UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PROLLENIUM US INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ALLERGAN INDUSTRIE, SAS,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-00084
U.S. Patent 9,089,519

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY TO PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1
II. PETITIONER BELABORS IRRELEVANT POINTS THAT FAIL TO ADDRESS ITS OVERSIMPLIFIED VIEW OF THE ART 2
A. Petitioner's "New" Versus "Modified" Dichotomy Is Irrelevant 2
B. What The POSA "Could" Do Is Insufficient 3
C. "Routine Testing" Is Insufficient 4
D. Petitioner Fails To Rehabilitate Dr. DeVore's Admissions 5
III. DR. PRESTWICH DOES NOT REHABILITATE THE PETITION 6
IV. POSA DEFINITION 9
V. CLAIMS 1-8 WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN OBVIOUS OVER LEBRETON IN VIEW OF SADOZAI (GROUND 4) OR P050047 IN VIEW OF KINNEY (GROUND 5) 10
A. Petitioner Failed To Establish Prior Art 10
B. The POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated To Combine Lebreton And Sadozai Or P050047 And Kinney 10
C. No Reasonable Expectation of Success For Lebreton And Sadozai 13
1. Petitioner's Rheology Arguments Are Unsupported 13
2. Petitioner's Acidic-Degradation Arguments Are Unsupported 15
D. Petitioner Fails To Establish A Reasonable Expectation Of Success Combining P050047 And Kinney 17
E. The Art Was Unpredictable 18
F. The Petition Fails On Specific Limitations 20
VI. CLAIMS 1-4 ARE NOT ANTICIPATED (GROUNDS 1-3) 23
VII. CONCLUSION 24

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Exhibit Description
2001	Juvéderm Ultra™ XC Label
2002	Juvéderm Ultra Plus™ XC Label
2003	Juvéderm Voluma® XC Label
2004	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2004/0101959 to Marko et al, published May 27, 2004
2005	Excerpts from U.S. 8,822,676 file history
2006	Excerpts from U.S. 9,089,519 file history
2007	About Juvéderm Ultra Plus™ XC
2008	About Juvéderm Volbella® XC
2009	About Juvéderm Voluma® XC
2010	Reserved
2011	Declaration in support of unopposed motion for *pro hac vice* admission of Elizabeth Flanagan
2012	Updated Declaration in support of unopposed motion for *pro hac vice* admission of Elizabeth Flanagan
2013	Declaration of Cory J. Berkland, Ph.D
2014	Curriculum Vitae, Cory J. Berkland, Ph.D.
2015	Kuo, Practical Aspects of Hyaluronan Based Medical Products, Chs. 1-6, 2006. ("Kuo")
2016	Hascall and Laurent, *Hyaluronan: Structure and Physical Properties*, Hyaluronan Today, Vol. 1, 1997, https://www.glycoforum.gr.jp/article/01A2.html. ("Hascall")
2017	Cleland, et al., *Polyelectrolyte Properties of Sodium Hyaluronate. 2. Potentiometric Titration of Hyalyuronic Acid*, Macromolecules Vol. 15, 1982; 386-395. ("Cleland")

Exhibit No.	Exhibit Description
2018	Knill, et al., *Effect of Metal Ions on the Rheological Flow Profiles of Hyaluronate Solutions*, Kennedy Ch. 21, Hyaluronan, 2002; 175-180. ("Knill")
2019	Kablik, et al., *Comparative Physical Properties of Hyaluronic Acid Dermal Fillers*, Dermatologic Surgery, Vol. 35, 2009; 302-312. ("Kablik")
2020	Reserved
2021	Lapcik, et al., *Hyaluronan: Preparation, Structure, Properties, and Applications*, Chemical Reviews, Vol. 98, No. 8, 1998; 2664-2684. ("Lapcik")
2022	Kubota and Shimoda, *Macromolecular Complexes of Chitosan*, Dumitriu Ch. 29, Polysaccharides Structural Diversity and Functional Versatility, 2nd Ed., 2005; 679-706. ("Kubota")
2023	Matsumoto, et al., *Reducing the Discomfort of Lidocaine Administration through pH Buffering*, Journal of Vascular and Interventional Radiology, Vol. 5, No. 1, 1994; 171-175. ("Matsumoto")
2024	International Publication No. WO 2005/112888 (Wang).
2025	Reserved
2026	Bajpai and Giri, *Swelling Dynamics of A Macromolecular Hydrophilic Network and Evaluation of Its Potential For Controlled Release of Agrochemicals*, Reactive & Functional Polymers, Vol. 53, 2002; 125-141. ("Bajpai")
2027	Ghosh, et al., *Rheological Characterization of in Situ Cross-Linkable Hyaluronan Hydrogels*, Biomacromolecules, Vol. 6, 2005; 2857-2865. ("Ghosh")
2028	Leach and Schmidt, *Hyaluronan*; Encyclopedia of Biomaterials and Biomedical Engineering, 2004; 779-789. ("Leach")

Exhibit No.	Exhibit Description
2029	Wik, *Rheology of Hyaluronan Products*, Kennedy Ch. 24, Hyaluronan, 2002; 201-204. ("Wik")
2030	Scott and Heatley, *Biological Properties of Hyaluronan are Controlled and Sequestered by Tertiary Structures*, Kennedy Ch. 15, Hyaluronan, 2002; 117-122. ("Scott")
2031	Mo, et al., *Effects of Sodium Chloride, Guanidine Hydrochloride, and Sucrose on the Viscoelastic Properties of Sodium Hyaluronate Solutions*, Biopolymers, Vol. 50, 1999; 23-34. ("Mo")
2032	Lefebvre and Doublier, *Rheological Behavior of Polysaccharides Aqueous Systems*, Dumitriu Ch. 13, Polysaccharides Structural Diversity and Functional Versatility, 2nd Ed., 2005; 357-394. ("Lefebvre")
2033	Hoefling, et al., *Rheological Creep Experiments Utilizing Mixtures of 1% Hylan A Solution and 0.5% Hylan B Gel Slurry*, Kennedy Ch. 23, Hyaluronan, 2002; 195-200. ("Hoefling")
2034	Forbes, et al., Bailey & Scott's Diagnostic Microbiology, 10th Ed., 1998; 1-6. ("Bailey")
2035	Ege, Organic Chemistry Structure and Reactivity, 3rd Ed., 1994; 530. ("Ege")
2036	Inoue and Nagasawa, *Preparation, by Chemical Degradation of Hyaluronic Acid, of a Series of Even- and Odd-Numbered Oligosaccharides Having A 2-Acetamido-2-Deoxy-D-Glucose and A D-Glucuronic Acid Residue, Respectively, at the Reducing End*, Carbohydrate Research, Vol. 141, 1985; 99-110. ("Inoue")
2037	Tokita and Okamoto, *Degradation of Hyaluronic Acid-Kinetic Study and Thermodynamics*, European Polymer Journal, Vol. 32, No. 8, 1996; 1011-1014. ("Tokita 1996")
2038	Tokita and Okamoto, *Hydrolytic Degradation of Hyaluronic Acid*, Polymer Degradation and Stability, Vol. 48, 1995; 269-273. ("Tokita 1995")

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.