

**CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY**

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
MARSHALL DIVISION**

OPTIS WIRELESS TECHNOLOGY, LLC,  
OPTIS CELLULAR TECHNOLOGY, LLC,  
UNWIRED PLANET, LLC, UNWIRED  
PLANET INTERNATIONAL LIMITED,  
AND PANOPTIS PATENT  
MANAGEMENT, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 2:19-CV-00066-JRG

Jury Trial Demanded

**APPENDIX 2: EXPERT REPORT OF DR. JONATHAN WELLS, PH.D. REGARDING  
INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NO. 8,102,833**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
A. Identification of the '833 Patent and Scope of Opinion .....	1
B. Documents and Other Materials Relied Upon .....	2
II. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	2
III. BACKGROUND OF THE TECHNOLOGY .....	3
A. Radio communications.....	3
B. Error Correction Coding .....	6
C. Modulation.....	7
D. Long Term Evolution.....	8
1. OFDM & SC-FDMA .....	9
2. LTE Uplink Signal Processing.....	13
3. Reference Signals.....	17
E. Signal Processing Functionality.....	19
1. Interleaving .....	19
2. Padding, Puncturing, and Overwriting.....	20
IV. SUMMARY OF THE 3GPP SPECIFICATIONS .....	21
A. 3GPP TS 36.201 v2.0.0 (Sept. 2007).....	21
B. 3GPP TS 36.211 v2.0.0 (Sept. 2007).....	22
C. 3GPP TS 36.212 v2.0.0 (Sept. 2007).....	29
D. 3GPP TS 36.213 v2.1.0 (Sept. 2007).....	35
E. 3GPP TS 36.300 v8.1.0 (July 2007) .....	36
V. OVERVIEW OF THE '833 PATENT.....	39
A. Date of Invention for the '833 Patent .....	39
B. Disclosure of the '833 Patent.....	40
C. The Alleged Problem .....	46
D. The Proposed Solution of the '833 Patent .....	47
1. Arrangement of Signals .....	47
2. Arrangement Steps.....	50
E. Prosecution History.....	52
F. Claim Construction .....	54
VI. OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART.....	55

**CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY**

A.	R1-075037 by Qualcomm (Ex. 1006).....	55
B.	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2006/0262871 to Cho (Ex. 1005) .....	60
C.	R1-073094 by Samsung (Ex. 1008).....	61
D.	R1-073269 by Qualcomm (Ex. 1007).....	62
E.	R1-073926 by Qualcomm (Ex. 1066).....	62
F.	U.S. Patent No. 8,374,161 to Malladi (Ex. 1068).....	63
G.	U.S. Patent No. 8,467,367 to Malladi (Ex. 1067).....	65
H.	The Inventors of the '833 Patent Attended the 3GPP Meetings.....	82
VII.	SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS.....	83
VIII.	INVALIDITY BASED ON PRIOR ART.....	84
A.	Claims 1 and 8 are Obvious over Qualcomm-037 in view of Cho, Samsung-094, and Qualcomm-269.....	84
1.	Claim 1.....	84
2.	Claim 8.....	111
B.	Claims 1 and 8 are Obvious over Qualcomm-037 in view of Cho, Samsung-094, and Qualcomm-926.....	113
1.	Claim 1.....	113
2.	Claim 8.....	140
C.	Claims 1 and 8 are Obvious over Qualcomm-037 in view of Malladi '161, Samsung-094, and Malladi '367.....	142
1.	Claim 1.....	142
2.	Claim 8.....	171
IX.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....	173
A.	Commercial Success.....	174
B.	Long-Felt But Unsolved Need.....	178
C.	Failure of Others.....	181
D.	Copying by Others.....	184
E.	Unexpected Results.....	188
F.	Industry Praise.....	191
G.	Lack of Independent Simultaneous Invention by Others.....	195
H.	Teaching Away.....	197
I.	Skepticism in the Industry.....	199
J.	Licensing by Others.....	201
1.	██████████ License.....	204

..

**CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY**

2.	[REDACTED] License.....	204
3.	[REDACTED] License .....	205
4.	[REDACTED] License .....	205
5.	[REDACTED] License.....	206
6.	[REDACTED] License .....	206
7.	[REDACTED] License .....	207
8.	[REDACTED] License.....	207
9.	[REDACTED] License.....	208
X.	ACCEPTABLE NON-INFRINGEMENT ALTERNATIVES .....	208
XI.	REVISION OR SUPPLEMENTATION .....	218
XII.	DEMONSTRATIVE EXHIBITS .....	218

...

**CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

**A. Identification of the '833 Patent and Scope of Opinion**

1. My name is Dr. Jonathan Wells. I have been retained by Apple Inc. ("Apple") to investigate and opine on certain issues relating to U.S. Patent No. 8,102,833 ("833 patent").

2. I understand that Optis Wireless Technology, LLC, Optis Cellular Technology, LLC, Unwired Planet, LLC, Unwired Planet International Limited, and PanOptis Patent Management, LLC (collectively, "Optis" or "Plaintiffs") has asserted the '833 patent in litigation against Apple in *Optis Wireless Technology, LLC et al. v. Apple Inc.*, Case No. 2:19-cv-00066-JRG (E.D. Tex.) ("the Litigation"). In the Litigation, Optis has asserted claims 1 and 8 of the '833 patent ("the Asserted Claims").

3. Specifically, I have been asked to determine if any or all of the claims of the '833 patent are invalid based on, among other things, 35 U.S.C. §§ 103 and 112. In this report, I explain the manner in which the prior art, known before the applicable priority date of the '833 patent, discloses each limitation of the Asserted Claims, and I explain how the known prior art would render the asserted claims obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art at the time the inventions were made.

4. To support my opinions, I have further been asked to provide an overview of the technology. In this report, I will discuss the technology related to the '833 patent, including an overview of that technology as it was known at the time of the '833 patent's priority date.

5. I have based my report on information currently available to me. To the extent that additional information becomes available, I reserve the right to continue my investigation and study, which may include a review of documents and information that recently have been or may be produced, as well as testimony from depositions that may yet be taken in this case. I

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.