

Filed: February 21, 2020

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LG ELECTRONICS, INC.,

PETITIONER,

V.

BELL NORTHERN RESEARCH, LLC,

PATENT OWNER.

Case No. IPR2020-00108

U.S. Patent No. 8,416,862

**PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE
UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 313 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	OVERVIEW OF THE '862 PATENT	3
A.	Development of the Claimed Inventions.....	3
B.	Description of the '862 Patent's Inventions.....	4
C.	Challenged Claims of the '862 Patent.....	7
III.	PROSECUTION HISTORY OF THE '862 PATENT	8
IV.	PROSECUTION HISTORY OF THE PARENT '583 PATENT.....	10
V.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL.....	12
VI.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	12
A.	“Beamforming”	12
B.	“A baseband processing module operable to . . .”	13
C.	“Decompose the estimated transmitter beamforming unitary matrix (V) to produce the transmitter beamforming information”	13
1.	The Provisional Application Supports Patent Owner's Construction	17
2.	Patent Owner's Construction Conforms with the Understanding of a POSITA.....	20
3.	Patent Owner's Construction Should be Adopted Because Petitioner Failed to Proffer a Construction.....	22
VII.	STANDARD FOR GRANTING <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW.....	23
VIII.	INSTITUTION SHOULD BE DENIED BECAUSE THE DISTRICT COURT LITIGATION IS IN ADVANCED STAGES.....	24
IX.	<i>MAO</i> IS NOT ANALAGOUS ART TO THE '862 PATENT.....	28

X.	PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE A MOTIVATION OR EXPLAIN HOW TO COMBINE THE ASSERTED REFERENCES.....	31
A.	Petitioner’s Motivation to Combine Arguments are Rote and Conclusory .	33
B.	Petitioner Does Not Show Why or How A POSITA Would Have Made the Combinations Asserted In Grounds 1-2.	35
1.	Ground 1: <i>Li-748</i> and <i>Tong</i> and <i>Mao</i>	36
2.	Ground 2: <i>Li-748</i> and <i>Tong</i> and <i>Mao</i>	40
XI.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW THAT GROUNDS 3-5 MEET THE “DECOMPOSE...” LIMITATION	41
XII.	STRONG EVIDENCE OF SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS PRECLUDES A FINDING OF OBVIOUSNESS	46
A.	Widespread Industry Adoption Supports Non-obviousness	46
B.	Multiple Companies Have Recently Licensed the ’862 Patent.....	65
XIII.	CONCLUSION	65

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Align Tech., Inc. v. ClearCorrect Operating, LLC</i> , 745 F. App'x 361 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	32
<i>AMS AG et al. v. 511 Innovations, Inc.</i> , IPR2016-01792, Paper 15 (PTAB March 16, 2017)	22
<i>Apple Inc. v. Luxembourg S.A.</i> , IPR2017-02041, Paper 10 (PTAB Mar. 8, 2018)	36
<i>Arkie Lures, Inc. V. Advanced Semiconductor Materials Am., Inc.</i> , 98 F.3d 1563 (Fed. Cir. 1997).....	65
<i>Ashland Oil, Inc. v. Delta Resins & Refractories, Inc.</i> , 776 F.2d 281 (Fed. Cir. 1985).....	34
<i>Ebay Inc. v. IDT Corp.</i> , No. 08-CV-4015, 2009 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 75475 (W.D. Ark. Aug. 24, 2009).....	10
<i>Endo Pharm. Inc. v. Actavis LLC</i> , No. 2018-1054, 2019 U.S. App. LEXIS 13348 (Fed. Cir. May 3, 2019).....	39
<i>E-One, Inc. v. Oshkosh Corp.</i> , IPR2019-00161, Paper 16 (PTAB May 15, 2019).....	27
<i>General Plastic Industrial Co., Ltd., v. Canon Kabushiki Kaisha</i> , IPR2016-01357, Paper 19 (PTAB Sept. 6, 2017)	28
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co.</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966)	23
<i>Henny Penny Corp. v. Frymaster LLC</i> , 938 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2019).....	16
<i>Huawei Device Co., Ltd. v. Maxell, Ltd.</i> , IPR2018-00246, Paper 8 (PTAB June 29, 2019).....	33

<i>Hyundai Motor Company v. Blitzsafe Texas, LLC</i> , IPR2016-01476, Paper 12 (PTAB Jan. 24, 2017).....	35
<i>In Custom Accessories, Inc. v. Jeffrey-Allan Indus., Inc.</i> , 807 F.2d 955 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	63
<i>In re Bigio</i> , 381 F.3d 1320 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	29
<i>In re Broadcom Ltd. v. Invensas Corp.</i> , IPR2017-00424, Paper 7 (PTAB Jul. 3, 2017)	35
<i>In re Clay</i> , 966 F.2d 656 (Fed. Cir. 1992).....	30
<i>In re Magnum Oil Tools Int’l, Ltd.</i> , 829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	31
<i>In re NuVasive, Inc.</i> , 842 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	32
<i>In re Oetiker</i> , 977 F.2d 1443 (Fed. Cir. 1992).....	30
<i>In re Warsaw Orthopedic, Inc.</i> , 832 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	37
<i>Initiative for Medicines, Access & Knowledge</i> , IPR2018-00390, Paper 7 (PTAB Jul 29, 2018)	34
<i>Innogenics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs.</i> , 512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008).....	39
<i>Innovention Toys, LLC v. MGA Entm't, Inc.</i> , 637 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	30
<i>ipDataTel, LLC v. ICN Acquisition, LLC</i> , IPR2018-01822, Paper 19 (PTAB Apr. 22, 2019).....	31
<i>Johns Manville Corp. v. Knauf Insulation, Inc.</i> , IPR2018-00827, Paper 9 (PTAB Oct. 16, 2018)	29

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.