" .....	31
C. "Addressed For An Intended Destination" .....	36
X. OPINIONS REGARDING ASSERTED PRIOR ART.....	39
A. Petitioner Has Erroneously Analogized Trompower's Multiple Mobile Terminals To "Masters" And Trompower's Base Stations To "Slaves/Tribs".....	41
B. Petitioner Has Erroneously Asserted That Trompower's Registration Process Involves A Master/Slave Relationship .....	47
C. Trompower Would Not Have Suggested Including An Address Of A Base Station (Alleged Slaves/Tribs) Transceiver In An Information Packet.....	51
D. Trompower And The '580 Patent Use Addressing In Fundamentally Different Ways .....	61

E.	Ground 1 Based On Trompower .....	64
1.	Trompower Would Not Have Suggested The Claimed “Master” Or “Slave/Trib” Limitations .....	65
2.	Trompower Would Not Have Suggested The Claimed “Addressed For An Intended Destination” Limitation.....	67
3.	Trompower Would Not Have Suggested The “Third Sequence Reversion Limitation” .....	72
F.	Ground 2 Based On Trompower And Tymes .....	74
G.	Ground 3 Based On Trompower And Malkamaki.....	77
H.	Ground 4 Based on Trompower, Tymes And Malkamaki .....	81
XI.	CONCLUSION .....	82

I, Dr. Jose Luis Melendez, declare as follows:

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

1. I have been retained by Rembrandt Wireless Technologies, LP (“Patent Owner”) in Case IPR2020-00510 as a technical expert.
2. I have been asked to study and provide my opinions concerning U.S. Patent No. 8,023,580 (“the ’580 Patent”) and the arguments and exhibits in the Petition For *Inter Partes* Review of the ’580 Patent filed in Case IPR2020-00510 concerning the patentability of Claims 2 and 59 of the ’580 Patent (“Challenged Claims”).
3. I have also been asked to provide my opinions concerning the state of the relevant art prior to December 5, 1997, and the level and knowledge of one having ordinary skill in the art in the December 1997 time frame.
4. My opinions and views set forth in this declaration are based on my education, training, and experience in the field of imaging, computing, and communications technologies, as well as the materials I reviewed in this case. In this declaration, I will address certain aspects of the petition along with its relevant exhibits that I believe will be of particular benefit to the Patent Trial and Appeal Board (“PTAB”) in evaluating the Petition, in light of the record and totality of stakeholder arguments, in coming to its decisions regarding the ’580 Patent.

## II. BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS

5. I am a professor of Computer Science and Engineering, and also Special Assistant to the Chancellor, at the University of Puerto Rico at Mayaguez, Puerto Rico, where I reside. My responsibilities include developing and teaching specialized courses and seminars, serving on graduate committees including PhD programs, defining and conducting research including students related generally to Computer Science and Engineering, and supporting university relationships with industry.

6. I hold a Doctor of Philosophy in Electrical Engineering from Stanford University (awarded January 6, 1994) with a Grade Point Average of 4.0/4.0. I have a Bachelor of Science in Electrical Engineering from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (awarded June 4, 1990) and graduated with a Grade Point Average of 5.0/5.0. I also obtained a Master of Science in Electrical Engineering and Computer Science from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (awarded February 20, 1991) with a Grade Point Average of 4.8/5.0.

7. My doctoral thesis involved the definition, solution and validation of a stiffly coupled differential equation model for the formation of high performance imaging systems. In performance of my doctoral thesis I developed novel algorithms for the solution of the complex equations and implemented those algorithms in computer code. I verified the models and algorithms through

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.