

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MAXELL, LTD.,
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2020-00200

U.S. Patent No. 10,084,991

**PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY IN *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 10,084,991**

Mail Stop **Patent Board**
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	3
II. APPLE FAILS TO SHOW THAT ASMUSSEN ALONE OR COMBINED WITH BEAR AND LINDSTROM RENDERS OBVIOUS THE CLAIMED “NETWORK INTERFACE”	4
A. Asmussen Alone Does Not Disclose a “Network Interface”	4
B. Apple Failed to Provide Any Motivation to Combine Asmussen, Bear, and Lindstrom.	9
III. ASMUSSEN ALONE OR IN COMBINATION WITH BEAR DOES NOT TEACH CLAIM 1(E)’S “RENDERING THE CAMERA OPERATIVE” LIMITATION.....	11
A. Asmussen Alone Does Not Teach Claim 1(e)	11
B. Asmussen in Combination With Bear Does Not Teach Claim 1(e).....	17
IV. MARLEY’S TEACHINGS	23
A. Apple’s Arguments Regarding Claim 1(c) Are Moot.....	23
B. Apple’s Arguments Regarding Claim 5 Are Unpersuasive.	23
V. CONCLUSION.....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Artic Cat Inc. v. Polaris Indus.</i> , 795 Fed. Appx. 827 (Fed. Cir. 2019).....	10
<i>Grain Processing Corp. v. American-Maize Prods. Co.</i> , 840 F.2d 902 (Fed. Cir. 1988)).....	21, 23
<i>In re NTP</i> , 654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	20, 21, 23
<i>InTouch Techs., Inc. v. VGo Communs., Inc.</i> , 751 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	10
<i>Koninklijke Philips N.V. v. Google LLC</i> , 948 F.3d 1330 (Fed. Cir. 2020)	9
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	20, 21, 23
<i>Polaris Indus. v. Artic Cat, Inc.</i> , 882 F.3d 1056 (2018).....	20, 21, 23
<i>Sirona Dental SystemsGMBH v. Institut Straumann AG</i> , 892 F.3d 1349 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	9

Case IPR2020-00200
 Patent No. 10,084,991
 Patent Owner's Sur-Reply

PATENT UPDATED OWNER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Description	Exhibit #
October 9, 2018 Notice Letter from Maxell to Apple	2001
March 16, 2020 Scheduling Order	2002
May 31, 2019 Scheduling Order	2003
Docket From District Court Action	2004
January 8, 2020 Minute Order	2005
March 18, 2020 Markman Order	2006
August 28, 2019 Minute Order	2007
September 17, 2019 Minute Order	2008
Maxell's Disclosure of Asserted Claims and Infringement Contentions	2009
Maxell's Final Election of Asserted Claims	2010
Apple's Final Election of Prior Art	2011
Apple's Invalidity Contentions	2012
Asmussen Chart from District Court Action	2013
March 6, 2017 Scheduling Order from Maxell v. ZTE	2014
March 19, 2018 Scheduling Order from Maxell v. ZTE	2015
Docket from District Court Action	2016
Standing Order re COVID-19	2017
April 20, 2020 Scheduling Order from District Court Action	2018
Declaration of Tiffany A. Miller	2019
Transcript of September 28, 2020 Deposition of Dr. Lippman	2020
Declaration of Dr. Maja Bystrom	2021
U.S. Patent No. 7,864,051	2022
Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Maja Bystrom	2023
Zoom Help Center – Group HD Follow https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/207347086-Group-HD (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2024
Skype for Business client video resolutions https://docs.microsoft.com/en-us/skypeforbusiness/plan-your-	2025

Case IPR2020-00200
Patent No. 10,084,991
Patent Owner's Sur-Reply

<u>deployment/clients-and-devices/video-resolutions</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	
VisionTek GeForce 256 DDR graphics card - GF 256 - 32 MB Specs <u>https://www.cnet.com/products/vionitek-geforce-256-ddr-graphics-card-gf-256-32-mb/</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2026
CNET Oct. 10, 2002 review of the Ezonic EZCam <u>https://www.cnet.com/reviews/ezonics-ezcam-review/</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2027
CNET Oct. 10, 2002 review of the Creative WebCam Go <u>https://www.cnet.com/reviews/creative-webcam-go-review/</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2028
CNET January 16, 2003 review of the Veo Connect <u>https://www.cnet.com/reviews/veo-connect-review/</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2029
CNET Oct. 10, 2002 review of the Philips ToUcam XS <u>https://www.cnet.com/reviews/philips-toucam-xs-review/</u> (last accessed, February 4, 2021)	2030
User-Centered Design Process Map, <u>https://www.usability.gov/how-to-and-tools/resources/ucd-map.html</u> (last accessed, February 6, 2021)	2031

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.